A semiotic analysis of texts relevant to childhood bereavement

Stephen Bailey

School of Nursing, Midwifery and Social Work
University of Salford, Salford, UK

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements of the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

April 2013

Contents

Figures

Note on the format of headings

The thesis is divided into chapters, sections and subsections.

Chapter headings are indicated by bold and underlined text.

For example, **<u>Chapter 1: Introduction</u>**.

Section headings are indicated by bold text in block capitals.

For example, **ATTACHMENT THEORY**.

Subsection headings are indicated by bold text, in numbered order.

For example, **1) Internal working models**.

Further subsection headings are presented in underlined text which is not emboldened and not in numbered order.

For example, <u>Dialogue</u>.

Abstract

Studies of childhood bereavement suggest that communication is a crucial issue for adults and for children (Silverman and Worden, 1993). Closed communication seems to be a 'natural' adult response and this seems to be shared by some professionals. This study was designed to explore aspects of communication between adults and children experiencing loss or impending loss.

The study consisted of five investigations:

1) An analysis of narratives obtained in interviews with 4 adults bereaved in childhood;

2) An exploration of 8 narratives illustrating the theme of children's grief in literature;

3) An exploration of communication strategies used by 6 counsellors working with bereaved children;

4) An exploration of 6 counsellors' communication strategies obtained by interviews with counsellors and volunteers and

5) An evaluation of a support programme using qualitative data from brief interviews with 24 participating children, attending 2 distinct, age appropriate, groups.

A semiotic analysis of texts culled from the investigations was carried out. In Investigations 1 and 2, it was established that silence functioned as a sign whilst, unsurprisingly, the investigations in which counsellors' communication was analysed (3 and 4) showed that empathy and dialogue were central. The specific question addressed in the first investigation was whether closed communication had operated in the lives of bereaved children who are now adults and, in the second, whether this is found across generations and cultures. The findings in both cases gave an affirmative answer.

The evaluation of group support for 24 children suggested that the programme had been helpful in resolving shorter term effects of loss and lends some support to the notion of 'Continuing Bonds'.

The research question formulated for the study was: What psychological tools, including signs, operate in adult-child communication in this context. The main finding was that both open and closed styles of communication are employed.

Introduction

The researcher and colleagues involved as volunteer or professional members of a child bereavement service have often been asked about how to communicate with bereaved children and children facing the imminent death of someone close to them. At times, they have been asked whether it is wise to communicate at all with children experiencing such events and circumstances. The questions have come from parents, other family members and friends, other professionals and, in the researcher's experience as a team member who is also involved in the education and training of health and social care professionals, from students preparing for a role as a qualified practitioner.

To those presented with such questions, the answers may, in many cases, appear obvious, proceeding from each person's own set of values and beliefs about what is good for children and for their healthy development. It could be argued that if the 'obvious' answers were recognised universally, established in scientific evidence, then there would be no need for the questions to be posed.

In recent years, booklets and leaflets have been available which practitioners can hand out to questioners and many have found these very helpful indeed (Ward, 1995 and 1996; Crossley and Stokes, 2001). For researchers, scholars, health and social care practitioners and educators, however, there still will remain the question of what it is that underpins the advice passed on and whether that underpinning is supported by research which provides indicators for practice.

This is the experiential background which prompted the undertaking of this thesis. The researcher's general interests were already engaged by bereavement, child development and

communication but his attention became increasingly focussed upon the questions of: a) what the indicators for practice might be and where they come from; b) what sort of communication actually happens between adults and bereaved children and c) what sort of communication may be most helpful to such children. As already suggested, above, each person presented with questions about communication with bereaved children will probably have their own 'obvious' answers to the questions but the researcher, whilst entertaining his own suspicions about these issues, decided that the best course of action was to discover what the existing evidence might be and, if necessary, to explore by means of research, the communication styles employed by adults in their interactions with children experiencing or facing loss. The researcher's suspicions were that, from the adult point of view, the communication would be either controlling or facilitative since both Light (1979) and Raphael–Leff (1991) show the existence of two general approaches to parenting, one in which the prevailing tendency is to control and the other in which the prevailing tendency is to facilitate and that from the child side of the interaction the principal issue would be whether or not children were given a voice (Worden, 2001).

Since the questions were about the nature or character of the communication in the context of child bereavement, it was concluded that any investigation would involve looking at the semiotics of the interactions between children and adults. The researcher's use of the terms 'semiotic' and 'semiology' is discussed more fully, below, but it seems important to clarify, at the outset, that whilst using the term 'semiotic' in its general sense of concerning the use of signs and the terms 'semiology' and 'semiotics' in the general sense of the study of signs, the thesis is based, methodologically and epistemologically, on the conception of semiotic analysis and semiotic mediation found in the theoretical work of Vygotsky[1] (1934, 1978). According to Vygotsky, signs are a type of psychological tool and whilst the term 'tool' is

used generally in his work to denote communication which affects others, the term 'sign' is employed most often to describe the internalisation of understanding gained in social interaction (1978). This distinction between tools and signs, therefore, can be seen as offering quite a different view of semiotics than those propounded by Saussure[2] (1974), Peirce (1931) Eco (1976) and Barthes (1972) to name just a few of the most well known semiotic theorists.

The questions which then arose from this process of planning to investigate the phenomenon of adult-child communication in the context of child bereavement were: a) whether this conceptualisation would apply to child bereavement scenarios and b) how it might be operationalised. It seemed obvious that the answer to the first question would become apparent by attempting to carry out the research but the answer to the second question was not quite so straightforward. Various 'methods' have been suggested by semioticians including some of those listed, above, but the majority of these strategies were rejected for reasons discussed more fully in Chapter 4, below. Whilst some aspects of the suggestions for conducting semiotic analysis found in the literature were seen to be helpful, the researcher believed that it was necessary to have some kind of framework available which could be used as a means of analysing texts selected for the investigation.

Magariños (2008) argues that semiotic analysis requires researchers to employ what he calls 'operations' rather than what he refers to as 'models'. He explains this distinction as the difference between a 'model' as an expression of theory and an 'operation' as a framework for determining possibilities arising from its application. This was the need felt by the researcher in the process of planning the study since the texts to be explored would require the implementation of some concrete means of investigation in order to discover their meaning as samples of social communication. Bertens (2008) comments, in his account of the search for a

universal grammar of narrative, that "Most of the models that have been proposed are far too abstract to be of much use" (page 53) and this, it must be admitted, may often be the feeling of those reading some suggested approaches to semiotic analysis.

Whilst engaged in searching for an appropriate 'operation' to use as a means for investigating this question, the researcher revisited the work of Freire[3] (1972), amongst others, and his ideas about communication and methods of discovering meaning through dialogue resonated as potentially helpful concepts not only for reflecting on the issues relevant to questions from adults but also for deciding how to investigate the postulated semiotic mediation. On the basis of this resonance, the researcher decided to utilise the concepts from Freire, in an adapted form, as a framework for the analysis of the texts selected as samples of adult-child communication in the context of children's bereavement.

The work of Freire seemed pertinent both because the programmes that he and his team conducted are about communication (albeit in the context of education) and also because the ethnographic methodology used by Freire and his colleagues can be seen as a type of semiotic analysis. The ethnographic methods were used to identify the meanings and the codes, in short, the signifiers and signifieds (Saussure, 1974) located in the culture of the communities where literacy programmes were organised.

With a focus upon communication, therefore, this thesis consists of a semiotic[1] analysis of texts relevant to childhood bereavement. The texts analysed were identified in the course of conducting five investigations which together make up the study. These are:

1. An analysis of narratives obtained in interviews with adults who were bereaved as children;

2. An exploration, via narrative analysis, of the theme of the orphan in literature;

3. An exploration via observation of communication strategies used by counsellors with bereaved children and

4. An exploration by means of interviews of communication strategies used by counsellors with bereaved children.

5. An analysis of evaluative comments made by bereaved children participating in a support programme.

Magariños (2008) argues in his exposition of Saussure (1974), Peirce (1931) and Foucault (1972) that research using semiotic analysis should supply a research question or hypothesis as other, more traditional, approaches do, even though a hypothesis may not be stated in the same terms as those framed for quantitative studies such as, for example, those which articulate expectations of statistically significant differences. From a practical point of view, this seemed a wise course of action since it would be likely to provide a clear perspective and reference point for the chapters which follow.

The research question formulated can be stated as:

What psychological tools, including signs, operate in adult-child communication in the context of childhood bereavement?

The working hypothesis can be stated as:

The psychological tools, including signs, which operate in adult-child communication in the context of childhood bereavement reflect both open and closed communication styles.

It seems convenient, in this introductory overview, to provide not only a working hypothesis but also some working definitions of important terms used in the thesis. Each of the terms included here are discussed more fully in the relevant sections of subsequent chapters of the thesis.

To avoid cumbersome repetition, the term 'child bereavement' is used throughout this thesis to describe not only the actual loss of a significant other person in a child's life but also the

imminent, expected, loss of such a person. Hence, some children included in the groups run by the support service belonged to families in which a significant person had been given a diagnosis of an incurable disease and a poor prognosis. The term, in this way, includes children in both pre-bereavement and post bereavement phases. The word child, in this study, usually denotes any individual below the age of majority; it is accepted that an adult may at times be referred to as child in contexts where their relationships to parents are discussed. If this should be the case, at any point in the thesis, the distinction will be clarified.

The word 'discourse', in this thesis, is understood in the way in which it is defined by Halliday (1978), that is, as the ways in which language is used to communicate interpersonal meaning or affect social relations rather than simply to communicate ideational meaning or impart information (Halliday, 1978; Mercer, 1996). In places, where some critique is being made of discourse analytic approaches within critical psychology or linguistics, it will be made clear that the term is being used in a different way.

Graddol, Cheshire and Swann (1994) explore the difference between the terms 'discourse' and 'text'. They explain that, traditionally, the distinction was similar to that between 'spoken' and 'written' but that, for two reasons, the "correspondence has been eroded" (page 190). The two reasons that they cite are the increasing variety of forms available in modern media and the evolution of theoretical perspectives. They describe the adoption by many authors of an understanding of the term 'text' as referring to "the outward material form of a language event" and of the term 'discourse' as referring to "the more complex interaction between participants, text and context" (page 191). This is the general understanding of the distinctiveness of the term 'text' adopted here although further comment will be made about

'text' as a concept in Chapters 2 and 4 of this thesis, in referring to Derrida (1976), Foucault (1971, 1976) and post-structuralism.

The general understanding of the term 'sign' is that it represents something or is something that can be interpreted as having meaning (Chandler, 2007). Saussure, focussing largely on linguistic aspects, defined 'sign' as dyadic, being composed of both the 'signifier' that is, the word used to denote something and the 'signified', that is, the meaning denoted. Peirce (1931), focussing particularly on logic, defined the sign as a triadic relation consisting of the sign (something which represents), the object (a subject matter) and the interpretant (meaning). This is a simplification, for brevity, of a complex theory which, in fact, grows in complexity as the idea is proposed that the elements perpetuate themselves so that, for example, interpretants themselves become signs.

Whilst both of these definitions are helpful in certain ways (and foundational to semiotics), neither of these conceptions of 'sign' are adopted here in their totality because the researcher has adopted not only Vygotsky's proposition of 'sign' as internally directed but also the Vygotskian idea of meaning in social communication being located in social interactions and their context rather than in individual cognition. Hence, the study is concerned more with the pragmatics of adult-child interaction in the context of child bereavement than with the semantics or syntactics of those interactions. Saussure's concept of 'sign' will be utilised in certain sections of the thesis for the purpose of discussing aspects of semiotic analysis which are derived from his work but, at those points, it will be signalled clearly that it is Saussure's definition to which reference is being made rather than Vygotsky's.

The term 'sign systems' refers to what could be called 'language' except that the implied connotation of 'language' is that it is verbal, whether written or spoken (Wertsch and

Tulviste, 1996). Semiotics has recognised that signs such as non verbal behaviour, graphic art, numeric symbols and even clothing can 'speak' and be interpreted (Wertsch and Tulviste, 1996; Bertens, 2008). An example of clothing as a sign system is provided by Bertens (2008) in his description of how the wearing of a jacket in a classroom can have varying interpretations such as authority or subordination, depending upon context.

'Semiology' and 'semiotics' are used interchangeably in this thesis to denote the study of signs; it is the researcher's belief that they are synonymous terms. Saussure is credited with coining the term 'semiology' which he envisaged as a branch of social psychology. Peirce (1931) amongst others, has used the term 'semiotics' although both expressions are found across the literature. Saussure's focus was on linguistic aspects of communication and it may be that the term 'semiotics' currently has more connotations of a wider field of study which encompasses visual, multi-media and non verbal representations.

'Semiotic mediation' refers to the process described by Vygotsky whereby understanding is internalised after having first occurred in interaction with others. The psychological tool, usually language, employed to achieve the appearance of the new understanding at the intrapsychological level is called 'sign' by Vygotsky (1986).

[1] Since frequent reference is made to this text throughout the thesis, the date will be omitted except where page references are also provided to prevent distracting repetition.

[2] Since frequent reference is made to this text throughout the thesis, the date will be omitted, except where page references are also provided, to prevent distracting repetition.

[3] Since frequent reference is made to this text throughout the thesis, the date will be omitted, except where page references are also provided, to prevent distracting repetition.

Theoretical Background

A variety of theoretical work was identified which had a bearing on the study to be implemented. In every instance, however, the common theme of communication was apparent. In beginning to think about issues to do with bereavement, the relevance of the specific issues of attachment being built via communication seems obvious since loss is, of course, the reverse side of attachment. This then leads to a consideration of how communication features as an important factor in models of grief and its resolution but, when the grief in question is the grief of children, it becomes necessary, also, to examine ideas about whether, in fact, children do grieve, since some authors have argued to the contrary. Such discussion entails a consideration of certain aspects of cognitive development.

The issue of whether grief may be resolved and, if so, how it may be resolved, connects to a discussion which is central to this thesis: that 1) human beings employ communication to control social life (Vygotsky, 1934; 1978), and, therefore, implicitly, aspects of their emotional life, and 2) that human beings *master* their social world by means of dialogue with themselves and others. This discussion is amplified, below, in an examination of ideas about semiology within psychology. The discussion draws upon Vygotsky's theory of the importance of dialogue for cognitive and social development. It is suggested in this thesis that Freire's concepts of 'silence' and of 'dialogue' provide a helpful link between theoretical material concerning communication and the work of Vygotsky. In places within this present work, these ideas will be abbreviated to the concepts of using social interaction, both in texts and practices, for either 'control' purposes or for 'facilitation' purposes. It could be argued that there is not necessarily a neat division between these two aspects of communication since it is possible for a person to use 'control' of their own mental life in order to 'facilitate' the well being of another. Finally, the discussion of theoretical material enfolds important issues

to do with professional empathy, endemic defendedness and the role of those working in the realm of health and social care, including counselling.

ATTACHMENT THEORY

The importance of communication and of representation can be seen throughout this overview of attachment theory. Attachment theory was developed by Bowlby (1951; 1969; 1973 and 1980) and by his student Ainsworth (1989). Bowlby's life and work and the subsequent development of attachment theory has been described clearly and cogently by Holmes (1993) whilst Parkes, Steveson-Hinde and Marris (1991) have compiled a collection of their own and other people's work which examines the application of attachment theory to psychiatric and social problems including "pathological grief" (pages 187 -292). Bowlby's early work as, for example, in *Maternal Care and Mental Health* (1951), later published in an abridged version as *Child Care and the Growth of Maternal Love* (1953), supported the idea of monotropic attachment. The work conducted by the Robertsons (1953; 1971) led to an understanding of substitute care, however, and authors such as Schaffer and Emerson (1964) have argued the possibility of multiple attachments. Schaffer (1996) points out that, "what does appear to matter in object choice is the *quality* of the interaction" (page 137). Looking beyond the important issue of interaction between children and the important adults in their lives, authors such as Belsky (1984) and Sameroff (1991) have proposed more transactional models which go beyond interaction alone to suggest that development is affected by context, life events and a child's own characteristics as well as by interactions taking place within relationships between adult and child, be they dyadic or polyadic.

Key ideas postulated by attachment theorists that are relevant to this study, from the vast literature about attachment, are: that attachment status is reflected in internal working models; that secure attachment provides a base for healthy development and functioning whilst

separation has the opposite effect and that attachments are built by means of communication between children and their adult attachment figures.

1) Internal working models

Bowlby's phrase 'internal working model' (1981) derives from Craik's idea (1943) that, "Thought models, or parallels reality… the organism carries a 'small-scale model' of external reality and its own possible actions within its head which enable it to react in a fuller, safer, and more competent way to the emergencies which face it" (cited by Holmes, 1993, page 78). Bowlby's concept shows his synthesis of psychoanalytic theory with ideas from cognitive therapy. Main, Kaplan and Cassidy (1985, page 67) discuss individual differences in attachment relationships as differences based "in the mental representations of the self in relation to attachment" and propose that differences in secure versus insecure types of attachment "can best be understood as terms referring to particular types of internal working models of relationships". Differences in those models, they suggest, relate "not only to individual differences in patterns of nonverbal behaviour but also to patterns of language and structures of mind". Over time, attachment theory has developed the view that, although internal working models are not in a state of flux, they *can* change, particularly in response to major life changes (Main, Kaplan and Cassidy, 1985).

2) The secure base and separation distress

Before Bowlby synthesised ideas from psychoanalysis and ethology (Holmes, 1993), proximity seeking behaviour in human infants had been interpreted as a secondary drive (Freud, 1926). Bowlby was influenced by the 'Hungarian school' of analysts including Balint (1964) who suggested that proximity seeking was the result of a primary emotional instinct "independent of feeding" (Holmes, 1993, page 66). The first use of the phrase 'a secure base' is attributed by Holmes (1993) to Ainsworth (1982) to describe "the ambience created by the attachment figure for the attached person" (Holmes, 1993, page 70). The pattern of clinging

alternating with exploration is mirrored and amplified by Mahler, Pine and Bergman (1975) in tracing the pattern of separation and rapprochement from symbiosis in infancy to individuation in maturity. Separation protest was suggested by the Robertsons (1953, 1989), working with Bowlby at the Tavistock Institute, as the first of three phases of response to separation; the other two phases being despair and detachment. The converse implication, for attachment theorists, of the idea of the secure base for development is that separation will produce not only distress but will have negative effects on development and well being. It is important to state, at this point, that the work of Rutter (1971) provided a landmark clarification of the effects of separation and the causes of problems in adolescence; this research is described in Chapter 3 of this thesis.

3) Communication

Attachment theorists have described the process of forming emotional bonds between children and their attachment figures as a process of communication which is interactional (Ainsworth, Blehar, Waters and Wall, 1978). Bowlby (1991) reinforced this in writing that "For any systems to work together in harmony, efficient communication must exist between them" and, in the same passage welcomed the fact that "the field of communication has become a principal focus of attachment research" (in his *Postscript* to Parkes, Stevenson-Hinde and Marris, 1991, page 293). Schaffer (1996) has described how aspects of child- adult communication may develop throughout childhood both in terms of non-verbal and verbal interaction. The building of internal working models itself is achieved by means of such communication and this has been summarised as follows by Holmes (1993, page 78), "The developing child builds up a set of models of the self and others, based on repeated patterns of interactive experience".

The relevance of these concepts to this thesis lies in the expectation that a study of children's experience of bereavement will need to take account of the effects of disrupted relationships with significant adults, of representations of those relationships and of issues of communication strategies and patterns employed by bereaved children and by the adults in their lives.

MODELS OF GRIEF

Although Freud (1917) had used the word 'mourning' to denote the psychological reaction to loss, Bowlby (1980) adopts the word 'grieving' to allow for a distinction to be made between the social and the psychological manifestations. Freud had stated that the function of mourning, "is to detach the survivor's memories and hopes from the dead" (Freud, 1917; *SE* 14: pages 243-58[4]). Bowlby (1980, page 17) explains the specialized use of the term 'mourning' in anthropology as being restricted to denoting "the public act of expressing grief". This differentiation between grieving and mourning has been adopted here as serving the useful purpose of distinguishing between a psychological process (grieving) and the more outward, social, behaviour which marks a period of loss (mourning).

Holmes asserts (1993, page 89) that "Bowlby's theory of bereavement is essentially an extension of his theory of separation anxiety" since, Holmes continues, "Bowlby sees the grief reaction as a special case of separation anxiety, bereavement being an irreversible form of separation". This is corroborated by Bowlby's famous trilogy, "Attachment, Separation and Loss" (1969, 1973 and 1980) in which he suggests that there are usual patterns of grieving and in which he proposes two main variants from that pattern (1980). Like other writers such as Parkes (1965, 1969) and Kubler-Ross (1970), Bowlby's model consists of phases or stages of grieving.

He describes the "usual pattern" of grieving as a process consisting of the four phases of:

1) Numbing;
2) Yearning and searching;
3) Disorganization and despair and
4) Greater or lesser degree of reorganization.

The two variants described by Bowlby (1980) are: 1) Chronic mourning and 2) Prolonged absence of conscious grieving. Although the titles that Bowlby gives to these two variants appear to be inconsistent with his stated definitions of grieving and mourning, the description that he gives of 'chronic mourning' shows that its features include a continuation of the outward, social, behaviour associated with mourning customs. Essentially, prolonged absence of grieving can be interpreted as a prolongation of the 'numbing' phase and chronic mourning as a prolongation of the 'searching' phase of Bowlby's model. He explains that each of the variants can manifest to different degrees and in different ways (1980). He also states that they potentially have much in common. So, for example, in both, it may be that the loss is believed, consciously or unconsciously to be still reversible. The urge to search may, therefore, continue to possess the bereaved (unceasingly or episodically). Anger and/or self reproach may continue to be readily aroused. Sorrow and sadness may continue to be absent. In both instances, the course of grieving remains uncompleted (Bowlby, 1980).

Chronic mourning, he suggests, is marked by features such as chronic despair continuing beyond the first year following the loss, mummification (preserving belongings, rooms and routines as though the person were about to return) and thoughts of suicide in order to join the lost person (1980). He cites Longford (1964) describing Queen Victoria's chronic mourning for Prince Albert as an example of mummification since she not only preserved "every object as Prince Albert had arranged them but continued for the rest of her life to have his clothes laid out and his shaving water brought" (page 150).

Prolonged absence of conscious grieving is described by Bowlby (1980, page 153) as being typical of "self-sufficient people, proud of their independence and self-control, scornful of sentiment" and who regard tears as a sign of weakness. The principal feature, then, seems to be a lack of the expression of emotion as though "unaffected by the loss" (1980, page 153). Typical behaviour is to get rid of all reminders in stark contrast with chronic mourning or, in some cases of prolonged absence of conscious grieving, to keep one particular object, often secretly. Compulsive caring for others is a frequent feature and Bowlby goes on to say that "Sooner or later some at least of those who avoid all conscious grieving break down – usually with some form of depression" (1980, page 158). Breakdown may be precipitated by an anniversary of the death that has not been mourned, by another loss, apparently of a relatively minor kind, by reaching the same age as was a parent when he or she died or by a loss suffered by a compulsively cared-for person "with whose experience the failed mourner may be identifying" (page 158). It could be said that these two variants provide examples of the two extremes of a continuum between 'holding on' and 'letting go' and that neither extreme can be seen as particularly healthy.

It has been noted, above, that Bowlby's model consists of phases or stages of grieving and that other authors also have proposed phase or stage models. The examples cited were Parkes (1965, 1969) and Kubler-Ross (1970). Kubler-Ross (1970) proposes a number of phases which are not necessarily sequential, these being:

 1) Denial;
2) Anger;
3) Bargaining;
4) Depression and
5) Acceptance.

Parkes (1965, 1969) model suggests the following.

1) Shock, numbness, disbelief;
2) Feelings of guilt, anger and sadness;
3) Yearning, searching; and
4) Resolution.

The similarities between all of these models can be seen. They all, for example, describe an initial reaction of disbelief which perhaps serves to protect a person from the overwhelming nature of the initial impact of loss (Bowlby, 1980). Bowlby and Parkes both suggest the phenomenon of some kind of searching for the lost person. All three of these models have a final phase or stage which is described in terms such as "resolution" "recovery" or "acceptance" and this reflects the common concept, which has persisted for almost a century, of "detachment" from the person with whom there was an emotional bond. This concept is at the heart of the proposition that reaction to loss involves "grief work" in which the bereaved must engage if they are to emerge in a healthy way from the experience of loss (Bonanno and Kaltman, 1999).

At first sight, the phase or stage models may be contrasted with Worden's 'Task' model

(1991) in which four 'tasks of mourning' are described:

1) To accept the reality of the loss;
2) To experience the pain of grief;
3) To adjust to the environment in which the deceased is missing and
4) To withdraw emotional energy and reinvest it.

One strength of this model is that it depicts progress through the process of grieving as a more "active" process than the other models appear to do. There is an implicit emphasis in Worden's model upon the individual *doing* the various tasks rather than merely being acted upon by their experience. Nevertheless, it can be argued that all of the models mentioned so far, including Worden's, incorporate the idea of 'detachment'; this is a concept which now will be explored further.

1) Grief work

It can be argued that assumptions about the necessity of "grief work" for healthy outcomes from bereavement began with Freud's article about mourning and melancholia in 1917. Bonanno and Kaltman (1999, page 760) support this argument in their comprehensive and cogent review of "perspectives on bereavement" in which they also suggest that there is a need "to develop an integrative framework to guide future research".

Freud (1917) described the "work of mourning" as being that of severing "attachment to the non-existent object" (*SE* 14: pages 243-58). This view has dominated the bereavement literature throughout the succeeding decades. It has been seen already, above, in discussing phase or stage models that they all include the idea of resolution or recovery as an important part of healthy grieving. Closer examination of the sources in which those models are described reveals that this idea implicitly involves 'letting go' of the lost person and 'moving on' from the loss so as to be able to 're-invest' in new relationships and that this is seen as a healthy development.

Archer (1999) discusses the difficulties in agreeing an exact definition of the term 'grief work' and cites Stroebe and Stroebe (1992; 1993) who argued that these difficulties extend to evaluating "whether grief work necessarily facilitates adjustment" (Archer, 1999, page 120). For the purposes of their own research, Stroebe and Stroebe (1991) have "defined grief work as the degree to which their respondents suppressed or confronted grief" (Archer, 1999, page 120). This definition leads to the question of whether talking about how we feel necessarily always involves confronting. As Archer (1999) quite rightly points out, going over and over an experience by repeatedly talking about negative emotions may actually assist "poor

coping" (page 120). He uses the word 'rumination' to suggest that, in fact, the kind of talking that does not involve confronting may actually be more akin to the 'yearning' described in some models as occurring as part of the process before 'resolution' is achieved (Archer, 1999).

As well as providing a succinct account of the concept of "grief work" (1999), Archer (2001) has also engaged in a healthy and helpful debate with Bonanno (2001) about grief work, cognitive restructuring and evolutionary theory. It is not the intention here to reproduce that whole debate but it does seem necessary to mention those two perspectives in order to complete a discussion of models of grief.

Bonanno (1999) published a review of the grief literature which demonstrated that there is actually no evidence to support the theoretical construct of grief work, that is, that there is no evidence to support the idea that people who 'cope' in grief do so because they have 'detached' from the relationship with the lost person. Klass, Silverman and Nickman (1996)] have published findings which suggest that 'coping' has more to do with a sense of a continuing relationship than of detaching from the relationship. Archer (2001) has questioned the 'dismissal' of the evolutionary perspective to which he subscribes. Bonanno (2001) subsequently replied denying that his original review had expressed the argument to which Archer objected and reasserting his call for an integrative perspective of grief and responses to grief.

2) Two-process theory of grief

Archer (1999) examines Hofer's (1984) psychobiologic perspective on bereavement in which Hofer concluded that in the grief response there are actually two processes at work and not one. Archer (1999) traces this conclusion from Darwin (1872) and via Shand (1920) to Engel

(1962) and Klinger (1975, 1977) who all described two different types of reaction to separation. Archer (1999) cites research on primates pioneered by Harlow (for example, Seay, Hansen and Harlow, 1962) which shows the two reactions of protest and then of withdrawal. Klinger (1975, 1977) saw "the two responses as part of a sequence of disengagement, depression occurring when active responses have proved unsuccessful" (Archer, 1999, page 57). Like Darwin (1872) and Harlow and Harlow (1965), however, Hofer's work was with animals rather than with human beings. Darwin (1872) and Harlow and Harlow (1965) studied young primates in separation from their mothers, whilst Hofer studied rat pups in separation from their mothers. It has to be said that in the absence of similar biological experimentation, which, of course would be ethically unjustifiable, it is not possible to confidently extrapolate from those findings to human beings. Hofer's conclusion, however, was that the two reactions relate to two different processes with distinct behavioural and biological evidence pertaining to each (Hofer, 1984). The initial protest response, Hofer believed, related to the specific absence of the mother, whilst the slower developing depressed response related to the absence of the biologic regulation provided by the mother (Hofer, 1984). Hofer (1984) goes on to suggest links between internal representations and biologic responses and concludes with the hope that, if the findings reported from animal studies are "on the right track", then "we should be able to find evidence that the *presence* of human social relationships can modify physiologic responses" (page 193). Stroebe and Stroebe (1987) have postulated the application of a two-process theory of grief to human experience, suggesting that the variation over time of observable effects of loss can be explained by the specific loss and the more prolonged loss of regulation.

3) Continuing Bonds

Klass, Silverman and Nickman (1996) argue that it is actually the continuance of the relationship in 'healthy' ways which features in the lives of those who cope with loss.

Walter (1999) discusses the proposition that public *and* private bonds are important in coping with grief and that communication with the lost person is a vital factor in coping. Walter (1999) suggests that there is comparatively little public communication in the West because of its lower incidence of religiously required rituals, modern urbanised society and reduced family coherence.

In terms of private bonds, it is suggested that some bereaved people maintain a bond with the dead person *and* move on to new relationships. The often reported phenomenon (Bowlby, 1980) of 'sensing the presence' of the person lost, which may be associated with a spiritual relationship, is seen in phase models as a feature of 'seeking' or 'searching' but in the theoretical perspective of continuing bonds is seen as a feature of maintaining some kind of communication.

It has already been mentioned that Bonanno (1999) and Klass et al. (1996) have argued that the idea of recovery from grief in the shape of 'grief work', by which is meant the detaching from the relationship with the deceased loved one, is not actually supported by empirical evidence. Klass et al. (1996) suggest that adults *and* children cope by maintaining their relationship rather than by letting it go. Klass et al. (1996) and Walter (1999) epitomise the continuing bonds perspective of grief in suggesting that strategies for maintaining a connection with a lost person include private and public communication with the deceased, preserving memories and 'being a living legacy'. The concept of 'being a living legacy' implies that a child has internalised aspects of the deceased role model such as values, goals and behaviours that belonged to the deceased parent and that their awareness of such internalisation helps them to adjust to life without that person.

THE QUESTION OF WHETHER CHILDREN GRIEVE

Worden (1991) highlights the influence of psychoanalytic psychology and points out that some adherents to this school of thought (for example, Wolfenstein, 1966) believe that children cannot grieve until their personality is fully formed. The theoretical basis for this stems from the fact that psychoanalytical psychologists believe, as did Freud (1938), that the key to the full formation of the personality is the child's identification with their same sex parent as a means of resolving the famous 'Oedipal conflict', and, therefore, that grieving isn't possible until the end of adolescence since Freudian psychology says that is the time by which identification will have taken place. Worden goes on to contrast this position with that of other psychologists trained originally in psychoanalysis. He cites Furman (1974) who says that grieving is possible from the age of three and Bowlby (1960) who believed that grief is possible from the age of six months. Worden also goes on to explain his own view that children grieve but may grieve differently from adults and in differing ways at different stages of development. Archer (1999) cites Nagy (1948) in suggesting that "children younger than about 5 years of age regard death as reversible and like separation or sleep" (Archer, 1999, page 50).

Cognitive development is another complicating factor. Piaget (1954) believed that the development of the concept of object permanence is a process that takes the whole of the sensori-motor period to acquire, in other words the whole of the first two years of life. Later research (for example, Bower, 1974) has led developmental psychologists like Flavell (1985) to suggest that, in fact, infants have acquired the concept of object permanence by about nine months of age. Bower's experiments (1974) in which infants were presented with multiple images of their mother are particularly interesting since they show how babies in the first half of the first year of life react very differently than do babies in the second half of the first year

of life. The younger infants in Bower's experiments were not disturbed by seeing multiple images of their mother whereas the older infants tended to be distressed.

The issue of cognitive development is important not only because of the idea that if people important to the infant exist, they exist 'permanently' but also because of the idea that death is also a permanent event. These cognitive realities are further complicated by the issue of the difference between the distress that may be caused by temporary separation and the effects of the permanent separation brought about when people die. If we are not sure whether a child has a concept of object permanence or a concept of the permanence of death, it may be difficult to judge whether the distress that they experience is separation distress (as in the case of a child separated for several days from the primary care giver) or whether it is what, in other individuals, we should call grief. Bowlby (1960; 1980) and Ainsworth (1989) have concluded that the formation of secure attachments is essential for healthy development. If this is the case, then, as Archer (1999) points out, "There are two aspects to the loss of a parent, the grief response and the consequences of the absence of that parent" (page 210). All of this adds up to a very complex phenomenon to research in terms of determining a) what the grief response in children may be (at various stages of development); b) whether they do adapt easily and if so how; c) whether some children need support following bereavement in addition to the support that they receive through their family and social networks and d) whether there are long term consequences for some bereaved children and if so what factors determine those effects.

The recurring feature in phase models of a final stage of 'resolution' or 'recovery' (compare Parkes and Weiss, 1983 and Bowlby, 1980) has already been pointed out, above. It could be said, in the light of such models, that another possible view of childhood bereavement is that children grieve but that, in time, they adapt and recover naturally just as, supposedly,

bereaved adults do. This means that if, in adult life, such individuals encounter problems, causes are to be found elsewhere than in their bereaved past.

FREIRE AND DIALOGUE

If the theory of the "continuing bonds" perspective of bereavement is true, it is reasonable to suppose that there is a difference in the types of communication that occur between those who "cope" and those who do not. The ideas of Freire (1972) about communication which may, at first sight, seem to have little relevance to bereavement, have proved very useful in exploring this issue. Freire pioneered effective literacy programmes in South America and developed ideas related to oppression, freedom and communication. The programmes were effective because he used ethnographic methods to develop materials which worked from people's own experience rather than trying to teach them to read and write words which represented concepts of which they had no understanding (1972).

Freire presents an excellent example of how oppression works at the level of human interaction and not only at the macrocosmic level of what we usually think of as "the political world" of legislation, military action and of national and international economics. Freire quotes Fromm (1964, page 32) to underline this wider understanding of oppression: "… the aim of sadism is to transform a man [sic] into a thing, something animate into something inanimate, since by complete and absolute control the living loses one essential quality of life – freedom". Those who are free are described as 'subjects' which at first may sound contradictory but the word is used as, for instance, it is used in grammar. Graddol, Cheshire and Swann (1994) contrast the English language with Welsh, explaining that, in English, the usual word order is subject (S), verb (V) and object (O) whereas Welsh is a language which puts the verb first. Hence, English is described as a SVO language and Welsh as a VSO language.

In both instances, irrespective of word order, the subject of the sentence is the person who is doing something and the object is whatever may be receiving the effect of the action. Hence, in this perspective, a subject is a person who does something, a person who acts, but who does so without oppressing others. "Subjects" are neither oppressors nor oppressed. In contrast, "objects" *are* oppressed. Continuing the analogy with grammar, the "object" is the part of the sentence that has something done to it. In Freire's context of Latin America, "objects" were often poor, uneducated, powerless and dispossessed. "Objects" are owned, as for example, is the slave but Freire also takes on Marx's ideas concerning alienation and the ownership of labour (1920). In Freire's view, "objects" are also "owned" because they have internalised the character of the oppressor and whilst this may often be adult-adult oppression, Freire also discusses parent-child oppression (1972, pages 123-124). Oppressors "possess" the object who does not think their own thoughts but those of the oppressor and this is reflected in the words which are spoken because objects do not "speak their own word" (page 61) but speak the word of the oppressor.

"Subjects" are free to be fully human (pages 21 & 58). The "subject" is a "new man" and Freire talks about a "birth process" into this freedom. Freire applied these concepts to education, describing the traditional educational process as the "banking concept" of education; the teacher is a "narrator" whose "…..task is to 'fill' the students with the contents of his narration – contents which are detached from reality ….." (page 45). The aim of this 'education' is the socialisation of the student, to produce conformity to the system of "oppression". Knowledge becomes a "deposit". Memory rather than experience becomes important. As with any form of oppression, the student "speaks the word" of another. In "speaking the word" of another (the oppressor), the student (object) is oppressed, not free, not

fully human. To be fully human, he must "speak his own word" and "name the world". Dialogue is the encounter by which people name the world. In describing "dialogic education", contrasted with "banking the deposit", Freire draws examples from adult literacy work in the third world. In this work, the educators, by means of a type of ethnographic survey, discover the themes, codes and situations which exist in the world of the potential students. This method is contrasted with the didactic approach in which not only the vocabulary, but also the values are those of the educators. In "naming his world" the subject "creates his own world" which results in liberation and revolution.

These ideas, clearly, were fashioned in the context of educational work and in a context of poverty and oppression. The relevance of such theory to bereavement responses and support for bereaved people may not, therefore, be immediately apparent but the intention is to demonstrate how these ideas may be *applied* to important issues of communication and non-communication in the context of children's grief. It has been seen, above, in discussing attachment theory, that communication plays a key role in the forming of emotional bonds. It has also been seen, above, that there are questions about how, or if, people communicate with themselves and with others in trying to express grief and that it may important to confront feelings rather than simply to rehearse them. It has been argued by Xavier (2013) that the concept referred to as 'naming the world' is implicitly synonymous with semiotics because it involves assigning descriptions which have meaning for the person employing those descriptions.

LANGUAGE AND SOCIAL REALITY

Parker (1989) has analysed the "crisis in modern social psychology" and has traced the impact of 'new paradigm' thinking on the world of psychology (1992). The understanding that

emerges in Parker's published work from the late 1980's onwards is of social psychology as a 'pseudo-science', in crisis because it attempts to investigate human behaviour 'scientifically', which can be seen as a contradiction in terms since human experience is not actually lived or observed 'scientifically' (1989). This critique can be seen helpfully in the context of Parker's elucidation (1992) of the tensions between behaviourism and humanism, materialism and idealism as well as between empiricism and language as ways of knowing. The truth is that we live in a world which has not only material and behavioural reality but also *social* reality and the ways of understanding the one are not necessarily appropriate for understanding the other. Harré and Secord (1972, page 84) argued: "For scientific purposes, treat people as if they were human beings" and Parker (1992, page 26) adds that "It is in the nature of a human being that it is reflexive". The logical conclusion of this argument is that those who study human behaviour ought to take account of the reflexivity of those whose experience they study as well as of their own 'subjectivity'.

One of the key concepts of 'new paradigm' psychology is that social reality is created and changed by language (Potter and Wetherell, 1987). Parker (1992, pages xi and xii) explains that "the turn to language" has many strands within the discipline of psychology. He describes the influence of 'new paradigm' psychologists such as Gergen (1973, 1982) and Harré (1979, 1983) who focussed on "the importance of meaning and the accounts people gave of their actions" but notes that they "have remained on the fringe of the discipline" (page 66). Parker also discusses the role of deconstruction as having been useful in producing critical perspectives of the discipline and also "in introducing the work of Derrida to psychologists" (Parker, 1992, page 67; Derrida, 1976). Parker notes, however, that "mainstream practitioners will not wear it" because within it they detect "political critiques of the whole fabric of the discipline" (1992, page 66). He attributes greater success to discourse analysis which has

made use of Foucauldian and Lacanian theory (Foucault, 1972, 1980; Lacan, 1977, 1979) to examine ways in which discourses reproduce power relations and play a part in social regulation.

Potter, Wetherell, Gill and Edwards wrote that, "In the last few years the analysis of discourse and rhetoric has become increasingly established as a major alternative perspective on issues of psychological concern" (1990, page 205). They trace at least "four distinct strands of work" which use the title "discourse analysis" and argue that it could be more helpful to use different terms to describe such work, stating their own preference for the title "interpretive repertoires". They identify one of the four strands of work as being centred in the "tradition of continental social philosophy and cultural analysis" whose proponents mostly "worked with the titles of semiology or post-structuralism". Notions about sign and social reality resonate strongly with the work of Vygotsky (1934; 1978) where, in the researcher's view, the conflict finds a satisfactory resolution.

VYGOTSKY, THE SOCIAL WORLD AND THE INTERNAL WORLD

Three distinctive ideas are expressed in Vygotsky's work: the social or cultural construction of knowledge and understanding; the zone of proximal development (ZPD) and the use of sign for mastery (Vygotsky, 1934; 1978). Western educationalists seem to have latched on to the first two of these ideas but much less attention seems to have been paid to the third idea.

Vygotsky's ideas about development (1934; 1978) have been described as 'social constructivism' (Das Gupta, 1994). While Piaget (1954) did believe that the social environment plays an important part in development, the greater emphasis of his work is "the interaction between the individual and the physical environment" (Das Gupta, 1994).

In comparison with Vygotsky's ideas, Das Gupta and Richardson (1995) describe Piaget's perspective of development as a "lone venture in the world" for the individual child (page 13). Piaget believed that children construct higher levels of knowledge as a result of the interaction between their innate, maturing, cognitive capacity and the input they receive from their material environment. He also believed this process to be universal (Piaget, 1926/1929)

Vygotsky, on the other hand, believed that cognition is *socially* constructed. There seem to be two aspects to this notion:

1) "All the higher functions originate as actual relations between human individuals" (1978, page 576). Hence, understanding develops in interaction with others. Vygotsky asserts (1978, page 57) that interpersonal processes are transformed into intrapersonal ones, "Every function in the child's cultural development appears twice: first, on the social level, and later, on the individual level; first, *between* people (*interpsychological*) and then *inside* the child (*intrapsychological*)".

2) The outcome of interactions between innate capacity and environment may produce different outcomes in different contexts. The theory of Vygotsky (1934) and Luria (1976) was that functions of speech and reasoning are closely linked to cultural or social context.

Sutton (1983) has given a lucid account of Vygotsky's ideas about indices of children's development. The *actual* or *present level of development* is indicated by what a child can currently do on her own without adult co-operation. The *potential level of development* is demonstrated by what a child can do in collaboration with adults. The gap between these actual and potential levels of development is called the *zone of proximal development*. Sutton (1983) and Lunt (1983) show how, for decades, the emphasis of assessment in the West has been upon outcomes or product rather than process. The implication of the work of Vygotsky, his associates and those who have followed them, is that development is better facilitated by

giving attention to the process of learning than it may be by paying attention to outcomes alone (Cole, John-Steiner, Scribner and Souberman, 1978).

Towards the end of "Thought and Language" (1934), Vygotsky states his belief that thought "is engendered by motivation" and that "Behind every thought there is an affective-volitional tendency" (page 252). If approaches to instruction and assessment do not take account of important behavioural responses, such as motivation and, perhaps, grief, there is surely a danger of increasing disengagement from the process of 'learning' on the part of the learners. The word 'learning' is placed in quotation marks here in order to emphasise that it may be understood as a concept which encompasses not only educational goals but also as a concept which includes processes of changing and developing as a person whether those changes are subject to formal assessment by the education system or not. Sutton makes the interesting observation that the Russian word 'obuchenie' may be translated as either 'learning' or 'teaching' since its sense in the Russian language encompasses the whole process (1983).

It has been argued that progress or success in attainment of intellectual tasks is dependant partly upon communication between teacher and learner or between parent and child (Light, 1983). Reference has also been made, above, to Bonanno's discussion of the cognitive restructuring theory of grief resolution (1999; 2001). Acquisition of new understanding is implicit in such restructuring. Conclusions drawn by Donaldson (1978, page 69), from her own research, suggest that there are three requirements for a child to correctly interpret and understand:

1) the child's knowledge of the language used;
2) her assessment of what the adult intends, "as indicated by our non-linguistic behaviour" (page 69) and
3) the manner in which she would represent the situation to herself if the adult were not there at all.

This requires that the child reads both the verbal and non-verbal communication of the adult, be that teacher or parent (Donaldson, 1978).

Vygotsky's thinking was in harmony with the works of Marx (1920) and Engels (1925; 1964). Engels had written that the use of tools by human beings to master nature is the essential distinction between human beings and other species. Vygotsky (1934) extended this idea to the use of psychological tools or sign systems such as language and the various ways of communicating, calculating and co-operating. For Vygotsky, there is an important differentiation between tools and signs: the former are used for mastery of the environment and have an external focus whilst the latter mediate meaning so that it can be internalised (1978).

It can be seen from the argument so far that, in Vygotskian theory, the use of sign in the process of cognitive development is implicit in both the social construction of understanding and in the concept of the ZPD. If understanding first occurs in interaction with others then communication must be involved since people can only interact if some means of communication is available. If new cognition appears when potential development is assessed which then also appears in assessing what the child can do on her own, it can be concluded that something has been communicated to her which she has been able to communicate to herself, using internal speech via memory (1934; 1978).

Whether Western European philosophers who have written about sign and discourse were influenced directly by the ideas of Vygotsky (1934), Leontiev (1981) and Luria (1976) is beyond the remit of this thesis to trace. At this point, however, it is suggested, that the link between Lacan (1977) and Bakhtin (1981) may have provided a channel for Vygotskian ideas

to influence psychologists and philosophers such as Derrida (1976) and Foucault (1972), and, through their work, the many others impacted by them.

EMPATHY

The series of investigations presented in this thesis explores the issue of communication with children experiencing loss and separation and the *resolution* of grief or coping with grief and distress. This latter concern involves some consideration of the approaches employed by professionals in contact with such children. For this reason, and for other reasons which are amplified in later chapters, the aspect of communication known as 'empathy' is a relevant aspect on which to focus in considering the issue of the resolution of grief or helping people to cope. It seems important, therefore, to provide a working definition of empathy so that, in later chapters, it will be clear what is understood in this thesis by this term. Different fields of psychology have employed differing understandings of the term and research has explored various aspects of the concept of empathy (Gladstein, 1984; Churchill and Bayne, 1998).

The term, " empathy", as used in this thesis, refers to :

i) The ability to understand, "the positive and negative experiences of another" (Argyle, 1991, page 103);

ii) The ability to communicate such understanding as in Kalisch's (1971) definition of empathy: "the ability to perceive accurately the feelings of another person and to communicate this understanding to him" (sic) and

iii) The ability to help another whilst so 'feeling with' yet not oneself becoming dysfunctional through such 'feeling with'.

The third part of the above threefold definition calls for some brief elucidation. Eisenberg and Strayer (1987) describe empathy as sharing the perceived emotion of another or feeling with

another but it seems fair to say that the ability to help another could well be reduced or even lost if the 'empathizer' were experiencing exactly the same things as the sufferer. Benner and Wrubel (1989) provide some helpful elaboration of this issue; they draw upon Tisdale's (1986) account of finding the right balance of involvement with her clients in her work in a burns unit. Benner and Wrubel (1989) describe the two possible extremes of: a) becoming 'enmeshed' through placing oneself in the situation and b) being inappropriately distanced from the situation. This latter possibility, being inappropriately distanced, sounds very much like the inability to care for clients described by Freudenberger (1975; 1980) and Maslach (1976) in their respective descriptions and definitions of professional burnout. Becoming "enmeshed" has been described in classic studies as taking a variety of forms ranging from adopting the role of "omnipotent rescuer" to developing a total inability to help (Eisendrath and Dunkel, 1979 and Hay and Oken, 1972). In the light of these two potential dangers, it is suggested here that empathic communication is that which enables professionals (and non-professionals) to facilitate that communication on the part of distressed others which will prove helpful to them in resolving or coping with their distress or suffering.

ENDEMIC DEFENDEDNESS

'Endemic defendedness' is also a term which requires some elucidation because reference is made at various points in the investigations to instances of closed communication on the part of some professionals. It has already been noted, above, that adults often use closed communication when faced with bereaved or distressed children. The classic work of Robertson and Robertson (1989) and of Menzies (1959) provided support for the view that professionals, when faced with the pain and suffering of their clients can also use closed communication as a result of working in contexts where a culture of defendedness has become the norm. Classic evidence of how well defended both medical and nursing staff can

be is provided by the account (edited by Joyce Robertson, 1989) of the decades of work done by James and Joyce Robertson for the welfare of children in hospital. For over 30 years the Robertsons found immense resistance to their message about the emotional needs of children in separation. The 1989 account, edited by Joyce Robertson, and entitled "Separation and the Very Young" documents their observation of the phases of young children's response to hospitalization, namely, protest, despair and, in prolonged separation, detachment.

Reference has been made already, in this chapter, to the work of Menzies (1959). Her famous study, "The functioning of social systems as a defence against anxiety: a report on a study of the nursing service of a general hospital" (1959) raises the question of personal responsibility in an institutional, bureaucratic and hierarchical system. Menzies' study (1959) was actually initiated by a London teaching hospital with the aim of facilitating change. The picture discovered by Menzies was of nurses faced with an objective situation which, according to psychoanalytical theory, resembles the phantasy situations that exist in every individual in the deepest and most primitive levels of the mind. This situation arouses mixed feelings in the nurse: pity, compassion, guilt and resentment. Menzies follows the psychodynamic tradition of tracing strong libidinal and, opposing, aggressive impulses back to earliest infancy. She reiterates the psychodynamic view of physical and psychic[5] experiences being intimately interwoven during that phase of life. The very physical nature of nursing with frequent and intimate bodily contact with clients as well as the confrontation with suffering and death exposes the nurse to the pain and anxiety of re-experiencing many of the feelings appropriate to the phantasies which, in psychoanalytic theory, exist deep within every individual.

This analysis is, obviously, parallel to the Robertsons' concerns about professional anxiety. In the Robertsons' work the carers were exposed to the physical and emotional distress of

children. An added dimension in Menzies' study is the observation that nursing work involves carrying out tasks which, "by ordinary standards, are distasteful, disgusting and frightening" (Menzies, 1988a). Both the Robertsons and Menzies share the view that hospital carers develop defences to their professional anxiety and that closed communication serves as one of those defences. Menzies (1959) lists ten defensive techniques which can be observed in the nursing service but important themes which feature in Menzies' list are those of depersonalisation and personal responsibility. (See Menzies-Lyth 1988a, for elaboration of each of these techniques). In a later interview, Menzies-Lyth argues that human communication and giving appropriate responsibility rather than the creation of more systems could provide an adequate counter to endemic defendedness (1988b).

It was stated at the beginning of this chapter that communication emerges as a common theme in examining each of the various aspects of theory which seem relevant to the question of childhood bereavement. It was only as each of the areas of theory was explored that the researcher became aware of the extent to which communication is fundamental to each of the theories examined. This realisation then raised the question of the extent to which communication might feature in the findings obtained by previous empirical investigations.

Notes

[4]Denotes the Standard Edition of Freud's works.
[5]That is to say, relating to the psyche.

Chapter 3

Empirical Background

CHILDHOOD BEREAVEMENT

It is obviously important to ask what evidence is available about bereavement in childhood and so the findings of existing psychological investigations are briefly summarized here. The need for valid comparison was kept very much in mind when planning to search the existing body of evidence. For this reason, the search for relevant childhood bereavement studies was limited to:

a) those which were actually empirical studies rather than reviews, editorials or discussions;

b) those which considered the effects of the loss of a parent rather than siblings or other relatives to avoid confusion about effects;

c) those which were based in psychology rather than in other disciplines.

Published works other than empirical studies were excluded because the intention was to identify the effects upon children of bereavement in order to lay a foundation for considering what type of communication might be appropriate to help coping with such effects. For this reason also, the loss of relatives other than parents was excluded since it seemed possible that those bereavements might have different, although, surely, deep, effects upon the children experiencing those losses. The possibility was recognised that a grandparent or, as in the case of displaced children after the Second World War, siblings, might constitute attachment figures for some children. A second possibility, that some parents, such as those already separated by circumstances from their children, might not have constituted attachment figures for their children was also recognised. These two conditions were, however, excluded on the grounds that neither the original researchers nor the present researcher would necessarily have access to such information. It seemed reasonable to suppose that studies of parental bereavement would largely be obtaining data from families where changes in children's behaviour and affect post-bereavement would be noted.

Sociological studies were excluded on the same grounds as those involving loss of relatives other than parents; the objective was to identify what the psychological effects might be upon children in terms of behaviour and affect rather than sociological function. For this reason, searches were focused on studies which actually employed psychological measures.

Six studies were identified by searches conducted applying the criteria described, above. These are now summarised in chronological order of their publication. The most recent of these studies were published in 1999 but some discussion is included of a small number of papers published since that date which do not fit the criteria listed for inclusion in the review but which seem significant a) because they have been influential in shaping thinking and practice and b) because they illustrate in various ways some characteristics of the child bereavement literature.

It may well be that the small number of studies reflects the difficulty of setting up research projects involving bereaved children because of the sensitivity of the issue and the concerns about ethical aspects of carrying out such work. Research ethics committees' increasing vigilance in recent years about research involving children is understandable in the light of well publicised problems which have arisen. This may, however, be another factor to account for the scarcity of childhood bereavement research. The studies are appraised in the section of this chapter labelled 'Critique'.

Van Eerdewegh, Bieri, Parrilla and Clayton (1982) in St. Louis, Missouri, obtained parent reports about their bereaved children at 1 month and 13 months following their loss and found: an increase in dysphoria; an increase in bedwetting; the persistence of a minor form of depression and impairment of school performance. Although dysphoria decreased during the

year, abdominal pain and fighting with siblings significantly increased. Ages of children in this study ranged from 2 to 17 years. Adolescent boys in this sample were more likely to show severe depression after the loss of their father.

Elizur and Kaffman (1983) observed, "severe emotional and behavioural problems, as well as impaired social functioning" in more than 40% of children in their kibbutz sample and similar effects in 52% of their non-kibbutz sample. Children were from 2 to 10 years of age and effects persisted for more than 3 years. Whether from kibbutzim or from the city, all of the children in this study had lost their fathers in the October 1973, war in Israel.

Silverman and Worden (1993), at Harvard, found that 22% of bereaved children in their study showed some indications of dysfunctional behaviour. Amongst pre-adolescent children, in particular, they found that somatic symptoms were high. They observe that many children had, "very little way of talking about this experience" and that both the surviving parent and the child, "need to learn" how to reflect and remember in conversation. They also report that the children with the poorest peer support were also those who had the highest scores for disturbed behaviour, both internalised and externalised. The age range studied was 6 to 18 years. The children in this study were recruited via funeral directors and so, obviously, also were interviewed only *after* their parent's death. The observations about communication are interesting in the light of the aspects of theory examined in Chapter 2 of this thesis.

Thompson, Kaslow, Price, Williams and Kingree (1998) studied children aged from 9 to 17 years. The sample included children bereaved both through sudden and through expected death. This study revealed a complex pattern of how sub-groups within the sample fared in comparison with each other. There was more externalising behaviour amongst girls; more

internalising behaviour amongst younger children when compared with older participants and more externalising behaviour amongst youths bereaved of their father when there were secondary stressors.

Dowdney, Wilson, Maughan, Allerton, Schofield and Skuse (1999), in the United Kingdom, studied children aged from 2 to 16 and, again, the group included those bereaved through sudden death as well as through expected death. The average length of follow up was 7 months. They found more externalising behaviour amongst boys. They also found that the manner of death influenced whether support was offered to families or not by professionals.

Raveis, Siegel and Karus (1999) found that boys fared better than girls and that older children fared better than younger children. Only Raveis et al. (1999), Thompson et al. (1998) and Silverman and Worden (1993) obtained data directly from bereaved children.

Some helpful conclusions can be drawn from the work of Rutter (1971) which has been highly influential in balancing the impression given as a result of some of Bowlby's research suggesting that early experiences of separation are necessarily damaging (1946). Rutter was sceptical about the effects of experiences in early life and carried out longitudinal studies which provided a number of more nuanced findings. Rutter found no positive correlation between maternal separation and conduct disorders but did find a positive correlation between family stress and anti-social behaviour. The findings lend support to the idea that family function is a crucial factor in children's response to difficult experiences.

It can be seen that the existing empirical evidence is conflicting. There are issues of comparison, for example, such as whether deaths were sudden or expected and whether children are compared according to their developmental stage. There appear to be

contradictions between the studies in terms of whether boys cope better than girls or vice versa; sometimes studies draw different conclusions about how well different age groups cope. There seem to be variations in adaptation according to the gender of the deceased parent but, again, this is not conclusive. There also seems to be some indication that the availability and the communication styles of the surviving parent are important to the bereaved children's coping (Worden, 1991). This view is supported by the studies which have noted family function as a factor in children's response to loss.

CRITIQUE

A critique of the available studies reveals certain problems with methods used. Van Eerdewegh et al. (1982) offer the criticism of their own work that their results were obtained from parent interviews rather than from the children. In a later paper (1985) Van Eerdewegh, Clayton and Van Eerdewegh advocate that interviews with children be included in future research; that studies should follow children for longer than one year and that samples should be gathered which are large enough to give power to the results of future studies. The need for longitudinal research is underlined by the comment from Mulcahey and Young (1995) that behaviour problems may be triggered when a child enters some new developmental phase. It is possible that obtaining outcome measures over a relatively short period of time may result in a failure to observe the true effect of bereavement on children's development.

Silverman and Worden (1993) also argue that one reason for there being, so far, a lack of consistent findings in the research literature (as observed by Berlinsky and Biller, 1982) may be that there is "an oversimplification of outcome measures" (page 300) and they advocate that researchers a) look at children in their social and family systems and b) include measures of adaptation as well as measures of outcome. Schaffer (1996) explains how, in the past,

developmental psychopathology has been explained by models which emphasise either 'child factors' or 'environment factors' and he supports Sameroff's suggestion of a transactional model of development (1991). Sameroff and Chandler (1975) argue the importance of a) the characteristics of both child and environment (particularly parents), b) the fact that both child and parent are psychologically changed by interacting and c) that the effects of interaction and experience are cumulative.

One particular reservation about the work of Kaffman, Elizur and Gluckson (1987) is that the questionnaire used in interviews was developed (Kaffman et al., 1987) from symptoms reported by Furman (1974 and 1983) in clinical practice. Although Kaffman et al. (1987) make the observation (page 65) that, in their review, they found that most research about bereavement in children uses clinic samples or retrospective accounts of adults, the fact is that symptoms reported by Furman are derived from observations of children in therapy. Psychoanalytic theory may be useful in interpreting observations of bereaved children because of the issue of defendedness but the point here is that the children were in therapy of some kind.

Unconscious defence applies to adults as well as to children and Black, Harris-Hendricks and Kaplan (1992) argue that adults may under-report or deny children's trauma as a natural consequence of their need to protect themselves and the children from "the massive scale of the trauma and loss". This perspective lends some support to the argument about defendedness made by both the Robertsons (1989) and Menzies-Lyth (1988a).

In a later paper (1998), Black describes how children, because of their need for parenting, may be anxious about the survival of their remaining parent and protect that parent from knowing of their distress. For this reason, adults may believe that the child has recovered

from or not been affected by the bereavement. Silverman and Worden (1993) found that 42% (53 out of 125 children) of their sample felt that they had to act in a certain way for their surviving parent's sake and of those 45 complied. All of this underlines the need for obtaining data from children themselves. It is also suggested that, since the quantitative evidence appears in places to be contradictory, qualitative research may provide useful evidence about children's experience which may shed light on what it is that proves unhelpful as well as what, then, may enable adults to better support children in these situations of loss and distress.

Aspects of the research literature reviewed underline the important issue of whether children are given a voice, whether by parents, professionals or researchers. It appears to be the case that, in the majority of instances, they are not given opportunity to speak for themselves, as, for example, in the frequent use by researchers of parent and teacher reports.

OTHER PUBLICATIONS

At regular intervals, the psychological literature has been re-visited to search for up to date studies which might supplement the review already undertaken and which, consequently, might lead to an amendment of the conclusions reached about the existing evidence. Since 1999, when the study conducted by Raveis, Siegel and Karus was published, there have been some further publications but these tend to fall into certain categories: 1) there are reviews of service provision and 2) there are reviews of the existing literature.

A good example of reviews of provision is the review commissioned by the Welsh Assembly and published by Fitz (2010) which gives an account of child bereavement service provision in Wales along with some demographic data about the incidence and patterns of childhood bereavement. An example of reviews of the existing literature is that commissioned by the

Joseph Rowntree Foundation, published by the National Children's Bureau and written by McCarthy and Jessop (2005) which, like Fitz's report, provides demographic data and describes provision as 'patchy' but also summarises the studies already discussed in this chapter, whilst pointing out that there is very little research about this issue. Rolls and Payne (2003) produced a survey of provision across the United Kingdom and identified evaluation of services as a pressing issue.

In recounting the demographics of childhood bereavement, McCarthy and Jessop observe that the statistics show that those children living in disadvantaged circumstances are more likely to experience serious and multiple losses (2005). This seems highly likely if adults in such circumstances have higher morbidity and mortality rates than those in better off circumstances. These reviewers are both sociologists and it is not, therefore, very surprising that they call for more research which takes a sociological view of children's experience since they observe that the majority of the existing studies reviewed have been conducted from a psychological perspective.

An influential study, which does take a sociological perspective, is that published by Christ (2000). Whilst Christ (2000) is particularly interested in family function as a sociological phenomenon, it is worth noting that she reports a higher incidence of depression during the phase of anticipatory grief. One of the valuable features of her study is that children were followed from a point before their relative's death until several months afterwards across a time scale of 14 months. The study included a guidance intervention for families throughout the terminal illness and death of a family member and it continued into the post bereavement phase. Christ obtained qualitative data from the participants and identified themes and categories, taking account of children's developmental stages. Christ found that most children successfully "reconstituted" their lives during the post bereavement phase studied (page 242).

An important comment made by Christ is that she concluded that healing of grief occurred through interactions (page 236).

One of the principal findings from Christ's study was that information was the most helpful element for the children studied. Those families who fared best were: 1) those who attended group support sessions; 2) those in which parents read about children's grief; 3) those who accessed individual and group counselling and 4) those where the bereaved child had a positive relationship with their surviving parent. Christ studied 157 children aged from 3 to 17 years from 88 families and, although she describes some variations between age groups, there still remains the issue of sampling a wide age range of children and young people since there are huge developmental differences across this span of 14 years. Another major issue for those seeking a psychological perspective is that the study relies upon anecdotal self-reports and parent reports rather than, as mentioned above, using psychological measures to tap into psychological constructs. However, the findings from Christ's study do reinforce the point already made, above, in referring to both Rutter (1971) and Worden (1991) that communication and family function, including the availability and the communication styles of the surviving parent are important to the bereaved children's coping (Worden, 1991).

Another study which takes a sociological perspective is Walter's account of the culture of grief (1999), to which reference has already been made, above. Walter interviewed bereaved individuals and concluded that it is the individualisation of loss which is significant. He, like Klass et al. (1996) found that some bereaved people communicate with the person lost, in a variety of ways according to gender and culture. Walter lists four ways in which such continuing bonds may enhance the life of the bereaved person: 1) the deceased may be a role model for the bereaved; 2) the deceased may give advice or guidance; 3) the deceased may

provide basic values in life that are emulated and 4) the deceased is a significant part of the life or biography of the bereaved (pages 48 and 176).

SUPPORT

In recent years, some formal support has become available but, as accounts like Fitz's report for the Welsh Assembly show, this is limited. The assumption has been that most children receive support through family and social networks (Krupnick, 1989, pp 123 and 124) but, as Krupnick points out, a child's primary source of support is usually the surviving parent who also has been traumatically affected by their partner's death. If Silverman and Worden (1993) are correct in suggesting that our society misperceives loss as an illness, it may well be that views about what can help are also inaccurate. Furthermore, it may be necessary to design different approaches to support children encountering the different varieties of experience as evidenced by the studies summarised, above.

Schneiderman, Winders, Tallett and Feldman (1994) reviewed randomised controlled studies of formal programmes and found four. Of these, only one, Black and Urbanowitz (1987) considered support for children bereaved of a parent. These authors concluded that their treatment group fared better than controls but Schneiderman et al. comment that the clinically more significant variables were not statistically different. Sandler, West, Baca, Pillow, Gersten and Rogosch (1992) initiated a theoretically based programme and found improvements for parents but not for children. Schonfield (1989) reports some case studies where support was made available but comments that the numerous requests received indicate the, "large extent of unmet need" (page 32). Some authors, for example Summers, 1993,

report on camps and other interventions which have been evaluated by participants but not objectively assessed. Zambelli and DeRosa (1992, page 485) conclude that, "little has been established about the efficacy of the approach". The phrase, "objectively assessed" is used in this context to mean that some kind of assessment measures is used by someone other than the bereaved participants themselves. Whilst it is very important that participants provide some indication of how helpful or otherwise such programmes are for themselves, it has to be recognised that funding agencies look for assessment which has employed measures previously demonstrated to be reliable as research instruments.

Barnes McGuire, Stein and Rosenberg (1997) discuss the trend towards evidence based health care with particular reference to clinical practice in the provision of child mental health services and argue for quasi-experimental designs and qualitative measures. Sandler et al. (1992), amongst others, see child bereavement support programmes as serving a preventive function. It has been suggested that, "There is no evidence that counselling for the recently bereaved has significant benefits for mental health" (National Health Service Centre for Research and Dissemination, 1997). An important question for professionals when evaluating such suggestions is whether these statements mean that no evidence is available about the particular topic or that research *has* been undertaken which demonstrates that interventions were not helpful. Determining whether such interventions are effective or not could, in either case, supply useful evidence about the wisdom or otherwise of investing resources in support programmes or in individual help as well as in making informed decisions about what sort of health care professionals are involved in the operation of services.

THE EVIDENCE STILL NEEEDED.

Although approximately 5% of children (Kliman, 1979) are bereaved of one of their parents before they reach the age of 18, there seems to be comparatively little research evidence

available about the effects of such bereavement. There is some *retrospective* evidence that the death of a parent may be a factor in some cases of depression both in adolescence and in adult life and in some cases of delinquent behaviour in adolescence. (Finkelstein, 1988; Harris, Brown and Bifulco, 1986; Tennant, Bebbington and Hurry, 1980; Brown, Harris and Copeland, 1977; Bendiksen and Fulton, 1975 and Roberts and Gotlib, 1997). Such evidence needs to be considered in the light of the research carried out by Rutter (1971) because the implicit question in considering such retrospective research is whether it was the fact of the death or other factors such as family function or how the traumatic event was handled by those around the bereaved child or adolescent that led to the difficulties experienced. This underlines both the need for a transactional approach to development and Garmezy's suggestion that the search for processes implicated in adaptive development may well be served best by longitudinal investigations (1988). Those involved in any way with children's experience of bereavement or involved in any way with child and adolescent mental health will want to know what evidence is still needed and how it may be obtained.

There is a third avenue of communication needed in this situation. Newson (1992, pages 89-107) has pointed out that, for troubled children, "the *essential* communication" is with themselves and not with those seeking to help them. Historically, counsellors, analysts and therapists have sought to interpret what they hear and see to those that they seek to help. Whatever medium is being employed, whether children are engaging in role play, sand play, playroom activity, drawing or any other activity, it may be that the most helpful approach, in a support group or in one to one counselling, is to allow the person to interpret to themselves. One of the issues raised by the study is the extent to which guidance from adults may be needed to facilitate that process. This, of course, refers back to the ideas formulated by Vygotsky (1934; 1978). One of the crucial features of his research investigations and of his

endeavours in attempting to construct an overall theory for psychology was the focus upon process rather than outcome alone (Cole et al., 1978). This explains his dissatisfaction with both behaviourist and humanist psychology and his determination to study "culture and consciousness" as human functions in which psychological tools are instrumental (Kozulin, 1986, page xv). It seems reasonable to suggest that Newson's (1992) estimation of the child's communication with herself as being essential fits appropriately with Vygotsky's assertion that "Every function in the child's cultural development appears twice: first, on the social level, and later, on the individual level; first, *between* people (*interpsychological*) and then *inside* the child (*intrapsychological*)" (1978, page 57).

CONCLUSION

One inevitable conclusion seems to be that there is a dearth of research which uses psychological measures to assess either the impact of childhood bereavement or the benefit of more formal support. It also seems clear that there is little of that more formal support available. In terms of research methods, it seems reasonable to suggest that there is a need for investigations which look at process as well as outcome; again, this would apply to both impact and support. In this respect, qualitative investigations will probably be helpful in exploring what happens in those processes of recovery. Whilst prospective, longitudinal, studies would be ideal, there are obvious difficulties in setting up such research and it is likely that palliative care contexts are the only feasible prospects for operationalising such studies. This, of course, would exclude the prospective study of the impact of sudden, unexpected, death. A major issue is the question of the sensitivity of any research involving children and even more so of research which involves bereaved children. It can be argued that the dearth of studies which fit the criteria outlined, above, is due principally to this question of the sensitivity of the topic and, above all, to the understandable protective feelings of adults

towards children in situations of loss. It could, consequently, be argued, also, that this protective feeling, on the part of adults, supports the working hypothesis of this study.

This chapter underlines the importance of studying communication as a psychological tool (again following Vygotsky's theory) since it provides a means of studying consciousness and the development of new understanding (Kozulin, 1986) and the review of empirical evidence reinforces the view that there is a need for further qualitative research which explores children's experience of bereavement.

Chapter 4

Methods and Methodology

In this chapter, for the sake of giving a clear account of the rationale for decisions made about methods, each of the two aspects 'methods' and 'methodology' will be addressed in turn. It is true that different authors use these two terms in varying senses but the differentiation made here is between *method* as denoting the account of how an investigation has been carried out and *methodology* as denoting the influence of underpinning theoretical perspectives or paradigms upon choices about strategy and techniques for operationalising the research.

The *method* chosen for this study was a semiotic analysis framed by Freire's work in combination with some of the helpful recurring ideas found in the literature about semiotic analysis. The *methodology* informing the study was the theoretical work of Vygotsky which advocates the study of psychological tools rather than the application of behaviourist or phenomenological approaches to the investigation of human consciousness. These two statements put the case very simply indeed but the rest of this chapter will hopefully develop the argument in such a way as to amplify with sufficient clarity the position taken.

METHODS

Chapter 1 explained that the overarching *method* for the entire thesis is provided by the concepts proposed by Freire for critical pedagogy (1972). The reasons given there were that this approach simultaneously: a) provided a specific framework for analysing texts but b) also resonated as potentially helpful not only for reflecting on the issues relevant to questions from adults but also for deciding how to investigate the postulated semiotic mediation taking place as a result of bereaved children's participation in the support service. It was felt, also, that Friere's ideas would allow for the operation of the subjectivity of the researcher in conducting the investigations as well as for the exploration of expressions of the subjective consciousness of participants.

The term 'theoretical framework' has been avoided in this thesis, which has been supervised within a faculty (subsequently re-named 'college') of health and social care. During a period of some decades, the use of the term 'theoretical framework' has been problematical in the disciplines represented in that faculty because no agreed meaning has been accepted by academics and practitioners, even within one discipline. Some have understood the term to mean 'method' as defined here whilst others have understood it to mean what, in this thesis, is defined as 'methodology'. In addition to those two meanings, some authors have employed the same term in several other, different, ways. For this reason, it was decided that avoiding the term would reduce the potential for confusion and misunderstanding.

The researcher considered that using the concepts from Freire (1972) as a general framework would be helpful in giving an overall structure and some guidance to the endeavour but that it would also allow sufficient freedom for the exploration of the particular types and instances of communication that were to be examined. In searching for any pre-existing framework which might provide an appropriate method, some consideration had been given to specific discourse analytic methods but there was a sense that Parker (1992) and others working for the development of critical psychology had adopted a political stance which might not be relevant or helpful in the context of childhood bereavement. This is not a hidden ideological position on the part of critical psychologists but rather an overt recognition and deliberate choice based on their feeling that discourse analysis is not only about identifying discourses and tracing the ways in which internal mental processes are expressed in social communication but ought also to be "politically useful" (Parker, 1992, page 17).

In saying that "we need to go a little further to make the analysis politically useful" (1992, page 17), Parker suggests that research should focus upon three other aspects of discourse in addition to the first seven criteria outlined in his approach. These three extra aspects are:

institutions, power and ideology. Whilst recognising that human beings are sometimes oppressed in social relationships and that this may well result in a lack of freedom in their communication with others and with themselves, it seems that the specific issue of communication with bereaved children involves other aspects than the three extra aspects to discourse analysis suggested by Parker. This view strengthened the intention to take an eclectic approach to the analysis of relevant texts rather than employing a rigid and prescriptive method.

Thus, the question prompted by a consideration of approaches advocated by those working within critical psychology is whether deconstructionist discourse analysis has focussed too much upon issues of power and ideology without exploring to the same extent the facilitative use of discourse. This question has already been introduced in Chapter 1 of this thesis but is mentioned again, here, in the context of methods, in order to underline the multiplicity of purposes served by the choice of methods across the investigations conducted. In that chapter, also, it was pointed out that 'discourse' is taken to mean the ways in which language is used to communicate interpersonal meaning or affect social relations rather simply to communicate ideational meaning or impart information (Halliday, 1978) or, as Mercer puts it, "the ways in which language, spoken or written, is used in the social practices of...a community" (Mercer, 1996).

In terms of operationalising Freire's concepts as a method, an attempt was made, in the case of each investigation, as it was conducted and reported, to map any findings and conclusions to those concepts in order to show which of them were supported by each investigation. It will be seen that some investigations illustrate more than one concept. It will be seen also that, in particularly in Investigations 3, and 4, aspects of the analysis of texts map to the idea of

'subjects' and what they are allowed to say in a particular interaction. The contention of this thesis is that the sign systems evident in those texts do not reproduce oppressive power relations and, therefore, challenge the understanding of 'discourse' as used in critical psychology. It is, however, also suggested in this thesis that each 'text' (or the 'language') seen in those interactions is used 'to communicate interpersonal meaning or affect social relations rather than simply to communicate ideational meaning or impart information' according to the understanding of 'discourse' already mentioned in this chapter, and in Chapter 1, above (Halliday, 1978 and Mercer, 1996).

An account of each individual investigation is given in the relevant chapters. Although the specific method followed for each of the investigations may differ, the policy adopted is to try to give an account of each investigation in general accordance with the American Psychological Association's (APA) recommendations for the writing of scientific reports (2001). The giving of a separate account of each individual investigation is itself an example of that compliance with APA recommendations. The APA standard, accepted in the discipline of psychology, was obviously designed for quantitative studies but, as far as possible, the same general structure has been followed simply for the sake of clarity.

Specific techniques for gathering data included the collection and selection of narratives as well as the use of interviews, observation and questionnaires. The specific methods followed for individual investigations included: cross sectional studies (Investigation 1 and Investigation 4), naturalistic observation (Investigation 3), evaluation (Investigation 5) and an extended textual examination of eight narratives (Investigation 2). The principal method of analysis consists of semiotic analysis but this includes the use of a particular strategy for narrative analysis as well as instances of thematic content analysis.

Banyard and Hayes (1994, page 10)) use the word 'triangulation' to describe the use of "several different methods of study to investigate a phenomenon", arguing that "If several different methods of study all come up with similar implications, we may conclude that the phenomenon we are investigating is a real one". Silverman (2000, pages 98-100), on the other hand, warns that the use of multiple methods does not necessarily guarantee 'truth' and cites Hammersley and Atkinson (1983, page 199) to advise against adopting "a naively 'optimistic' view that the aggregation of data from different sources will unproblematically add up to produce a more complete picture".

METHODOLOGY

At the beginning of this chapter, a differentiation was made between *method* as denoting the means of implementing a particular research study as well as the account of how an investigation has been carried out and *methodology* as denoting the influence of underpinning theoretical perspectives or paradigms upon choices about strategy and techniques for operationalising the research.

The inspiration for the methodological standpoint underpinning this study can be found in Vygotsky's account of his attempts to define the methodological focus of psychological study as being beyond both behaviourism and humanism and the need for its methods to reflect that focus by studying socially meaningful activity as the generator of consciousness, learning and change. It is argued here that this standpoint lies beyond the debates in recent years concerning paradigms.

Morgan (2007) points out that, "Paradigms have become a central concept in social science research methodology" (page 49). He traces the roots of this development to the work of Kuhn (1996; 1962) and to the work of Guba (1978), Guba and Lincoln (2005) and Lincoln and Guba (1985) but argues cogently not only that there is a need to challenge the paradigm which is currently dominant (which he calls the 'metaphysical paradigm') but also that there is a need to abandon the use of the word 'paradigm' itself.

Morgan's argument is summarised here very briefly indeed. He argues that Kuhn actually used several meanings of the word 'paradigm' and that Kuhn later acknowledged this himself. Morgan refers to Masterman's claim (1970) that he located "more than twenty ways" in which Kuhn used the term (Morgan, page 50). Lincoln and Guba (1985; 1988) compared the positivist paradigm with "a competing paradigm they called 'naturalistic enquiry" (or 'constructivism' or 'interpretivism'). They later extended the list to encompass five paradigms (2005). Morgan suggests that non-positivist paradigms have come to be the dominant influence in social science research and calls this "the metaphysical paradigm" (page 48) but argues: a) that the term paradigm has become unhelpful since it is understood in such a variety of ways; b) that the 'metaphysical' paradigm is exhausted and c) that there is now a need for a 'pragmatic' approach to social science research. Morgan's belief is that social scientists need to focus on methodology as the central factor between epistemology and methods and he argues, as part of this general appeal for an alternative to the previous approaches, that social scientists should employ a pragmatic approach whereby the decisions made about methods are based upon: actual behaviour or ("lines of action"); the beliefs behind those actions ("warranted assertions") and the consequences likely to follow those behaviours ("workability") (page 67).

Morgan's argument seems quite appealing. It does appear that, at times, social science researchers seem constrained to declare their allegiance to a particular 'paradigm' when, in their research practice, they may not actually see themselves as 'signed up' in a partisan way to any particular 'ism' such as constructivism or post-positivism. Morgan asks who it is who gets to define and label the allegiances (page 61) and argues (2007, page 73) that, there is still a "need to acknowledge and pursue the epistemological implications of our broader approach to social science research" and that one of the strengths of a pragmatic approach "is its emphasis on the connection between epistemological concerns about the nature of the knowledge we produce and technical concerns about the methods that we use to generate that knowledge" (page 73).

In the light of this argument propounded by Morgan (2007), it is the researcher's intention, throughout the thesis, to reserve the use of the term 'paradigm', as far as possible, to the sense in which it is used in semiotic analysis. In semiotics, 'paradigmatic' analysis considers the functioning or 'vertical' axis of a text and is concerned with associations of signifiers, signifieds and signs (or any combination of them) by which they each are seen to be members of some defining category (Chandler, 2007).

ONTOLOGY AND EPISTEMOLOGY

In this section, an attempt is made to apply Morgan's argument to the present study. Parker (1992) gives a helpful and clear account of the opposing positions of materialism and idealism. It could be argued that these positions are reflected in the two dominant paradigms discussed by Morgan. Parker goes further, however, in describing the "realist" position which has emerged in psychology with its recognition of the existence of social as well as material reality and the connection between the two studied by means of the turn to language (1992,

page 1 and page 22). This social reality cannot be "broken down" into bits; a human being is seen as a complex of interacting structures (page 26) which is capable of self-monitoring. There seem to be echoes here of Vygotsky's attempts to define the real focus of psychological study (1934; 1978). Sutton (1983) has given an excellent account of Soviet developmental psychology but his account, it can be argued, misses, like most Western interpretations of Vygotsky's thinking, the real difference that Vygotsky was pointing to in his rejection of both: a) materialism, both in the form of behaviourism and in a facile, "wrong", application of Marxism (that is, of course, of dialectical *materialism*) to the study of "the higher mental functions" (1934/1986, page xxiii) *and* b) 'philosophical' and humanistic psychology which, according to Kozulin (in Vygotsky, 1934/1986, page xxi) can be "grouped around the phenomenological paradigm". The comments which follow draw principally from Kozulin's (1986) account since it maintains the subtleties and nuances of Vygotsky's thinking but does so with considerable clarity and cogency.

Vygotsky saw that a potential danger in making consciousness the focus of psychological study is that this could lead to "the return to introspective mentalistic psychology" (Kozulin, 1986, page xxiii). He argued that: "if one is to take consciousness as a subject of study, then the explanatory principle must be sought in some other layer of reality" (Kozulin, 1986, page xxiii). His suggestion was that "socially meaningful activity... may play this role and serve as a generator of consciousness" (Kozulin, 1986, pages xxiii and xxiv). Western interpreters have often misrepresented this concept as simply a recognition of the importance of culture and environment upon development but a careful reading of *Thought and Language* shows that the idea amounts to more than that. Vygotsky's idea is that social interaction is the *generator* of consciousness, learning and change. The essence of the concept is that the

evidence of human consciousness which is clearest and the most amenable to study is found in instances of social communication.

Vygotsky used words often translated as 'mediator' and 'mediated' to describe the function of communication in generating consciousness, learning and change. In the West, these terms are associated with behaviourist ideas of stimulus and response. As Cole et al. (1978) point out, this is not the idea which Vygotsky's original text sought to convey. The idea that the words were really intended to convey is that signs, whether "actions" or "language", function as instruments for mastery of the stimulus situation and of one's own behaviour (1978, page 26). Vygotsky states this very clearly in the chapter called *Tool and Symbol in Child Development* (1978, page 26) when he writes: "using what we speak of as instrumental or mediated (indirect) methods".

In passing, it seems worth raising the question of the extent to which these ideas may be applied from the individual to the social level. It actually seems to be perfectly consistent with Vygosky's thinking to suggest that, if social communication is the instrument for generating consciousness, learning, change and development at the individual level, it may also be the case at the level of groups and their cultures as they engage in collective communication. One could speculate whether, in fact, this parallels Freire's ideas of conscientization (1972). Vygotsky's concept of 'mediation' includes the notion that, when operating at the level of the higher mental functions, that is to say, developing consciousness by using psychological tools, an individual modifies a situation "as part of the process of responding to it" (Cole et al., 1978, page 14). Bakhtin (1981) was a contemporary of Vygotsky's and also interested in language. Like Vygotsky, Bakhtin rejected Saussure's idea of an opposition between the social and the individual which was an aspect of Saussure's concept of *langue* and *parole* as

two distinct aspects of language. Again, like Vygotsky, Bakhtin preferred the idea of there being an interaction between the individual and the social.

To summarise the above account, then, in terms of ontology, epistemology and methodology in the context of this study:

1) Ontology or the nature of reality

The reality which forms the focus of this study is not that chemical, physical or biological reality, including biologically based behaviour, which is the object of materialistic study. Neither is it that phenomenological reality which Vygotsky calls 'philosophical' and Morgan (2007) calls 'metaphysical' and which he claims currently forms the predominant focus of the study of social scientists. The reality studied here is the use of psychological tools whether that be via activity/practice or social communication (recognising that the two may, in some circumstances be synonymous).

Both of these types of psychological tools are included on the basis that they both "have a semiotic nature" (Kozulin, 1986, page xxv). This proposition of Vygotsky's has for decades been a source of controversy in what was Soviet psychology but the controversy can be traced to the need for political correctness during the Stalin years when scientists were obliged to relate everything to work (Sutton, 1983). Unfortunately, this distortion of Vygotsky's ideas resulted not only in an oversimplification of his theory of social communication as a means for mastery but also in his colleagues distancing themselves from him when aspects of his efforts to develop a theory of 'general psychology' came to be seen as heretical by the Party (Kozulin, 1986, pages xliii to liv).

2) Epistemology or the nature and source of knowledge

The observations and 'experiments' (Vygotsky, 1978) conducted by Vygotsky and his associates examined phenomena such as memory, the acquisition of language and the development of cognition. Vygotsky's real focus, however, was to study the way in which human beings use psychological tools to master their environment in a way that parallels the use of material tools to master the natural environment. In fact, Vygotsky (1978) believed that, since animals use material tools, it is the use of psychological tools which distinguishes human beings from them. Cole et al. (1978, page 8) draw upon Vygotsky's unpublished notebooks to show his intention to "find the key to psychology as a whole" by analysing single 'psychological cells' ("the mechanism producing even a single response") in the same micro-anatomical manner which Marx had used to analyse capitalist society (1920).

Vygotsky claimed that his focus of study did not belong to "philosophical psychology" or idealism because the higher or "cultural" functions (Kozulin, 1986, page xxv) are based upon a "radical transformation of the lower functions" (Kozulin, 1986, page xxv) which are the building blocks of the higher functions. 'Lower' functions such as "elementary perception, memory, attention and will" (Kozulin, 1986, page xxv) are natural mental functions located in material reality and therefore "can be apprehended by ordinary empirical methods" (Kozulin, 1986, page xxv). The higher functions have to be studied outside of the individual since the "constructive principle... lies outside the individual – in psychological tools and interpersonal relations" (Kozulin, 1986, page xxvi).

The core concept in the epistemological stance of this thesis is Vygotsky's concept of understanding being generated by semiotic mediation and that, if this is the case, the development of understanding may be mirrored in the process of generating knowledge

through the research process. It is the researcher's view that this is, in fact, the case since, in this study, the knowledge acquired about psychological tools employed in adult-child interactions and about communication styles has been generated as a result of dialogue taking place between himself and the respondents and also between himself and the data obtained.

3) **Methodology or the nature of the influence of underpinning theoretical perspectives or paradigms upon choices about strategy and techniques for conducting research.**

Schaffer (1996) has listed the characteristics of scientific research as: empirical, systematic, controlled, quantitative and public. This list, of course, was compiled by a (much respected) scholar who has contributed significantly to the discipline of psychology. Traditional psychology in the West shares this view of the characteristics of scientific research. The 'gold standard' of that tradition is the randomised controlled trial (RCT). Many health care practitioners currently subscribe to the view that there are hierarchies of evidence that research can provide and the RCT, along with systematic review of RCTs and meta-analysis sits at the pinnacle. Quantitative methods tend to be used to obtain and evaluate indicators for practice. Allocation of funds often depends upon whether such indicators can demonstrate benefit and, sometimes more importantly, economic superiority. Qualitative methods tend to be used for exploratory investigations and are associated with the younger disciplines and professions. In some quarters, qualitative methods are still not seen as 'scientific'.

Vygotsky's recipe for research methods is even broader than that advocated by Morgan (2007) and contrasts strikingly with the traditional Western view of scientific research. Quoting, again, and this time at some length, from Kozulin (1986, page xxxix):

> "Moreover, from The Psychology of Art on, Vygotsky refused to consider experimentally elicited behaviour or mental operations as the sole legitimate material

for psychological research. He emphasised that psychological enquiry is akin to criminal investigation, relying on circumstantial, indirect evidence; in such roundabout investigation, works of art, manifestations of unconscious and anthropological data, play no less important role than direct responses. .. His... concern with semiotic means of psychological mediation were innovative but they challenged the accepted views of the discipline of psychology".

The analogy between criminal investigation and psychological enquiry (or any social science investigation) seems apt: criminal investigators, and juries, rely on the evidence of witnesses and on circumstantial evidence as well as upon forensic, that is to say 'factual' evidence.

In the light of this methodological stance, it seemed justifiable to employ a variety of 'methods' for the implementation of this study in a way that has been in keeping with making psychological tools the focus of investigation. The specific methods were listed earlier in this chapter. It is suggested that all of the methods share the same objective which is the identification, analysis and evaluation of instances of social communication in the context of children's experience of bereavement.

ACCOUNT OF METHOD

The intention was stated, earlier in this chapter, of trying, as far as possible, to follow the American Psychological Association's (APA) recommendations for the writing of scientific reports (2001). It would be usual practice, in a typical research report, to give a factual account of the method under the headings: design; participants; ethical issues; resources; procedure; results; analysis and discussion. Since this information is supplied in the appropriate chapters reporting each of the investigations, the researcher has decided not duplicate in this chapter the material which is supplied elsewhere.

Whilst ethical aspects and issues pertinent to each of the investigations are addressed in the relevant chapters of the thesis, the question of the researcher's approach to the NHS research

ethics committees for their approval and the process that was followed in obtaining that approval for the whole study *is* included here rather than repeating the account in reporting each investigation. As well as avoiding unnecessary repetition, the account of that process also provides the opportunity to explore and reflect upon aspects of the communication with ethics committees which seem relevant to the whole study and are considered by the researcher to be potentially helpful in portraying a complete picture of the research process undertaken in producing this thesis. For this purpose, a reflective analysis of that experience has been composed and, as usual in such work, the first person has been used to present this section.

A reflective analysis of communication between the researcher and various research ethics committees.

INTRODUCTION

As an essential part of setting up a study of children's experience of bereavement, I sought approval from a number of National Health Service Research Ethics Committees. I had been prepared for legitimate concern to protect children and their families from unethical research practice amongst members of such committees and, in fact, of course, would have been very concerned not to have encountered appropriate and responsible attitudes. However, some of my experiences during that phase of the project led me to reflect on the fact that some responses seemed to go beyond my expectations in their protectiveness.

This chapter consists of a reflective analysis of that response and implicitly, therefore, of the communication that I had with some of the bodies approached. Two National Health Service (NHS) Local Research Ethics Committees (LREC) granted permission for the longitudinal study to be conducted in their areas and I acknowledge here without reservation their

understanding and help. I consider it appropriate not to identify in this chapter any of the bodies by name; I include both those bodies that granted permission as well as those that did not within this decision to maintain confidentiality about their location since this also affects the right to confidentiality of service users.

I have used Gibbs' (1988) model of reflection as a means of giving structure to my account of this experience although I have not followed Gibbs' six phases completely since the purpose of this chapter does not 'fit' precisely with all of those phases. Gibbs' six phases are: description of what happened; discussing one's feelings and thoughts about what happened; evaluating what was good and bad about the experience; analysis; conclusion and action plan. The first five of these phases are, perhaps, the most helpful for the present purpose since I shall not be applying again for permission to conduct the particular study already referred to, above, and, in view of that fact, I shall not need to prepare an extensive action plan.

NARRATIVE/EVENTS

Permission was being sought from the committees for the study reported by means of this thesis but also for a study which was to be conducted in the same support service as that described in Chapter 7. The aims of that investigation were:

1. To determine the effects of parental bereavement on children of primary school age by comparing data obtained at Time 1 (pre-bereavement) with measures taken at Time 2 (6 months post-bereavement) and by comparing an age matched non-bereaved group.

2. To investigate whether such effects persist over time.

3. To gather information about factors that might predict changes over time using Time 1 results in comparison with those obtained at Time 2 and Time 3 (18 months post bereavement).

The research instruments to be employed for data collection included: 1) completion of a questionnaire by parents only and 2) a brief interview with each child using a version of Burnett and Middleton's (1997) grief questionnaire modified by me from questionnaire format into a game format.

A power calculation (Cohen, 1988) had enabled me to determine that the optimum sample of bereaved children for the purposes of fulfilling the quantitative aims would be 44 children. The intention was to seek permission from a number of palliative care services to invite families to participate in the research. My expectation was that it would be difficult to recruit this number from one palliative care service alone. For this reason, I decided to apply to a regional research ethics committee for permission to approach the spouses of palliative care patients. It must be pointed out that this decision making process was taking place before the changes which occurred in March, 2004, when the Central Office for Research Ethics Committees, COREC, (now known as NRES: National Research Ethics Service) system was instituted. (It actually took more than two years to set up the study and begin collecting data). The situation which obtained before that date was that researchers wishing to conduct an investigation in more than five areas had to apply to a regional research ethics committee for permission. I am not identifying the particular region of the United Kingdom here. Although no patients would be approached or involved in any way in the project, it was considered right to seek NHS research ethics committee approval because 1) the families would become known to the researcher via the palliative care services and 2) the families would be known to those services because their relative with a palliative care diagnosis would have been referred to them whilst under the care of NHS consultants. Out of more than thirty palliative care services in the region, only one was actually a National Health Service facility. Of the entire number of agencies approached, eight agreed to take part if research ethics committee

approval could be obtained and a further two expressed interest but wanted to ascertain whether the project overlapped in any way with other studies being conducted in their area. This meant that only five or six volunteers would need to be recruited from each area in order to achieve the sample needed.

I completed the forms required by the committee and supplied a copy of the protocol that had been successfully submitted to the university's research degrees committee, the psychology department's research ethics committee (which adhered to the British Psychological Society's 1992 document *Ethical Principles for Conducting Research with Human Participants*) and the university's research ethics committee. I also supplied copies of participant invitation letters, information sheets and consent forms following the regional committee's own outlines of what should be included in those documents. At a point more than a year after the application process had started, the regional committee finally informed me that they were not prepared to give their approval to the project. In the intervening months, even though I had supplied the documentation listed, above, I had been engaged in a monthly process of 1) receiving requests from the committee for further clarification, 2) sending more documents supplying further clarification and then 3) receiving letters from the committee with more questions about which they requested more documentation supplying yet further clarification. When the regional committee finally wrote to me with their decision, I decided to apply to two local research ethics committees and was successful in obtaining their approval. My thinking by this time was that I would eventually be able to recruit the sample needed for the study by seeking a greater number of volunteers from each site.

By the time the committee's decision was given, I had, in response to a succession of requests that they had made to me for support systems to be in place for any children distressed by the

research, the stand-by support of: the regional director of CRUSE Bereavement Care; a clinical child psychologist and a counsellor specifically trained and qualified for working with bereaved children. It need not be emphasized how much time it had taken for the services of these professionals to be negotiated and planned. The only further comment that I make at this point in relation to these arrangements is that all of these requests were made in spite of the fact that my own clinical qualification is in nursing and that one of the particular areas that I taught to health and social care professionals over a period of twenty two years was communication, including the application of communication skills in the field of counselling.

The regulations for COREC applications which came into effect in March, 2004, stipulate that there may be only one request for further clarification and that a decision must be given within sixty days of the application being discussed by the committee. The sixty day 'clock' is stopped if further clarification is requested. Applicants are encouraged to meet the committee to discuss their proposal, if they wish. I had suggested that such a meeting might be helpful to the regional committee that I dealt with but was told that this practice was not allowed by that committee. Obviously, I welcomed the March 2004 changes to the system that were introduced in the creation of COREC.

For the purposes of this analysis, rather than reproduce a vast quantity of documentation, I have simply selected key texts from the forms that I completed and from the further correspondence I engaged in with the regional committee, already mentioned, as well as with committees other than the regional committee, who also did not give approval, along with some texts from oral communication with those bodies.

TEXTS

The application forms that various committees sent to me resemble one another quite closely and so, unless otherwise indicated, most of the extracts here are from the forms completed by me for the regional committee already referred to, above. In order to see the texts in context, it is necessary to access the electronic version of the form which is now only available via the Integrated Research Application System at www.myresearchproject.org.uk; this form can only be viewed on-line.

The texts analysed here were selected by means of the practice, described by Hollway and Jefferson (2000), of exploring connotations by using subjective responses. Another way of describing this practice is to say that researchers select what is noticeable to them as having some weight of meaning.

The role of the texts selected was to provide, as a result of semiotic analysis, some evidence of what signs were operating in the communication that took place in the approval application process. The use of the subjective impressions and judgment of the researcher in this reflective analysis matches the principle employed in the methods of analysis adopted for the investigations forming part of this study. The practice of looking at connotations is also congruent with Chandler's suggested criteria for semiotic analysis.

The texts from the application forms are:

1. "Medical research is important" [first words of the document]

2. "Human subjects" [page 1 and so throughout]

3. "In such cases the names and professions of those conducting the critique should be provided" [page 2]

4. "Researchers should seek permission to contact the GP of volunteers to ensure the acceptability of participation in a study" and "Where a GP indicates that participation is unacceptable, the volunteer should not participate in the study" [page 5]

5. "If the research subject is a hospital patient the permission of the consultant responsible for the patient should also be sought" [page 5]

71

6. "They have been counselled and do not wish to involve their parents" [page 7]

7. "It is in the best interest of the child to participate. It is the responsibility of the health professional attending the child to make this judgment" [page 7]

8. The committee would "regard it as unwise for a researcher to allow the participation of a child in a project where parental consent was not forthcoming" [page 7]

9. "Any initial approach to a subject should usually be from a person whom the subject knows" [page 8]

10. "Information, anonymised or aggregated whenever possible, may be used for research purposes by or on behalf of the NHS, without the express consent of the patient" [page 8]

11. "drugs, medicines, appliances or medical devices" [page9]

12. The proportion of the document devoted to medical terminology and issues compared with proportion of the document devoted to non-medical research [all pages]

13. "All forms must be completed and signed by the Project Supervisor and normally also by the Responsible Consultant/GP" [from a local form where my application was also unsuccessful]

14. "The Committee requires the provisions of the Guidelines of the Association of the British Pharmaceutical Industry … to be followed" [from a local form where my application was also unsuccessful]

15. "Members also wished to be informed of the degree of GP involvement to be obtained during the recruitment process for this study" [A text from correspondence and personal communication]

16. "It was considered unadvisable for children to be subjected to such questioning since this was bound to cause them distress". The universal assumption was that children would be distressed by being interviewed about their experience.

FEELINGS

The main feeling engendered by the process of applying to this particular regional committee

was one of frustration. The time delay alone caused great frustration but this was compounded

by an apparent lack of understanding about important issues in spite of numerous

clarifications. There seemed, for example, to be a lack of understanding about qualitative

research methods and also about quasi-experimental designs (Campbell and Stanley, 1966).

The study reported by means of this thesis was to be conducted simultaneously and employs

qualitative data collection methods. A further source of frustration was that sometimes it appeared that committees hadn't actually read properly the documentation that I sent to them. An example of this was that I had sent to a committee a copy of the parent questionnaire marked in bold type and large font, "To be completed by parents only". I subsequently received back from the committee a letter explaining that they felt very strongly that some of the questions were "completely unsuitable" to ask children and that to do so would be completely unethical.

EVALUATION

I am aware of some notorious instances of research studies which have been conducted in ways which did not protect participants from harm and/or were subject to real bias of some type or another and so I can see very clearly that it is good, to say the least, that there are such bodies as research ethics committees to ensure that those who participate in research are not abused, manipulated or harmed and that their human rights are protected completely. I cannot emphasize too strongly that I am completely in agreement that there should be appropriate regulation of research to ensure that it is conducted according to ethical standards.

However, in my own experience of applying for approval to some of the committees I approached, the aspects of that process that seemed unhelpful were: the delays, the apparent lack of understanding of some fundamental research methods issues, the clear failure, in some instances, to have even read properly the documentation that I had spent a great deal of time carefully preparing and the unwillingness on the part of some committees to agree to meet people involved in the research in order to clarify issues and thereby reduce delay.

Fortunately, much of this has been resolved by the institution of the COREC procedures (2004). Nevertheless, I find myself wondering whether the improvement of administrative procedures has been matched by improvements in awareness and understanding of a) qualitative approaches to research; b) quasi-experimental designs for quantitative research projects and c) the real responses of children to being given the opportunity, by responsible people, to talk about their own experience.

The question of what could be done differently must then be considered. As mentioned already, above, the new procedures such as the 60 day clock, the limit of one request for clarification and the welcoming of researchers meeting committees should be continued and protected. Other measures which I think would help would be 1) to look carefully at the composition of committees to determine whether there is, in fact, any bias towards what could be called the 'bio-medical' model and 2) to consider the nature of training and updating which is offered to members of such committees even after the March 2004 improvements.

ANALYSIS AND RESULTS

The analysis of the above texts was conducted according to Vygotsky's concept of psychological tools in order to identify those tools, in the form of words and phrases, which carried some particularly noticeable weight of meaning.

Those which struck me as having weight of meaning are listed, below and they include some which have connotations, in the semiotic sense, of Friere's idea of 'objects' and 'subjects' (Chandler, 2007). It will be argued that some objects are constituted in these texts which although expressed as 'objects' also actually contain implications of some 'subject' realized elsewhere in the texts by means of the rights of some person or body to speak or act in ways

74

which remove from or deny that right to others. A further complication here is that the texts use the word 'subject' to mean someone who participates in a research project whereas this thesis normally refers to a 'subject' in the sense in which Freire (1972) uses the word.

1) **Objects**

Without attempting to exhaust *all* of the objects referred to in these texts, the principal objects relevant to the reflective analysis are listed here with the number of the text from which they are taken in parenthesis:

"Medical research" [1]

"Human subjects" [2]

"volunteers" [4]

"research subject" [5]

"hospital patient" [5]

"They" [6]

"counseled" [6]

"best interest" 7]

"child" [7]

"this judgment" [7]

"a child" [8]

"parental consent" [8]

"a subject" [9]

"information" [10]

"research purposes" [10]

"the NHS" [10]

"the patient" [10]

"drugs, medicines, appliances or medical devices" [11]

Prevalence of medical terminology [12 and passim]

"the Association" [14]

"children" [16]

"such questioning" [16]

"distress" [16]

It was suggested, above, that the list contains some 'objects' which also actually contain implications of some 'subject' realized elsewhere in the texts by means of the rights of some person or body to speak or act in ways which remove from or deny that right to others. Another aspect of these particular objects, identified during this analysis, was that the 'objects' with implicit 'subjects' are referred to as 'objects' because to talk about them as 'objects' serves to present them as 'objective' things or processes and this serves the purposes of the discourses constructed by means of these texts. At the same time, there are 'objects' which sound like 'subjects' but are actually treated in an 'objectified' manner. 'Objects' which belong to these categories include:

A) Category 1*:*

 "Medical research" [1]

"this judgment" [7]

"research purposes" [10]

"the NHS" [10]

"the Association" [14]

B) Category 2*:*

"They" [6]

"best interest" [7]

"a child" [8]

"parental consent" [8]

"the patient" [10].

The suggestion being made here in relation to the objects listed under 'Category 1' is that these 'objects' are talked about as if they were objective bodies or functions but that they do, in fact, denote individuals or groups which have the right, or believe that they have the right, to make decisions about others and to override the decisions taken by those other individuals. The "NHS" and "the Association" are actually not inanimate objects but are composed of real human beings with their own beliefs, opinions and values.

It is also suggested that, in relation to the objects listed under 'Category 2', these objects are talked about as if they denote individuals who have the right to make decisions about their own lives or the lives of their children but that it is part of the function of the sign systems identified (see below) to reduce or deny those rights. So, for example, "They" in text 6, sounds as if it is referring to people who have the right to decide whether or not they will give consent but, when juxtaposed with the verb "counselled", it sounds more like a description of people to whom something is being done than a description of autonomous individuals. The "best interest" of a child, in text 7, sounds like something which ensures respect for the wishes of that child but the passage from which it is taken goes onto state that it is "the responsibility of the health professional attending the child to make this judgment". In text 8, the use of the phrase "parental consent" makes this sound like an objectified process rather than the expression of informed choices by responsible individuals. This is not to suggest that the process would necessarily work in such a way; the claim is that the text expresses itself in that way. The context for this interpretation is Derrida's statement that: "There is nothing

outside of the text" (1976, page 158). Similarly, the express consent of "the patient" (text 10) sounds respectful of human rights but the statement that is actually being made is arguing for the right of the NHS to use data without consent even though it has been "anonymised or aggregated" and so, implicitly, produces a contradiction.

1) Subjects.

Without attempting to exhaust *all* of the subjects referred to in these texts, the principal subjects relevant to the reflective analysis are listed here with the number of the text from which they are taken in parenthesis:

"names and professions" [3]

"the GP" [4]

"the consultant" [5]

"the health professional" [7]

"The committee" [8]

"a researcher" [8]

"a person" [9]

"the Project Supervisor" [13]

"the Responsible Consultant/GP" [13]

"The Committee" [14]

"Members" [15]

"GP" [15].

Having identified these subjects and having considered the ways in which they address the objects to which they speak, I moved on to looking at the paradigmatic aspect of the analysis (Chandler, 2007). This aspect of semiotic analysis has already been described on pages 57 and 58 of this thesis.

It seemed to me that the paradigmatic sets discernible in these texts are:

1) a medical paradigm ("the GP"; "the consultant"; "the health professional"; "the Responsible Consultant/GP" and "GP");

2) a professional paradigm ("a researcher"; "the Project supervisor"; "names and professions" and "a person" [because by "a person" the committees mean a professional already involved with the potential volunteer]) and

3) A paradigm of control ("the committee"; "The Committee" and "members").

Before moving on, to look at instances of intertextuality, I refer back to the list of objects already given, above, to suggest that the 'constructing' of those objects can be seen as supporting the paradigmatic sets identified. For example, "Medical research"; "drugs, medicines, appliances or medical devices" and the prevalence of medical terminology can be seen as objects supporting the medical paradigm. The use of such terms as "subjects" and "the patient" in ways which construct them as objects within the talk can be seen as belonging to the paradigm of control. The way in which terms such as "research purposes", "this judgment" and "such questioning" are used can be seen as constructing objects which support the professional paradigm.

Chandler (2007) maintains that the identification of intertextuality (or cross referencing between and within texts) can be a helpful feature of semiotic analysis . Intertextuality can form part of the syntagmatic aspect of semiotic analysis which is also referred to as the linear or surface aspect of the analysis. It is clear that in the texts chosen the words which denote objects and subjects refer from one set across to another. So, for example, in text 5, the object 'research subject' which, I have suggested, belongs to the paradigm of control, is mentioned with reference to the permission of the 'consultant' being sought and this term 'consultant', it

79

was suggested, supports the medical paradigm which features strongly throughout these texts. The linking reference is made by means of another object 'a hospital patient' which refers to both paradigms. Hospitals, of course, are a predominant feature of the medical world (Foucault, 2003) and the word "patient" in this context refers to the subjugated role that a person takes on in relation to the control of doctors in that setting (Parsons, 1951).

An examination of the documents from which the above texts were drawn does supply further instances of intertextuality and also of a particular sign system in the form of the extensive use of acronyms. The documents refer to Health Service Management Executive (HSME) Letters, as well as written guidance (2001) from the Department of Health (DH) and the Royal College of Physicians (RCP). Reference is made to the Declaration of Helsinki which is also, of course, a document produced by members of the medical profession. Again, no suggestion is being made here that the sentiments of any of those documents are mistaken. The argument is merely that the texts refer to other texts and that the texts referred to themselves relate to the paradigm sets identified since the terms used are managerial (control) (HSME, DH), professional (RCP) and medical (RCP and DH).

There are various assumptions within the committees' documents. They continually refer to the NHS assuming that all applicants are proposing to conduct their research on NHS premises or with NHS patients. In the instance provided by my application, the NHS committees were being used merely because we were looking for volunteers amongst the families of people who had been NHS patients and we wanted to respect the system by which the rights of those people are protected.

Another assumption is revealed by means of the language which, as already demonstrated, is exclusively that of health care and medical research. It is my contention that the language

used does not feature expressions which convey a sense of the individual and of individual human rights. There is no real sense of any awareness of the fact that there are researchers who want to gather information which reflects the experiences and perceptions of individuals in such a way as to convey an understanding of what their experience has meant to those people. Similarly, there is an absence of any sense that volunteers are *actors* in the research process as opposed to 'subjects' or, as it would be expressed in Freire's terminology 'objects' (1972).

Chandler (2007) also proposes that semiotic analysis can be assisted by identifying contradictions and oppositions in the texts. Some categories of contradiction and overlap have already been identified and discussed, above, and in addition I cite the contradiction apparent between texts 6 and 8: the former refers to a child's right to not involve their parents in their choices whereas the latter refers to the committee's view that it would be "unwise" for a researcher to allow participation by a child "where parental consent was not forthcoming".

CONCLUSION

Chandler's concept of paradigmatic analysis was used to identify 3 discrete paradigm sets operating in the texts analyzed (2007). These are: a paradigm of control; a medical paradigm and a professional paradigm. By "professional" here I mean that concept of profession whereby a group is created and maintained which excludes others and abrogates to itself certain privileges which it considers to be its prerogative and to which those outside of the group have no right. It could be suggested, for example, that a research ethics committee supports the "elite" functions of health care professions by excluding service users from its deliberations even where such a committee contains "lay members" who, although members of the general public, do not necessarily belong to a particular group of service users nor do

they necessarily understand the interests of either the service users or the researchers. The experience upon which I have reflected here has led me to the conclusion that many professional research ethics committee members share the same lack of understanding of those two groups.

Chapter 5

Investigation 1: An analysis of narratives obtained in interviews with adults who were bereaved as children

The review of child bereavement studies reported in Chapter 3 of this thesis suggested that adults at the time of those studies often did not communicate openly with bereaved children and this prompted the question of whether patterns of communication observable and/or reported in existing research are unique to a particular generation, such as children bereaved in the 1970s or 1990s. The researcher's suspicion was that it had been true for longer than just the current generation but it was decided that it would be helpful to obtain some data to determine whether this were, in fact, the case.

To fulfil this aim, a series of interviews were undertaken with adults who had been bereaved as children. The theoretical and empirical background relevant to this investigation is discussed in Chapters 2 and 3. It will be seen from those chapters that aspects of that literature such as the effects of loss upon children and the role of appropriate communication in "grief resolution", including empathic communication by professionals, are relevant to this investigation. The justification of this investigation will also be apparent from those chapters.

METHOD

1) Design.

The investigation design could be described as a narrative analysis of texts derived from a cross sectional study (Silverman, 2000) since the researcher did not return to any of the interviewees to re-interview them or obtain further data. The purpose of the interviews was to obtain narratives which might contain texts showing how adults at various periods in living memory had communicated with bereaved children. The practice, described by Hollway and Jefferson (2000), of exploring connotations by using subjective responses was applied in this investigation and this use of the subjective impressions and judgment of the researcher matches the principle employed in the methods of analysis adopted for other investigations

forming part of this study. The practice of looking at connotations is also congruent with Chandler's suggested criteria for semiotic analysis. The framework for the researcher's judgements of what was noteworthy was provided by the concepts from the work of Freire (1972) already discussed in Chapter 2, above.

Hence, the process of identifying texts for this investigation was informed by aspects of narrative analysis as described by Hollway and Jefferson (2000) who have utilised a form of narrative analysis "based on a psychoanalytic theory of the individual, namely that unconscious, as well as conscious motivations affect people's actions and accounts" (Hollway and Jefferson, 2000). The first part of this method is to "elicit stories ("not explanations nor opinions"). This first part of the method was operationalised by means of structured interviews. Other aspects of Hollway and Jefferson's method used in this investigation are aspects of their interpretive approach to the analysis of data provided by such narratives. The particular parts of Hollway and Jefferson's analytical method adopted here are: 1) the fundamental principle of focusing on what the researcher *notices* in the narrative; 2) paying attention to contradiction; 3) paying attention to omission and 4) paying attention to changes in the emotional tone (Hollway and Jefferson, 2000).

The idea of a researcher paying attention to what they 'notice' in a narrative is, of course, based on the concept of "free association" (Murray Thomas, 1992, pages 129-130) and it is suggested here that this aspect of the method, by making use of the researcher's subjective impressions, is in harmony with Freire's ideas of 'freedom' and 'naming the world' to which reference has been made in Chapter 2 of this thesis.

Sign systems were understood to consist of social communication in the form of both spoken texts and of activities following Vygotsky's belief in the relationship between action and meaning (1978) and Freire's view that praxis cannot be reduced to verbalism and activism (1972).

The actual analysis of the narratives relies upon the themes from Freire's (1972) work discussed in Chapter 2 but these are also combined with Hollway and Jefferson's method (2000) in order to contrast the use of signs with *omissions* that may be interpreted as 'silence'. The justification for this investigation is, therefore, supported by two distinct approaches:

1) Working from Hollway and Jefferson's (2000) model of narrative analysis, it has been assumed that conscious and unconscious motivations affect people's accounts and that the motivations and behaviour depicted in such accounts may reveal something of significance about the use of signs, including silence, in relation to children's grief.

2) Working from the framework based on Freire (1972), the researcher has sought to identify instances that exemplify the concepts of silence; dialogue; naming the world; subjects and objects.

2) Participants

The sample consisted of 4 adults who had all been bereaved as children. The sample was not obtained in any systematic way; a number of adults disclosed that they had been bereaved as a child and they were invited to take part in the investigation. The sample was, thus, a convenience sample arrived at serendipitously. The ages of the participants ranged from 38 to 60 years old at the time of the interviews. Thus, the accounts refer to bereavements which occurred in the late 1940s (the 60 year old) and during the decades of the 1950s, 1960s and

1970s. The ages of the respondents at the time of their childhood bereavement ranged from 4 to 10 years old

3) Ethical Issues

The informed consent of all participants was obtained and documented by means of consent forms signed by the participants. The consent form followed the model provided by the LRECs which had given their approval for the study to be carried out amongst families of NHS patients as also did the information sheet supplied to these participants before they gave their consent. All of the participants were assured that confidentiality would be maintained. Participants were also assured of their right to withdraw from the investigation at any time, although none did.

4) Resources

The only specific resources required for the interviews were a cassette recorder and cassette to tape the interviews, a transcribing machine, and a notebook and pen for the researcher to record any salient observations.

5) Procedure

Appointments were made with each participant at a time convenient for them. Interviews were conducted in the researcher's office or in a location judged by the participant as being safe and private. The only interview not conducted in the researcher's office took place in the presence of that participant's spouse. There were no telephones in the rooms to ensure that there was no interruption. A plan was outlined for the interview and the researcher made sure that tissues, water and hot drinks were available if required. After a few moments of informal conversation to allow for participants to relax, each interviewee was taken through the

schedule of prepared questions (see Appendix 2) with extra questions and comments added when clarification or elaboration was needed.

RESULTS

The interviews were transcribed and an analysis of the texts was conducted using the principles provided by Hollway and Jefferson (2000) and the concepts from the work of Freire (1972) already discussed, above. The findings are summarised below; a résumé only of each narrative is provided with some quotations from the interviews.

1) **Narrative 1**

Adult 1 was 10 years old when his mother died. He recounted to the researcher that he felt stupid because he himself wasn't told and that others, not from his family, found out before he did. He was at school on the day of his mother's heart operation. He knew that she was going to have heart surgery. He was staying with his paternal grand-mother whilst his father was still at home some distance away.

The teacher told him that his relatives had come to collect him from school. These relatives were his grand-mother and two of his aunts. He went home with them and had lunch during which one of his aunts said, "*You know that today is the day of your mum's operation?*" to which he had replied, "*Yes, but she'll be OK*". At this, both aunts burst into tears and his grand-mother "told them off". He wondered, to himself, what was going on but was then asked whether he wanted to go back to school for the afternoon lessons. "It was crafts that afternoon and you don't want to miss crafts" and so he returned to school. His relatives had told the teacher about the death of his mother and the teacher had, with good intentions, told the class.

After he had returned to school, some of the other children came over to where he was doing his craft work and one of them said something about his mother having died. He said, "*No, that's rubbish. She's gone into hospital*". They were insistent but one boy, whose father had died few months before, asked, "*Is it that you don't know or that you don't believe it?*" He did not know how to answer this question and other children said to one another, "Just leave it there". At the afternoon break, he found somewhere to be alone to try to take in what he had been told and, based upon people's reactions, realised that it was probably true. He recalls a sense of aloneness which he attributes to the fact that "nobody was giving me this information". He remembers feeling an inner sense of desolation.

"Then it was like living two lives" because "it was like playing a game". He knew but nobody had 'officially' told him the facts. Neighbours would say hello to him in the street and then burst into tears and rush away. He did not speak to anyone about what had happened. The 'game' was that everyone knew but he wasn't talking about it. After six weeks, his father eventually came to the village where he was staying. The relatives who had been around during that six weeks had felt that it was not their place to discuss the matter with him and so it was left until his father came.

It had been decided that the family should move house to the village where his grand-mother lived. His father and his older brother had come back and were staying with him at his grand-mother's house whilst preparing to move. Nothing was said during the few days before moving into the 'new' house which was about a mile away from his grand-mother's house. Once at the new house, they got involved in sorting out various practical things like curtains and so on. At one point, his father came into the room where he was helping to arrange things and said, "*You like it here don't you*?"

Child: "*Yeah, it's nice*".

 Father: "*Your mother won't be coming*".

Child: "*Yeah, I know*".

[To the interviewer: "*And I just carried on*" (that is, working)]

Father; "*You can cry if you want to*".

Child: "*I'm alright*".

[To the interviewer, again: "*And I just carried on*" (that is, working)]

To the interviewer: "*My father didn't know until the day he died how I found out... I couldn't talk to him about it. It would upset me too much to talk to him about it. But it was as much to do with being 'the fool' ... that I didn't know but everybody else in the village knew my mother was dead, on the day she died, except me. And that was just not fair. That wasn't fair at all.*"

Later on, to the interviewer, he describes how he had thought, at that time, as a child: "*If you can keep information to yourself, I'll keep things to myself. And he* [the father] *didn't know. He had asked me, and my brother had asked me over the years as I was growing up: 'How did you know?' and I would just clam up. I would say nothing*".

He hadn't gone to the funeral. "Children didn't go to funerals in those days". Although the children at school had said that his mother was dead, no one in his family had ever said the words, "Your mother has died". When, at the new house, his father had made a start in telling him ("your mother won't be coming to live here"), the child had closed down the conversation by saying "I know". Later on, his father volunteered the information that he had considered it his responsibility to tell his son about the death of his mother.

Later in the interview, he returns to the issue of the 'game of not knowing' that he played in the village. When people would say hello and go away crying, it would reinforce his sense of aloneness. He remembers feeling "*really, really, alone. That was it. That I'd have to talk about this to myself*" [because he couldn't talk to others about it].

Later, he relates hearing conversations between his father and the priest which were conducted as if he weren't there "because I'm a child".

The priest would say: 'How's [adult 1] *coping with all this? And my dad would say: 'He still won't talk about it'... and I would just walk away from their conversations as soon as they brought up this business of my mother. I can remember him asking the priest: 'Is there any way something could have happened'* [meaning something supernatural by which he had been informed of the death] *'because he knew, he knew that she'd died and he was so matter of fact when I said she's not coming to live with us here. He just didn't respond like you would expect.'*

Interviewer: *So you were there when that conversation was going on?*

Adult 1: *Yeah. I can remember once at the side of the road, in the street, in the town, that the priest asked and they were just talking over me and I just turned and looked down the street and thought 'I'm not saying anything, I'm not saying anything'.*

When asked if this internal way of dealing with things ever was externalised in any way, he relates various episodes of misbehaviour which he believes were related because it was very much out of character although emphasising that he does not see the bereavement as an excuse for his externalising behaviour. He states that a recurring feature of his life has been a reluctance to trust people and attributes this tendency to the early experience of effectively

91

being 'deceived'. He has always 'had a thing' about being the last to know about things. When that happens, he feels like that 10 year old child again. At times he feels angry.

Although he did not attend the funeral, he was taken, within the 12 months following his mother's death to visit the grave, which was about 100 miles from the village where he was living. When conversations took place about the grave or the funeral, he would not join in with them. At the same time, he was certainly grieving for his mother: "*My mother had died and I did miss her and that hurt an awful lot*".

He had experienced a sense of isolation because nobody from his family told him anything and, after finding out from others, he then spent six weeks 'playing the game' that he did not know his mother had died. His father never, in fact, spoke openly to him about the fact of his mother's death.

2) Narrative 2

Adult 2 was 7 years old when her father died. Her father had not been living with the family for four months prior to his death. Her mother did not speak about her father or his death. She told her children that he "had gone away" and that "he had left them". She and her sister, who is two years older than her, found out by other means. Of course, in the meanwhile, they had entertained thoughts of seeing him again.

She describes herself as "a very independent person" and wonders whether being independent has been her way of coping. She asks herself whether she would have been a different person than she is now if the circumstances had been different.

At the time that her father died, she remembers that "*suddenly everything was different. Relatives appeared from nowhere that we hadn't seen for ages. Everything was 'hush hush'. My mother was never in for about 3 or 4 days. We didn't know what was wrong but we knew <u>something</u> was wrong. Then, eventually, she sat us down and told us that my dad was dead and everybody started crying. I was about the only one that didn't cry. I don't think I had any concept of what death was and I wondered why they were crying, really.*

Her mother had said: "*He went to sleep with a smile on his face*" ... "*and I* [Adult 2] *said: "Well what's the problem, then?*"

It was when they moved back to their house that "*it really hit home*".

"*I'd lay the table for 5 instead of four and just burst out crying. Coming home from school with my sister, we would think we had seen him, going into a house in [X] Street and we'd run after him but then think, 'Oh, no... he's dead'.*"

Adult 2 was not allowed to attend the funeral and did not ever really have any discussions with anyone about what death means. She reports not feeling happy about a) not being allowed to attend the funeral and b) not knowing what was going on during the four days between the death and her mother speaking to her and her sisters. She doesn't recall anyone helping her and her sisters to cope with what was happening to them. In later life, she has come to believe that things happened as they did because her mother was not able to cope with her own grief. This belief is strengthened by the facts of her mother's subsequent life; "she never got over it". She seemed to change from that point on, becoming chronically depressed. Adult 2 remembers not wanting to add to her mother's grief and says: "Nobody ever talked about the fact that my father had died" [ever, from the beginning]. She and one of her sisters talked to each other. They included the fact of the death in their play as, for

example, by talking over their toy pram. She says that only her sisters understood how she felt but that there were no adults who did understand.

3) Narrative 3

This participant's father died when Adult 3 was 6 years old. An uncle told him that his dad had "gone for a long sleep". It was something like 6 to 9 months later before Adult 3 really apprehended what had occurred. He describes his mother as "kind and caring". He and his brother (who is 5 years older than him) and his mother "*didn't talk to each other about Dad dying*".

When asked whether anyone had tried to help him to cope during his childhood, he answered "not really". In adult life, he has found that the main factor in his coping has been his faith.

He describes himself as having been "profoundly" affected by his father's death. His father had died of a heart attack at the age of 42 years. Adult 3 was taken to an uncle's home where he stayed for a few weeks. He did not attend the funeral. He did not, in fact, realise that his father had died. When he was brought back to the house, his uncle said: "*Your dad's gone for a long sleep*".

To the interviewer: "*I didn't know what that meant*".

It was by a process of gradual realisation that he understood his father was actually no longer around. His mother became very depressed and the atmosphere in the home became very heavy. She took on three part time jobs just to pay the bills. At the age of 18, he himself became very depressed and was treated with anti-depressant drugs which he continued to take on prescription for the next 38 years. He finally was able to stop taking this prescribed medication in 2002 and this was a real turning point in his life. During those years he was admitted five times to psychiatric hospitals, as a voluntary patient. He has had a number of

long term relationships which he describes as all having "failed". He is now in a successful committed relationship. In his childhood, nobody ever actually said to him, "Your dad has died". He feels that his mother did her best in a very difficult situation but that nobody actually helped him. In later life, it is his spiritual experience which has helped him to overcome his problems of depression and relationship disappointments.

4) Narrative 4

This participant was 4 years old when her father died. She was eventually resident in a home for the fatherless from the age of 8 until she was 13. She describes her parents as being typical of their generation in that her father had been the breadwinner and that, whilst obviously devastated emotionally, her mother was also not prepared practically to manage in life without her husband. Her mother wouldn't ever talk about her father and Adult 4 eventually found out whatever facts she knows from her wider family. In later life, she had asked her mother why she hadn't told her about her father's death. The answer given was that her mother had thought that she "was too young". Like Adult 3, this participant had found that her faith had been a major factor in her coping. She did not have this spiritual experience until adult life.

Her father had been serving in the forces and the family were living abroad when he died. Adult 4 and her sister (3 years older) were not allowed to go to the funeral. Soon after the return to the United Kingdom, her mother had a breakdown and the two sisters spent some time living with relatives. Their mother wouldn't talk about her husband. Even as time went on, she would not talk about him or what had happened in their lives. It was not until Adult 4 was older and visited her grand-mother and her father's sister, and was able to ask them what her father had been like, that she was able to find out what he was like as a person. This

participant felt that it would have helped her if her mother had been able to talk to her about everything and has subsequently said so to her mother. Her mother's reply was: "I just thought you were too young".

An effect upon her life was an awareness of "lacking the important person" and always thinking "that I didn't have somebody to look after me" because her father had been the bread winner.

When asked what has helped her, Adult 4 says that: "The reality of God loving me has healed the loss". When asked in what ways she has been affected, she says that having to be independent has meant that she does at times have a tendency to be *over* independent. Other people's losses remind her of her loss and she then becomes emotional and as a result doesn't get on with what she ought to be doing.

Her memory of the day her father died is still very vivid. Her father used to play football on Saturday mornings and she was allowed to go and watch him. On that particular Saturday, she wasn't allowed to go.

"*We had dinner on the table and he didn't come home. Next thing I know, my mum has gone and we've gone to a friend's house and I'm sitting on a settee... over there... and everybody is over here talking and I was on my own and I don't know how I was told my dad was dead but my mum just said 'Your dad's not coming back'. So, that's how it was for me, he wasn't coming back*".

The family had been due to come back to the United Kingdom at around this time because the tour of duty was over but, after living in a few different places during the first few months,

they "*ended up not where her family was or my dad's family was but where her friends were*" [that is, her mother's friends].

She went to about five different schools and, eventually, the home for fatherless children. By this time, she had begun "*making up a story in my own mind that my dad was coming back*" when "*my mum wouldn't talk to me*".

Referring to the question of how she had coped, she replies: "*...because there wasn't any talk between us, that was just my way of coping at that time. So maybe that answers the previous question of how did I cope at that stage was to make up my own fantasy world that he was coming back and that one day he would come back and everything would be alright*"

At the age of 17, she had a realisation of the true situation:

"*...one day, when I was seventeen, it just hit me in the eyes, he was dead, flat, finished. My mum could die, flat, finished. There'd be nobody to look after me, flat, finished. I went into depression...*".

She remembers feeling angry but not knowing what to do with her feelings of anger and that this led her into trouble.

ANALYSIS

1) Silence

The principal thing that the researcher noticed from these four narratives, was that 'silence' was a common denominator to all of them. In each case, adults failed, from the best of intentions, to communicate properly with the bereaved children and these omissions constituted examples of non-communication which, in turn, created problems of communication for the children. Adult 1 decided not to talk at all about the death of his mother. Adult 2 was only able to communicate with her sisters and together they tried to

process their experience through play. Adult 3 had nobody to communicate with about his loss and, for some time, wasn't actually aware of the real nature of his loss. It is not, perhaps, surprising that he was left with such a battle against depression for so many years or that he had such difficulty in establishing and maintaining successful relationships in adult life. What may seem surprising is that he eventually found a way of overcoming both of those considerable difficulties. Adult 4 really had only herself to communicate with about her loss and her communication took the form of a kind of 'play' – the fantasy that her father was going to come back.

In addition to the actual omissions of information and explanation which can be called instances of 'silence', the euphemisms employed by adults in these narratives also constitute a variety of 'silence'. To tell a person something which isn't actually the case, seems to be effectively the same thing as not telling them at all. Euphemisms for death which feature in these narratives are: "gone away"; "he had left them"; "gone for a long sleep"; "just closed his eyes and went to sleep" and "not coming back".

2) Speaking the word of another

In a sense, although 'silence' was clearly dominating the scenario recounted by Adult 1, the concept which Freire calls 'speaking the word of another' was also at work. On one level, this bereaved child was refusing to 'play the game' inasmuch as he wouldn't let the adults know how *he* came to know that his mother had died but, at the same time, his silence about the matter could be seen as his continuation of the 'silence' that they had employed by not communicating openly with him.

3) Naming the world

Each of the bereaved children seem to have attempted to 'name their own world' but the apparently natural desire to do so appears to have resulted in communication with themselves which, since it lacked adult guidance and did not take place in a context of dialogue, resulted only in frustration, depression or isolation. Some respondents seem to have achieved the freedom to 'speak their own word' later in life or in early adult life. Three of the four respondents spoke of some kind of spiritual experience which had been profoundly helpful to them. This was not part of the interview schedule but was volunteered in the course of the interviews. It may be that Adult 2 had also derived help from a similar type of experience but that this was not elicited by the interview.

None of these children were allowed to attend the funeral. Some were not even able to talk about it. It may be that attending a funeral, and the presentation of reality which it provides, could have helped these children to 'name the world' more accurately and therefore more helpfully for the course of their grieving. It is possible that such delaying or absence of realistic perception contributed to the production of some of the features of 'disordered variants of mourning' as described by Bowlby (1980). Two of the adults describe experiences of depression (internalising behaviour) and two of them describe having got into 'trouble' of different sorts at some point following their loss (externalising behaviour).

It is interesting that all four of these adults say that they have been affected by their childhood bereavement in some way in their adult life, whether they perceive that as having been a severe effect or a comparatively minor one. Three of the respondents seemed to put across a message of having coped by being 'independent' although one of them reflected on the question of whether she had at times been too independent and said that she tries not to fall

into that trap so much nowadays. Bowlby (1980) connects independence in this context with prolonged absence of conscious grieving and it could be argued that such absence of grieving was imposed upon these children by the lack of communication that surrounded the time of their loss.

DISCUSSION

1) Summary of Findings

Four narratives have been analysed using Freire's concepts related to the contrast between 'silence' and 'dialogue'. The narratives were provided by adults who had been bereaved as children. Analysis showed that 'silence' featured in the experience of all four respondents. Three of the four clearly engaged in some type of communication with themselves or with others although the attempts to communicate did not constitute 'dialogue' as described by Freire (1972). The respondent who did not have opportunity even to attempt to communicate about his loss, appears to have experienced the most severe effects out of the four participants interviewed. All four seem to have found some means, at some stage in their lives, of resolving the difficulties which they attribute to their early experience of loss.

2) Evaluative Comments

There are, clearly, considerable limitations to any conclusions which might be drawn from this investigation. The sample consists of only four people. No claims are made for exhaustiveness or representativeness. It is interesting, however, that, without any prior knowledge, it should be the case, for all four of these adults, that silence should feature significantly in their childhood experience of bereavement. It is also interesting that other shared features occur in their narratives, such as, for example, the fact that none of them were allowed to attend the funeral.

The interview schedule seemed to work well in that it facilitated the telling of the narratives whilst also allowing for elaboration, clarification and discussion where needed. There is, perhaps, scope for further research with adults who were bereaved as children and it may be that this interview schedule would be a useful instrument in the conduct of that research. It may also be possible to design other research instruments based on aspects of these narratives for other studies with adults bereaved as children. Larger samples could be recruited to test such instruments and, hopefully, to ascertain whether the findings of this investigation are, in fact, representative or not.

The aim of this exploratory investigation was to obtain some indication of whether patterns of communication observable and/or reported *now* were unique to one specific period of time". It seems clear that the analysis of the narratives demonstrates that the 'silence' as a sign, observed and reported in other investigations which form part of this study, also operated in the lives of bereaved children in the decades of the 1950s, 1960s and 1970s.

Investigation 2: An exploration of the theme of children's grief in literature

BACKGROUND

In his comprehensive account of the nature of grief, written from a perspective which draws upon evolutionary psychology and ethology, Archer (1999, page 29)) quotes McDougall (1923) who wrote, in his *Outline of Psychology,* that "The wise psychologist will regard literature as a vast storehouse about human experience, and will not neglect to draw from it what he can" (page 9). Archer (1999) uses not only literature but also the visual arts and music to "supplement" available findings from empirical research (page 28) in his account of grief. The practical constraints upon this thesis have allowed only for a consideration of some aspects of the theme of children's grief in literature; subsequent work may allow for an exploration of this theme within the visual arts and music.

According to Kozulin (1986, page xiv - xvi), Vygotsky, in *The Psychology of Art*[1], argued that,

"psychology cannot limit itself to direct evidence, be it observable behaviour or accounts of introspection. Psychological inquiry is investigation, and like the criminal investigator, the psychologist must take into account indirect evidence and circumstantial clues − which in practice means that works of art, philosophical arguments, and anthropological data are no less important for psychology than direct evidence" (Kozulin's words paraphrasing Vygotsky's argument in *The Psychology of Art*).

Neil Gunn, a modern Scottish novelist, has one of his characters, Davidson, in *The Drinking Well* (1977; 2006) suggest that "Literature, as indeed all the arts, is in its highest form held to be an expression of what you call the unconscious. Its expression is made, of course, through the intellect, but its power derives directly from the unconscious. And the unconscious, I understand, is the sum of our past" (page 208). There will not be space here to trace the debate between modern and more 'cognitive' psychology and the older Freudian (1938) and Jungian (1953) schools of psychoanalytical psychology concerning the validity of the concept of the unconscious. It will perhaps be sufficient to say that many psychologists acknowledge

that there is some evidence for an unconscious dimension to human behaviour whilst they reject many aspects of psychoanalytical psychology and of its methods both of investigation and of therapy. Murray Thomas (1992), for example, points out the "growing interest in identifying and understanding" 'nonconscious' mental processes "within the proliferating cognitive psychology paradigms" (page 198). Such evidence relates to the phenomenon of dreams, researched by those who have investigated accounts given by people wakened when electronic traces show that Rapid Eye Movement sleep is occurring (Rauchs, 2004) and limited evidence to support some of the mental defence mechanisms (Broks, 2006).

Parker (1992, pages 45 – 63) explores aspects of the "intimate and intriguing relationship between psychology and literature, arguing that "both claim to represent the truths of mental life". He cites not only Harré (1983) in describing how the new approaches arising from "the crisis in social psychology have looked to texts as exemplars of experience" (Parker, 1992, page 46) but also Wetherell, Potter and Stringer, "Texts cannot be taken as straightforward descriptions of events" (1983, page 377) in pointing out that "the turn to discourse" "has further drawn attention to the constructive nature of literary language" (both from Parker, page 46). Thus, in his cogent argument about the relationship between the two disciplines, Parker contrasts the view of literature as confirming truths "discovered through proper empirical research" with "new paradigm" challenges to older views of both literature and psychological science (1992, page 46).

An essential feature of Parker's argument (1992, pages 45 – 63) is that neither literature nor psychology actually hold a "mirror to nature" but that, in fact, both disciplines are fed by, and feed into, their cultural context as well as reflecting, of course, the mental processes of those who undertake them. So, to take an example from literary history, the immediate context in

which Charlotte Brontë grew up may have resulted in the formation of a woman who was able to attempt and achieve what other women of her time might not (Gaskell, 1857). As a result of her fictional work, perceptions of what a woman may be like may have, in turn, been influenced by the effect of that work upon the wider context of society. From a feminist perspective, depictions of women in literature could be said to have at various times resulted in positive and negative effects. Examples of the latter are adduced by Wetherell (1986).

A polarisation of these two directions by which sign systems may function in literature may be seen in *Oliver Twist* (Dickens, 1837-8).

It could be argued that, at least in part, Dickens' concern with the suffering of the orphan reflects his own history. On the other hand, the effect of the novel in terms of public awareness of the evils of the workhouse and the treatment of orphans could be seen as an instance of the potential that fiction has for influencing culture and society by the signs which it employs. In the opinion of some, (Hillis Miller, 1987) *Oliver Twist* is far from Dickens' greatest work and this may be because it has the nature eventually of a work of journalism rather than a work of art. In the light of Gunn's statement, above, about art as an expression of the *un*conscious, it could be argued that Oliver Twist emerged, at least in part, from Dickens' *conscious* anger at the social conditions of his time rather than from within his own unconscious, finding expression through his intellect and creativity.

A comparison between *Great Expectations* (1860-61) and *David Copperfield* (1849-50), on the one hand, and *Oliver Twist* on the other, could be said to underline the difference between literary art and journalism in so far as literature may reveal signs that arise from the 'unconscious' of an individual or a people whereas journalism may seek to *form* public opinion. This distinction may account for the more enduring artistic value of some novels in

comparison with others since the two other Dickens novels reveal more powerfully the experience of an orphaned, neglected, or otherwise traumatised, child.

A search for existing analyses of the theme of the orphan in literature yielded limited material. Analysis of the issues central to this thesis, that is, the issues of dialogue and silence, appears to be absent. The terms 'dialogue' and 'silence' refer, in this thesis, to how sad news is communicated, the lack of communication at times of breaking the news of a death and of engaging in dialogue about the child's experience of loss. The only analyses of 'orphan' literature currently published consist of reviews that show: 1) the orphan as a character with 'power' because free of the constraints and restraints of parents (Mattson, 1997; Donahue, 2003; Kulpa, 2003 and Peters, 2001); 2) the orphan as an American hero ('The Orphan Project', Cohn); 3) the orphan as a figure in folk tales (Kimball, 1999) and 4) the orphan in children's literature which reproduces the recurring features of folk tales about orphans (Kimball, 1999). Like Kimball (1999), Mattson traces recurring features in fiction about orphans (1997) and the recurring features described by these two writers are, in fact very similar. Kimball lists them as: helpers (of the orphan); mistreatment; quests; obstacles; surmounting obstacles; rewards and punishment of those who oppose orphans. Donahue (2003) and Kulpa (2003) both point out the ways in which the Harry Potter series of novels continues the well-established tradition of the orphan in fiction with the same features that they have noted in other sources.

METHOD

The process of identifying texts for this investigation was informed by aspects of narrative analysis as described by Hollway and Jefferson (2000) who have utilised a form of narrative analysis "based on a psychoanalytic theory of the individual, namely that unconscious, as well as conscious motivations affect people's actions and accounts" (Hollway and Jefferson, 2000,

page 53). The first part of this method is to "elicit stories ("not explanations nor opinions")

and enable the interviewee to structure their own narrative according to links which follow

free associations, rather than coherent or logical narrative structures". This first part of the

method was not employed in this investigation since, clearly, the narratives supplied by the

literature already exist. The aspects of Hollway and Jefferson's method which have been

utilised in this investigation are aspects of their interpretive approach to the analysis of data

provided by such narratives. In the case of this investigation, the authors of the various novels

replace the participants interviewed as, for example, by Hollway and Jefferson.

The particular parts of that analytical method adopted here are: 1) the fundamental principle

of focusing on what the researcher *notices* in the narrative; 2) paying attention to

contradiction; 3) paying attention to omission and 4) paying attention to changes in the

emotional tone (Hollway and Jefferson, 2000). The idea of a researcher paying attention to

what they 'notice' in a narrative is, of course, based on the concept of 'free association'

(Murray Thomas, 1992). Magariños' stresses the importance in semiotic analysis of what he

calls "the abductive element" which he defines as the aspect of the analysis that "results from

the experience and is produced by the system of values" of the researcher (2008; 2011, page

60). It could be argued that there seems to be some resonance between the aspect of narrative

analysis described as 'noticing' and the aspect of semiotic analysis which draws upon the

values and experience of the researcher.

As in the other investigations which make up this study, texts were understood to consist of

both spoken texts and of functional practices. This view of social communication as including

both activities and spoken texts is in accord with Vygotsky's belief in the relationship

between action and meaning (1978) and Freire's view that praxis cannot be reduced to verbalism and activism (1972).

The actual analysis of the texts identified relies upon the themes from Freire's work already discussed but these are also combined with Hollway and Jefferson's method (2000) in order to contrast the use of articulated or practised signs with *omissions* that may be interpreted as 'silence' functioning as a sign. The texts that have been analysed in this way are then compared also with the composite list of criteria drawn from the literature about methods of semiotic analysis.

The justification for this investigation is, therefore, supported by four distinct approaches:

1) Working from the assumption discernible in Archer's rationale, it has been assumed that accounts in fictional narratives, generally, imply that authors themselves either have experienced something of which they write or that they have experience of events and feelings observed in the lives of others that can be recounted because they have witnessed events or have had impressions and feelings communicated to them by others with their own direct experience (1999);

2) Working from Barthes' analysis, it has been assumed that detecting signs in fictional accounts provides evidence of such signs being located in history in accordance with Barthes' idea of the contemporary myth and its place in "the historical field of action" (1977, pages 168 and 169).

3) Working from Hollway and Jefferson's (2000) model of narrative analysis, it has been assumed that conscious and unconscious motivations affect people's accounts and that the motivations and behaviour depicted in such accounts may reveal something of significance about the use of dialogue and silence in relation to children's grief since

the texts chosen are from works of fiction considered to be of importance. The judgment of a particular work being important or not was made according to a combination of criteria such as how enduring a work has been and/or the current critical estimation of its merits as a work of art.

4) Working from Freire's model (1972), instances have been sought which 'strike' the researcher as exemplifying the concepts: silence; dialogue; naming the world; subjects and objects.

The meaning of the term 'narrative' in this chapter reflects three layers of definition derived from the first three of the four approaches listed, above. First, a narrative here refers to a fictional account of events and characters reflecting either the author's own experience or the experience of others. Secondly, a narrative here refers to a fictional account in which signs are detectible and which therefore provides evidence of such signs being located in history. Finally, a narrative here refers to an account which is affected by the author's conscious and unconscious motivations in such a way that the depiction in such accounts may reveals something of significance. 'Sign', of course, is the root of the word 'significance' and the general understanding of the word 'sign' was defined, in Chapter 1 of this thesis, as being, according to Chandler, something that can be interpreted as having meaning (2007, page 13).

Believing that support could be found from all four of the above approaches and rationales for an examination of literary sources, this investigation was concerned with finding instances of both 1) the functioning of silence as a sign as well as of 2) the phenomenon being called "dialogue" in the context of narratives in literature that depict aspects of children's grief. The researcher looked particularly for instances showing the breaking of news and the reaction of children to loss. It would clearly have been impossible within present constraints to give an exhaustive account of such instances within the entire canon of literature in English let alone that written in other languages. It was decided, therefore, to exclude children's literature, for

reasons which are given, below, and literature other than 'classic' novels. A few examples are included, however, from novels in other languages that happen to be within the researcher's own capability of comprehension. In addition, the example of one particular author is taken to demonstrate the possibility of correspondences between themes in an author's work and issues in their own life.

The principal reason for excluding children's literature from this investigation was that, as Kimball's analysis (1999) shows, stories about orphans in children's literature are usually built around the recurring features summarised, above, and do not deal with the questions of the breaking of the news of a loss nor of how a child may conduct any kind of dialogue with themselves or with others about their experience of loss. Another, subsidiary, reason for this decision was that children's stories about orphans tend to be placed in a fantasy world of some kind or another. This view is supported by the various reviews referred to, above. Cohn ('The Orphan Project') points out another dimension of the orphan story as 'fantasy': authors may simply portray an orphan's experience in an unrealistic, romanticised, way which is as much a 'fantasy' as a story set in a magical world. Cohn ('The Orphan Project') describes how, following the American Civil War, the orphan became a new kind of hero in the literature of the United States and argues that: "It is essential to understand that the fictional orphan is entirely the work of fantasy, having nothing whatever to do with the real-life situation of orphans in America, which was grim indeed" (pages in this source are un-numbered).

One exception has been allowed to this principle of excluding authors who locate their orphan stories in a fantasy world. The author taken as an example by which to explore the possibility of correspondences between themes in an author's work and issues in their own life is J.M.

Barrie, the author of *Peter Pan* (1911). It is acknowledged that all works of fiction, in some sense, are located in an unreal world because they are themselves representations but the texts selected are from works which tell stories purporting to be located in the real world.

For the sake of clarity, each set of texts and episodes from the narratives, in summary, are set out in turn and each is accompanied by analytical comments, culminating in a general discussion. In order to be economical with space and words, the texts and narratives are not reproduced in full in this chapter, although some quotations are provided to illustrate the analysis of the texts. Page references given here are, naturally, from the editions used which are, in turn, cited in full in the list of references for this thesis. The sources are considered in alphabetical order of the authors' surnames as a simple means of avoiding any unintended impression of an order of priority, preference or usefulness. The texts selected for this analysis are:

1) Charlotte Brontë *Jane Eyre*

2) Charles Dickens *OliverTwist*
        Great Expectations
        David Copperfield

3) Neil M. Gunn   *The Silver Darlings*

4) Khaled Hosseini   *The Kite Runner*

5) Boris Pasternak   *Dr Zhivago*

6) Carlos Ruiz Zafón   *The Shadow of the Wind.*

RESULTS OF NARRATIVE ANALYSIS

1) Charlotte Brontë

Jane Eyre

1) This novel provides a wealth of 'texts' of relevance to the issues central to this thesis, that is, the issues of dialogue and silence in children's experience of grief. There are, for example, significant instances of 'silence' in this orphan story. At the very beginning of the novel, Jane is told to "remain silent" until she could speak pleasantly (Volume 1, chapter 1, page 13). This instruction comes from her aunt who has been telling Jane that she will be excluded from privileges enjoyed by her cousins until Bessie, the nurse, gives a good report of her. Jane asks what it is that Bessie has already said about her and it is this question which elicits the instruction to remain silent. This episode could be seen as an instance of the child being *taught* silence and being *taught* not to 'speak their own word'.

Being obliged to remain silent, Jane's only possible communication is with the book that she is holding – "Bewick's *History of British Birds*" (page 14). She is interested in the pages that contain verbal descriptions and vignettes portraying the haunts of sea birds in various regions of the world. She tells the reader, "Of these death- white realms I formed an idea of my own" (page 14). The connections that Jane makes seem to be associated with her awareness of death:

"*The words in these introductory pages connected themselves with the succeeding vignettes, and gave significance to the rock standing up alone in a sea of billow and spray; to the broken boat stranded on a desolate coast; to the cold and ghastly moon glancing through bars of cloud at a wreck just sinking.*
I cannot tell what sentiment haunted the quite solitary churchyard, with its inscribed headstone; its gate, its two trees, its low horizon, girdled by a broken wall, and its newly risen crescent, attesting the hour of even-tide." (pages 14-15)

Images which relate to death and bereavement are evident in these lines: the rock apparently compared by means of juxtaposition to the gravestone; the 'death-whiteness' of the landscapes in polar regions (shrouds and the physical pallor of death); the boat sinking (burial); being "stranded on a desolate coast" (the isolation of loss); the gate with its associations of leave taking; the pictures of evening and the repeated images of things broken.

112

Classical Freudian interpretations will not be pursued here although, beyond its symbolism, psychoanalytical psychology sees principles of life and death beneath the forces of desire and destruction in the depths of 'the psychic apparatus' (Murray Thomas, 1992).

2) The isolation and exclusion experienced by Jane appears to be related by her to other texts. This resonates with Chandler's (2007) comments about the role of intertextuality in semiotic analysis. In arguing that codes transcend structures, he cites Kristeva's proposition of a "vertical axis" which connects the text to other texts (Kristeva, 1980, page 69).

  Being treated unjustly and cruelly by her cousin, Jane reacts on one occasion when physically hurt by him, comparing him to the Roman emperors:

"*I had read Goldsmith's History of Rome, and had formed my own opinion of Nero, Caligula, etc. Also I had drawn parallels in silence, which I never thought thus to have declared aloud.*" (page 17, the underlining is mine)

A code of status is revealed in the way that her cousin communicates with her: "Say… Master Reed" (page 16) and "You have no business to take our books; you are a dependant" (page 17). In fact, she is Mrs Reed's niece. This reminding of the orphan relative of her lower status may be compared with a statement which arises out of a discussion between Jane and one of the servants who has asked how she could have struck her "young master".

"Master! How is he my master? Am I a servant?
No; you are less than a servant, for you do nothing for your keep."

3) The isolation experienced by Jane through not being allowed to speak and also by being spoken to as an inferior is compounded by the practice of seclusion when she externalizes her distress in anger and aggression. An example of this occurs on page 18:

  "*Take her away to the red-room, and lock her in there*".

The experience of being locked in the red room is a terrifying experience for Jane not only because she is locked away by herself but also because she knows that this is the room in which her uncle had died, in which his body lay in state and from which it had been taken by the undertakers. She knows that his dying wish was for Jane to be brought up as one of his own children but fears that her aunt's breaking of that promise may bring to the red room some supernatural visitation of her uncle's ghost. Her terror eventually drives her to screaming and to trying to shake the lock open. When the adults come to unlock the door and find out what is happening, they interpret her scream as attention seeking:

"*She has screamed out on purpose… If she had been in great pain one would have excused it, but she only wanted to bring us all here; I know her naughty tricks.*" (page 25)

4) Eventually, the terror produces physical effects and she collapses into unconsciousness. When she wakes, she finds that an apothecary has been brought to her room:

"*Ere long, I became aware that someone was handling me, lifting me up and supporting me in a sitting posture: and that more tenderly than I had ever been raised or upheld before. I rested my head against a pillow or an arm, and felt easy.*"

It is, of course, the apothecary who treats her in this tender fashion and, over the following days, the apothecary engages Jane in dialogue about her physical condition but also about her grief, her feelings about living in her aunt's house and her wishes for the future. Within the actual spoken dialogue of conversation, Jane is given her first opportunity to engage in dialogue in the deeper sense in which it has been already used in this thesis and this dialogue is facilitated by the physical communication of substitute care.

As an aside, it may be worth noting that Mrs Reed, Jane's aunt, has kept the red room unused and untouched since her husband's funeral. One of the maids had to dust the mirrors and furniture once a week and Mrs Reed came there from time to time to look at mementoes of her husband (page 21). The description of the room and its use (or non-use) appears to be very

much that of the 'mummification' described by Bowlby (1980) as a feature of chronic mourning.

At first, when questioned by the apothecary, the servant Bessie answers *for* Jane but she is fortuitously called away and Jane is then able to answer for herself. The adult's answering on behalf of the child could be seen as another instance of 'silence'; she is unable to 'speak her own word' (Freire, 1972). Brontë, in the final paragraph of page 31, gives a cogent account of the difficulty a child may have in analysing and verbalising their feelings. She simultaneously expresses the difficulty experienced by the child Jane and also speaks as the adult Jane looking back with an understanding of that difficulty:

"*How much I wished to reply fully to this question! How difficult it was to frame my answer! Children can feel but they cannot analyse their feelings; and if the analysis is partially effected in thought, they know not how to express the result of the process in words. Fearful, however, of losing this first and only opportunity of relieving my grief by imparting it, I, after a disturbed pause, contrived to frame a meagre, though far as it went, true response.*"

5) When asked by Mr Lloyd why she is unhappy, Jane replies that:

"*For one thing, I have no father or mother, or brothers or sisters*" (page 31).

She knows, then, that she is an orphan but it is only at the age of ten that she learns the circumstances of her parents' deaths (pages 33 and 34). She learns these facts 'by accident' when she overhears a conversation between Bessie and Abbott:

"*I learned, for the first time,*" "*after I was in bed, and, as they thought, asleep*".

It seems astonishing to a 21st century mind that a child could have lived for ten years without ever anyone having related to them the facts about the deaths of their parents and yet Investigation 1, which forms part of this thesis, attests to instances where the same omission occurred in the real lives of children bereaved of a parent in the 20th century.

6) There are instances of communication in this narrative which, it is suggested, relate to 'immortality' as a paradigm, as, for example, in Helen Burns' comments about human faults in Chapter 14:

"*…but the time will soon come when we shall put them off in putting off our corruptible bodies; when debasement and sin will fall from us with this cumbrous frame of flesh, and only the spark of the spirit will remain, - the impalpable principle of life and thought, pure as when it left the Creator to inspire the creature: whence it came it will return*" (page 69)

7) There is also evidence of a system of depersonalization in the practice at Lowood of scholars being called by their surnames:

"*Burns (such it seems was her name: the girls here were all called by their surnames, as boys are elsewhere),*" (page 64)

It is suggested that texts from this narrative reveal instances of the functioning of signs which have connotations of: 1) silence; 2) status and oppression; 3) immortality and 4) depersonalisation. The episodes which suggest the functioning of signs connotating status and oppression in connection with Jane's isolation, exclusion and grief support Chandler's (2007) concept of intertextuality since there is cross referencing between the two paradigmatic sets of signs.

 It has been argued that an important part of the functioning of silence as a sign in Jane's story is the complete omission of any attempt by adults to relate to her the truth about her parents' deaths. On the other hand, it is suggested that amongst these texts can be seen the operation of the positive and facilitating effects of 'dialogue' as seen in the interactions with the apothecary.

Finally, the evidence for believing that Mrs Reed is locked in chronic mourning for her husband may be seen as supporting the view that those who have been unable to communicate with others or with themselves about their own grief are very likely to be unable to

communicate with empathy in their interactions with others whose behaviour arises out of their own uncommunicated grief.

2) Charles Dickens

Great Expectations:

1) Pip, the hero of Great Expectations is an orphan who never knew his parents.

"As I never saw my father or my mother, and never saw any likeness of either of them… my first fancies regarding what they were like, were unreasonably derived from their tombstones" (page 3).

He builds pictures of them from the shape of the letters on the tombstones and from the content of their epitaphs. He tells the reader (pages 3 -4) how he found out "for certain" that his parents and five brothers "were dead and buried" only as a result of the episode with Magwitch in the churchyard. This statement raises the question of whether any proper explanations of his parents' deaths had ever been offered to Pip before this episode. No account of such communication is given anywhere in the novel and so this is certainly an omission from the entire narrative.

This aspect of the narrative suggests an omission in relation to the truth about these events since none of the adults in his life seem to have given him any proper account of them. This omission could be interpreted as an instance of the functioning of silence as a sign.

2) Further omissions can be seen in Pip's own silence about certain events. For example, he describes the "secrecy of terror" to account for his saying nothing to his sister and Joe about the convict on the marshes or the events between them (page 15). One could also cite his lies about the events at 'Enough House' as, effectively, a silence about or an inability to communicate his true impressions and feelings (Chapter 13).

3) The first time we meet Mrs Joe, Pip's sister, who is "more than twenty years older" than him (page 7) is in the second chapter of the novel as Pip returns to the house following his meeting with Magwich. From this very first depiction of the relationship between Pip and Mrs Joe, it is clear that the interactions between them are governed by the oppression of actual violence or the threat of potential violence. It could be said that the power relations in the house are reflected in practices of violence and aggression both physical and verbal. Pip's sister's only way of coping with having to bring up a child 'by hand' (page 9) is to subdue him with verbal and physical violence.

It is suggested that these selections from the narrative reveal instances of 1) silence and 2) control, power and oppression functioning as signs. The episodes which suggest the operation of control, power and oppression and connections between Pip's own silence and the functioning of oppression support Freire's concepts of 'object' contrasted with 'subject'; Pip is certainly not free to 'speak his own word'.

David Coppperfield

1) David's father had died 6 months before David's birth. As with Pip in *Great Expectations*, David's only relationship with, and awareness of, his father is through his tombstone, at least until another character tells him a little more about Mr Copperfield later in the story. There is no account of what David may have been told about his father's death or about death in general.

2) At the end of Chapter 3, David returns home from his visit to Yarmouth to find that his mother has married Mr Murdstone. From Chapter 4 onwards, Dickens depicts the child rearing methods used by Mr Murdstone and his sister. This approach to David's upbringing is

summarised in the word "Firmness". The essence of the approach is that the expression of emotion must be repressed and a number of episodes in the narrative show the Murdstones imposing this not only upon David but also upon his mother.

3) In Chapter 13, the news of the death of David's mother is broken to him by Mrs Creakle, the wife of the proprietor of David's school, Salem House. Mrs Creakle's conversation with David includes some of the features taught to health and social care professionals in modern times. There is the 'warning shot', "When you came away from home at the end of the vacation… were they all well?" and "Was your mama well?" (page 176). There is the choosing of a more private place in which the difficult conversation may take place, "the parlour" (page 175). "She was very kind to me. She kept me there all day, and left me alone sometimes." When he returns to his home, there is an episode in which the servant, Peggotty, is able to tell him the story of his mother's death and this dialogue, and the opportunity it gives them to grieve together privately, away from the Murdstones, seems to provide some comfort to both characters.

In contrast, David is silent before the other boys in his school and they say nothing about the death to him although Traddles "insisted on lending me his pillow. I don't know what good he thought it would do me, for I had one of my own: but it was all he had to lend, poor fellow" (page 177). On the other hand, he describes a sense of his affliction making him seem important in their eyes (page 177).

In these episodes can be seen further instances of the silence functioning as a sign. There is the implied silence of adults about the death of Mr Copperfield. There is the silence between the adults and David in the new family situation with the Murdstones. His mother is obliged

to be silent towards him, not expressing affection. He is to be silent towards all of the other adults, not expressing any feelings or opinions even though the new situation constitutes a new experience of loss for him. There is the silence between David and his school friends about the death of his mother.

In contrast, there are features of dialogue and facilitation in the interaction with Mrs Creakle, and with Peggotty, following the death of David's mother.
Before and after that event, however, there are certainly practices and texts that can be associated with power, control and oppression in the violent interactions between David and the Murdstones.

Oliver Twist:

Oliver's mother had died in giving birth and he spends the first part of his childhood in the workhouse. Consequently, he doesn't know any of his relatives. By Chapter 2, on his eighth birthday, he is leaving the workhouse for the first time and "the only friends he had ever known" (page 11). This information is supplied in a passage (page 11) containing some examples of contradiction and omission:

"Oliver was then led away by Mr Bumble from the wretched home where one kind word or look had never lighted the gloom of his infant years. And yet he burst into an agony of childish grief as the cottage- gate closed after him. Wretched as were the little companions in misery he was leaving behind, they were the only friends he had ever known; and a sense of his loneliness in the great wide world sank into the child's heart for the first time."

1) In the episode cited, above, there is the noticeable feature of the contradiction between Oliver's outburst of grief and Mr Bumble's interactions with him which consist only of instructions such as "Bow to the board" (page 12).

2) In addition, there is the omission of any comfort from any of the adults in Oliver's life at this point. Mr Bumble offers none and, when Oliver appears before the board, "weeping bitterly", one of the board members asks, "What is he crying for?" (page 12). Dickens immediately asks the reader, "What *could* he be crying for?"

By Chapter 3, Oliver is being told by Mr Bumble that he has the opportunity of becoming an apprentice (pages 22 – 23). The effect of being brought an unusually generous portion of bread and gruel by the beadle has a contradictory effect upon Oliver since it convinces him that he is about to be killed if they are fattening him up. As a result, Oliver begins to "cry very piteously" and Mr Bumble's response, again, is hardly comforting as in, for example: "Don't make your eyes red" and "don't cry into your gruel".

3) A "contradiction" is noticeable in Chapter 3 at the point when a magistrate is about to sign the indentures for Oliver's apprenticeship:

'My boy,' said the old gentleman, leaning over the desk. Oliver started at the sound, - he might be excused for doing so, for the words were kindly said, and strange sounds frighten one. He trembled violently and burst into tears.

This episode supplies an instance of Oliver being allowed to express himself freely since the magistrate asks him to tell him what was the matter which the child then proceeds to do with the result that he is not indentured as an apprentice. The magistrate, in effect, allows Oliver the opportunity to 'speak his own word'.

4) A further instance of 'omission' is supplied in Chapter 4, when, as Oliver is being taken by the beadle to the coffin maker's, he begins to weep again. He is accused by Mr Bumble of being an ungrateful creature but protests, still weeping, that his distress is not caused by ingratitude but by loneliness and by being hated.

"I feel as if I had been cut here, sir, and it was all bleeding away" and the child beat his hand upon his heart and looked into his companion's face with tears of real agony.

This episode, depicting Oliver crying and speaking out his feelings honestly, whilst written in Dickens' sentimental style, is interesting in terms of Mr Bumble's response to this first, rare, attempt at 'dialogue' from Oliver. Mr Bumble does not know how to respond and we are told that he "walked on with him in silence" (page 32).

It is suggested that these selections from the narrative reveal instances of silence and of control functioning as signs and sign systems. It is also suggested that the whole period of the narrative which is set in the context of the workhouse and the work situations arranged for Oliver by the workhouse provide examples of power and oppression exerted over the orphans by the parish authorities. The brief attempt by Oliver to describe his emotional pain could be seen as an attempt at 'naming the world' although it remains, sadly, uncombined with any 'dialogue' between him and the beadle.

3)   Neil M. Gunn

The Silver Darlings

Gunn is a 20th century Scottish novelist (1891-1973); this particular book was first published in 1941. The story is located in the context of a Highland fishing community. The central character, Finn, has been orphaned before birth when his father died at sea. The events of the loss are related in the earlier chapters as part of his mother's experience. When the reader first meets Finn, he is already a toddler and able to speak. One of the features of this orphan's story that the researcher 'noticed' is that in the whole course of Finn's story (of 584 pages), there is only one allusion to Finn's feelings about, and perception of his father's death. That allusion occurs in Chapter 13 when he is engaged in a conversation which begins with

questions about a species of butterflies called 'grey fools' and where they come from. He wants to know whether any of them come from Canada:

Mother: *'Well, I don't know if they come from Canada. They would have to cross the sea.*

Child: *'What's the sea, Mama? Is it a big, big place full of water?'*

Mother: *'Yes.'*

Child: *'How big is it?'*

Mother: *'It's very, very big. It's bigger than all the moor at the back, away, away to Morven, and further than that.'*

Child: *'Is it? It must be awful big.'*

Mother: *'Yes. Now, come, say your prayer and go to sleep, for if little boys don't sleep they won't grow into big men, and what -----'*

Child: *'Mama? Couldn't the grey fools cross above the sea in the air?'*

Mother: *'They might. But it would be such a long, long way that they would grow tired and then what would happen to them?'*

Child: *'What?'*

Mother: *'What do you think?'*

Child: *'Would they fall into the sea and be drowned?'*

Mother: *'Yes. Just as little boys will be drowned if they fall into the river. And that's why I have told you never to ---- '*

Child: *'Did you ever know anyone who was drowned, Mama?'*

Mother: *'Yes.'*

Child: *'Who?'*

Mother: *'Now go to your sleep. I can't stay here with you all night. Come."'*

Finn's mother avoids the whole question of who it was she knew who drowned and the book contains no discussion or conversation about his father or his father's death or of death in general between Finn and his mother or with anyone else for that matter. The whole absence

of any such reference can be seen as an instance of silence. The observation that silence pervades this narrative in this way is not intended as criticism. It could actually be seen as a vital part of the narrative and plot. The sea and death and the people's silence about it supply almost another character to the drama. This feature of the narrative, in its own way, reveals important aspects of the culture of the community in which the story is set. Whilst showing the practice of silence about death operating in the history of a particular family, the author also depicts features of the culture to which the operation of silence in this narrative relates and they can be identified as: 1) the superstition amongst Celtic peoples about the link between 'naming' something and 'inviting' that very thing and also 2) the relation in the highlands between dispossession and not being able to 'name your own world'. This is very clearly described in *The Drinking Well*. Gunn argues there that a succession of events have disempowered the Highland people and particularly the men. The events are: a) the repression of the people and their culture after Culloden; b) the betrayal by the Scottish nobles in signing the Act of Union in return for money and c) the clearances in the 19th century. As with other narratives in this chapter, it is suggested here that the functioning of silence as a sign in personal life finds parallels in the social and historical context.

4) Khaled Hosseini

Kite Runner

The story of Amir and his friend, Hassan, is set in Afghanistan in the1970's and, therefore, in a culture distinct from any represented in the previous fictional narratives considered in this chapter. Again, as in *The Silver Darlings*, one of the most noticeable features of this narrative is that throughout Amir's childhood there is a complete lack of communication from his father, and the other adults in Amir's life, about his mother and her death. He had never known his mother; she had died one year after giving birth to him (page 5). In adult life, he

accidentally meets someone who knew his mother and Amir is gripped by the possibility of finding out something about her, anything, as much as possible, about her, since he had never been told anything. In fact, it is suggested that his knowledge until this point in his life is completely limited to the photograph in his home of his parents on their wedding day.

There is also a picture of his father's business partner and best friend, Rahim Khan, and Amir, as a baby, held by his father, "*looking tired and grim. I'm in his arms, but it's Rahim Khan's pinky my fingers are curled around*" (page 5).

Later in the narrative, Amir's life is impacted by the child, Sohrab, who experiences various traumas in the time of the Taleban. As a result of the lack of communication about certain experiences, more problems occur for both characters. In recounting one particular traumatic episode in Sohrab's life, after the child has eventually gone to sleep, the adult Amir comments that he had remembered something that he had read somewhere along time ago "*That's how children cope with terror. They fall asleep*" (page 298).

1) Again, silence is seen operating in the experience of a child who has been bereaved of a parent. The desperation of the adult Amir to discover anything about his mother from a stranger who had known her itself speaks of the absence of communication from his father, and the other adults in his life, about his mother and her life and death.

2) The events in the narrative that depict the relationship between Amir and his father reinforce the truth symbolised by the photograph of him as a baby: he seeks comfort from his father but finds it only with others. It is Rahim Khan's finger which he holds onto and not his father's.

3) In order to avoid 'giving away' the story for any who may subsequently read this narrative, the terrors to which Sohrab has been subjected are not specified here. It is suggested, however, that it is clear from the details of the book that Sohrab's silence about his traumas does arise from those experiences of terror and that, in fact, his 'being silenced' is part of the effects of that oppression and terror upon him.

5)   Boris Pasternak

Dr Zhivago

1) The very beginning of this narrative is the account of the funeral of Yuri's mother. The ceremony is conducted and:

"*Then a fearful bustle began. The coffin was closed, nailed and lowered into the ground. Clods of earth drummed on the lid like a rain as the grave was filled hurriedly by four spades. A mound grew up on it and a ten-year-old boy climbed on top.*
Only the numb and unfeeling condition which comes to people at the end of a big funeral could account for some of the mourners' thinking that he wished to make an address over his mother's grave.
He raised his head and, from his vantage point, absently surveyed the bare autumn landscape and the domes of the monastery. His snub-nosed face was contorted. He stretched out his neck. If a wolf cub had done this it would have been obvious that it was about to howl. The boy covered his face with his hands and burst into sobs."

His uncle, the brother of his mother, goes to him and leads him from the graveyard. They spend the night at the monastery where his uncle had been a priest. The noise of the blizzard, however, wakes him in the night and his crying wakes his uncle:

"*His uncle woke up, spoke to him of Christ and tried to comfort him, then yawned and stood thoughtfully by the window. They started to dress. It was getting light.*"

Yuri had never known his father who had abandoned them before Yuri could remember. He was always told that his father was away on business but never told the truth. Thus, when his mother dies, Yuri is left with no parents to care for him.

Since the narrative begins with the account of the funeral, it would be an 'argument from silence' to suggest that no real explanations have been given to Yuri *before* the funeral. Nevertheless, nothing *is* said and it could be that the funeral is even more disturbing for him because of a lack of communication before it occurred. We are not told ('silence') *how* Yuri was informed of the death of his mother; only that he howled like a wolf at the funeral. One could speculate about whether this silence toward him at that point had any permanent traumatic effect upon him, especially in the light of the adult Yuri's conflicts concerning relationships. It is interesting, also, that he had never been told the truth about his father's absence since this constitutes a double silence: there is the silence of his father towards him, constituted by the absence and there is the silence created by the absence of truth telling.

More positively, a) Yuri is able to express his feelings through his crying and b) his uncle tries to comfort him and speaks to him "of Christ". On the other hand, the interactions with his uncle, at the funeral and afterwards, do not really constitute 'dialogue' in the sense that it has been used in this chapter and in this thesis.

The adult Yuri has a passionate, romantic, affair with Lara which, throughout the narrative, is interwoven with events concerning his two marriages, one official and one unofficial. It is clear in the narrative that there is a lifelong conflict within Yuri between the desire for the woman he loves and the substitutes for his lost mother, between a mature adult desire for a female partner (and 'freedom') and the child's repressed instincts for the lost mother (and 'security'). In the light of that conflict, the question arises as to what extent the interactions with his uncle and the attempts at providing comfort actually did mitigate the traumatic events of his childhood.

There are recurring themes in the main narrative and also in the "Zhivago poems". Themes that can be discerned are: 1) life and death (and resurrection); 2) winter and spring (and the times of thaw which connect them); 3) the Virgin (some significant events occur on various feasts of the Virgin) and Magdalene and 4) the howling of the wind and storms as well as of railway engines and other inanimate objects which seem to echo the account of the child howling right at the beginning of the story. If these interpretations were actually intended by Pasternak, then they reinforce the comments made about the enduring effects of the childhood loss and trauma throughout the life of the main character in the narrative.

Hayward and Harari (2002), the translators of the Vintage Edition, point out that place names in *Doctor Zhivago* are relevant to the context in which parts of the story are set. It is interesting to note, in relation to a narrative in which the author has deliberately created meaningful place names, that the name of the main character, in Russian, also seems to have a symbolic value in the light of the narrative. Hayward and Harari (2002) do not point this out (this is not intended as a criticism) but it is the researcher's own observation that the name 'Zhivago' has the same root as the Russian verb 'to live': 'живу' (zhivoo) and the Russian noun for 'life': 'жизн' (zhizn).

Pasternak lived through terrible times and experiences and was denounced by the Soviet regime. His work, however, speaks a message of hope in the midst of such terror and loss: 'at least we have lived and been able to enjoy something of the joy of life'. The civil war and the policies of the Soviet regime may bring death to the land and its people but there is a continuing principle of real life which cannot be snuffed out and will continue just as the spring emerges each time the snow and ice of winter thaws.

In concluding these comments about *Doctor Zhivago*, then, it is suggested that it contains evidence of silence functioning as a sign, of 'unresolved grief' (evidenced by the recurring theme of howling) and of immortality (evidenced by the passage, "His uncle…spoke to him of Christ" and by the recurring themes of winter and spring and of death, life and resurrection).

6) Carlos Ruiz Zafón

Shadow of the Wind:

Daniel's mother has died when he was 4 years old. At the beginning of the narrative he is now 10 years old. His mother had died shortly after the Spanish Civil War during an outbreak of cholera.

1) As the story begins, Daniel's father is letting him in on an important secret which Daniel must not tell anyone, not even his best friend (page 1). Daniel asks,

"*Not even Mummy?*" and his father replies, "*Of course you can tell her… we keep no secrets from her. You can tell her everything*" (page 1). It is the voice of Daniel through which the whole narrative is told and he goes on to explain that:

"*As a child I learned to fall asleep talking to my mother in the darkness of my bedroom, telling her about the day's events, my adventures at school, and the things I had been taught. I couldn't hear her voice or feel her touch, but her radiance and her warmth haunted every corner of our home, and I believed, with the innocence of those who can still count their age on their ten fingers, that if I closed my eyes and spoke to her, she would be able to hear me wherever she was.*"

2) Later in the story, another character says, in the dedication of a book:

"For my friend… who gave me back my voice…" (page 505).

Some details have been omitted from this quotation in order not to 'give away' the story.

3) The story begins 6 years after the Civil War had ended. The events take place between the years 1945 and 1956 and, although the postscript recounts events in 1966, even that year was still well within the period of Franco's dictatorship which ended when he died in 1975. Almost all of the action takes place in Barcelona, the principal city of Catalonia, a region which is famous, amongst other things, for being one of the regions most opposed to the fascist Falangist rebellion led by Franco, against the Republican Government, which sparked the Spanish Civil War. The Catalan institutions, language and culture were suppressed by Franco throughout the whole period 1939 to 1975.

Daniel's practice of conversing with his mother can be described as a form of dialogue whether one believes that this was in reality a dialogue with himself or with his mother. The practice fits with the concept referred to by Klass et al. (1996) and Walter (1999) as "continuing bonds" or the persistence , in some way, of the relationship with the lost person rather than the "breaking of the emotional bond" as described by Freud (1917). Klass et al. (1996) argue that adjustment has more to do with continued communication than with breaking of ties.

It seems clear that there is a practice of open communication between Daniel and his father about his deceased mother (page 1 and page 2). The idea of "speaking one's own word" and of "naming the world" is supported in the parallel between the character who is given back his "voice" (page 505) and Daniel's determination not to be suppressed in choosing how to live his life and in the decisions he makes.

Taking, again, a sociological perspective, it could be argued that there is a further parallel between the events of this narrative and the history of Catalonia in the 20th century. Its voice was taken away by the dictatorship. Its language and artists were suppressed. Practices and speech which reproduce oppression are discernible in the violent behaviour of some characters in the narrative who represent the regime. Nevertheless, just as it is dialogue, open communication and determination to be a subject rather than an object (Freire, 1972) which help Daniel to overcome his personal trauma so it seems to be part of the message of this book (presented through the events and characters rather than didactically) that it is the survival of the *voice* of the Catalan people, through their culture, which facilitates their overcoming of oppression. In this, of course, they may be said to represent the continuation of non-Fascist Spain as a whole.

7)   J.M. Barrie

In the introduction to this chapter, it was stated that one exception would be allowed to the principle of excluding authors who locate their orphan stories "in a fantasy world" and that the rationale for including that author was to provide an example by which to explore the possibility of correspondences between themes in an author's work and issues in their own life. Bowlby (1980) summarised key features of the life of J.M. Barrie, the author of *Peter Pan* (1911) to illustrate aspects of his ideas about loss (pages 164 -165). The same features are re-stated, here, with acknowledgement to Bowlby (1980), in order to pursue the theme already discussed, above, of the "intimate and intriguing relationship between psychology and literature" analysed by Parker (1992, pages 45 – 63)). Reference was also made, in that part of the introduction to this chapter, to Parker's argument (1992, page 46) that in fact, both disciplines are fed by, and feed into, their cultural context. He quotes Wetherell , Potter and

Stringer (1983, page 377): "Texts cannot be taken as straightforward descriptions of events and events cannot be detached and analysed separately from the text".

Bowlby (1980, pages 164-165) relying upon accounts provided by Dunbar (1970) and by Barrie himself (in *Margaret Ogilvy*, 1897, which was a biography of his mother) summarised the features of Barrie's biography relevant to issues of loss as follows.

According to the account in Bowlby (1980), Barrie's elder brother, David, had died in a skating accident at the age of 11 and their mother never recovered from the loss. She withdrew from any real relationship with her other children and remained emotionally unavailable to them. Barrie had, on an occasion soon after the loss, approached the room where his mother was lying, as was her wont, still prostrate with her grief (Bowlby, 1980, page 164). She had asked, "Is that you? Is that you?" to which Barrie had replied, believing the question to be addressed to the lost brother, "No, it's no' him; it's just me". The result of all of this seems to have been that Barrie began to identify in some way with his lost brother and became an emotional carer for his mother trying to replace the lost son and comfort the bereaved mother with, of course, constant lack of success because in reality he could never be the other child.

Bowlby (1980) suggests that Barrie's adult life shows evidence of the "compulsive caring for others" which he (Bowlby) associated with some experiences of grief. It seems that, even though Barrie felt obliged to care for his mother, he and the other children were cared for by their elder sister since their mother was unavailable to them from David's death onwards.

A comparison of these facts with features of Barrie's fiction reveals striking parallels:

1) The family cared for by an older sister;
2) The 'lost boys' and
3) The boy who never grew up.

It could be said that the emotional withdrawal from her surviving children by Barrie's mother, constituted a silence which Barrie could only attempt to overcome by taking on the challenge of pretending to be David, the lost brother.

Mention has already been made of Dickens' experience of childhood and the correspondences between his own life and the events recounted in the three Dickens narratives included here. It seems clear from Elizabeth Gaskell's *Life of Charlotte Brontë* (1857) that she (Charlotte) had drawn from her own experience and that of others she knew in writing *Jane Eyre*. These three examples alone (Brontë, Dickens and Barrie) allow the proposition that authors whether consciously or unconsciously, or both, reproduce themes in their narratives which have affected their own lives whether through their own experience or through their observation of the experience of others. It is also argued here, on the basis of the evidence supplied by the other four authors, that, in such fictional narratives, sign systems are reproduced which speak of the relationships and events in the wider society and culture of which each author is a part and an observer.

DISCUSSION

  1) A summary of the findings.

Eight narratives have been analysed using models provided by Hollway and Jefferson (2000) and Freire (1972). The models have been applied eclectically in carrying out that analysis. Aspects of the individual lives and of the historical and sociological factors affecting the context in which seven authors produced their work have also been considered in attempting to identify sign systems operating in the narratives included in the analysis.

Silence has been identified in the interpersonal interactions in the first seven narratives and, whilst not identified in the relationship between Daniel and his father in *The Shadow of the*

Wind, it was pointed out that the robbing of their voice from the Catalan people (and from any of the people of Spain who might have opposed the regime) is a major theme in that eighth narrative. The practice of not telling a child what had happened, and specifically not telling about the death of a parent, is seen in all of the narratives except *The Shadow of the Wind*.

In contrast, 'dialogue' has been identified in only three episodes out of the other seven narratives: the apothecary engages Jane Eyre in dialogue; Mrs Creakle breaks bad news to David Copperfield and Peggotty facilitates her own and David's expression of grief.

In all of the narratives, oppression is a major feature of the lives of the principal characters, whether the oppression is exerted upon them as individuals or is exerted upon the whole of the wider society to which they belong. In two of the narratives, *Jane Eyre* and *Doctor Zhivago*, an explicit theme of immortality was identified although it could be argued that some of the other narratives contain evidence of this in a more implicit form. An example of this more implicit evidence is the episode in *The Silver Darlings* where one of the characters has a supernatural visitation at the moment of another character's death and knows that they will not meet in this life again.

It was seen that there is depersonalising communication in Jane Eyre which can be seen to relate to other systems such as those of oppression and status. In contrast to the practice of not using a person's name, there are instances of 'speaking one's own word' and of 'naming the world' in some narratives: Oliver Twist attempts to do this in one of his interactions with the beadle; Daniel in The Shadow of the Wind determinedly maintains a practice of 'speaking his own word' and 'naming the world' and, through his fight, taking a subject rather than an object position, facilitates others in doing the same.

In addition to the practice of 'not telling', it was seen that silence (or the failure to communicate) related to practices such as those of violent punishment, in *David Copperfield* and *Great Expectations*, and of exclusion and seclusion, in *Jane Eyre*. It was suggested, on the basis of evidence from Jane Eyre and the biographical information about J.M. Barrie, that there is a link between what Bowlby (1980) calls 'chronic mourning' and the inability to communicate with others with empathy .

2) Relation of the findings to Freire's model.

It was admitted, in Chapter 2, that Freire's ideas were fashioned and applied "in the context of educational work and in a context of poverty and oppression" and that the "relevance of such theory to bereavement responses and support for bereaved people may not, therefore, be immediately apparent but" that the intention was "to demonstrate how these ideas may be *applied* to important issues of communication and non-communication in the context of children's grief". Furthermore, the belief was expressed in that same chapter, using attachment theory as a base, that "communication plays a key role in the forming of emotional bonds". Questions were identified at that point "about how, or if, people communicate with themselves and with others in trying to express grief and that it may be important to confront feelings rather than simply to rehearse them". For these reasons, it is proposed here that Freire's notions of silence, contrasted with dialogue, of being able to 'speak one's own word' and 'name the world' and of people as 'subjects' or 'objects' can be taken from their original context and applied, in the eclectic manner customary in the disciplines contributing to the development of academic study in the world of health and social care.

It can be argued that, with the exception of *The Shadow of the Wind*, the principal characters remain 'objects' in one way or another. Any way in which they overcome is through the

agency of someone or something outside of themselves. Clearly, in their lives, people are always dependent upon others in some way. In Freire's sense, however, of being a 'subject', that is, one who is neither oppressed nor oppressing, only Daniel, of the main characters in these narratives, succeeds in overcoming by being a 'subject'. For Jane Eyre, it is a combination of Mr. Rochester and her 'mysterious summons'. For Pip, it is the connection with Magwitch. For David Copperfield, it is the combination of the influences of Agnes and of his aunt. For Oliver Twist, it is the help of Mr. Brownlow. For Finn, it is 'life' in Gunn's sense of the combined influences of those who have gone before and the forces within nature itself. For Amir, it is the powerful effect upon him of Hassan not only as a positive influence in his childhood but through the power of events relating to Hassan which had influenced him negatively producing a drive to resolve guilt and debt that he could not resist. For Zhivago, it is the influence of Lara as a taste of freedom and real life in the midst of the death, oppression and emptiness of everything else in his personal life and in the Russia of the civil war and the totalitarian state.

The suggestion here is that it is no coincidence that the character Daniel a) is the only character to overcome by being a 'subject' and b) that he is also the only character who has experienced the reality of 'dialogue' and of being able to 'name the world' and 'speak his own word'.

3) Implications

One of the principal implications of these findings is that they point to the existence of the same phenomenon (silence functioning as a sign) in the general population of human adults and not just amongst particular individuals, as in Investigation 1. It is also true that instances of empathic discourse are seen in the texts examined. Hence a further implication is that the 'defendedness' to which Menzies alludes (1959) is not a feature of professional work alone

136

but is, rather, a common feature of adults' reaction to being faced with the distress and grief of children. It is also implied in these findings that adults' ways of reacting in the face of children's distress and grief are determined not only by their own individual defendedness but also by societal structures and cultural values and ideologies.

It is an implied suggestion of this investigation that the results of such a narrative analysis have value as 'evidence'. Reference was made, in the introduction to this chapter, to the 'two-directional' functioning of sign systems in literature. Reference has also been made, in Chapter 4, to the different types of evidence admissible in research investigations (Kozulin, 1986; Vygotsky, 1986).

A major implication claimed for this investigation is that it reinforces the idea, already introduced in other chapters, that adults have two possible responses when faced with the distress and grief of children: 1) silence and control or 2) dialogue and facilitation. An important question, then, prompted by this implication is whether, if it is true that there are two possible courses of action and communication in that type of situation, any evidence can be found to provide indicators for professionals and for significant others about which course to choose on the basis of which course may be more helpful to grieving and distressed children. This question is addressed, in a certain measure, in the remaining investigations; the measure, of course, is that of exploratory, qualitative research.

4) General evaluative comment

Before moving on from a discussion of Investigation 2, it seems appropriate to make three general evaluative comments about the method employed. Firstly, Hollway and Jefferson's (2000) concept of using that which a researcher 'notices' in a story as a means of identifying texts for narrative analysis was adopted. At the conclusion of the exercise, it appears that this

is consistent with the psychoanalytical underpinning of Hollway and Jefferson's (2000) approach. Secondly, Friere's model (1972) was used a framework for actually analysing the texts, along with further aspects of Hollway and Jefferson's (2000) model such as taking note of omission and contradiction. Again, it seems that this is consistent with an attempt to identify instances of the functioning of silence as a sign. Finally, it is the researcher's impression that it has been potentially very fruitful to employ a variety of approaches to identify the functioning of signs within the texts sampled in this investigation.

---

[1] Not currently available in English and, for that reason, I have used the quotation from Kozulin, paraphrasing Vygotsky.

Investigation 3: An exploration of communication strategies used by counsellors with bereaved children conducted via observation of a support programme

This chapter reports the observation of a support programme where counsellors work with bereaved children and children in the pre-bereavement phase where a family member is seriously ill. Direct observation of counsellors communicating with bereaved children has been possible for the purposes of this study because the interactions between them are planned for particular times, even though, of course, the content of the sessions cannot be predicted in detail. It is important to emphasise that, in every instance, for this study, observation was planned and carried out with respect for, and sensitivity to, the counsellor – client relationship as well as with the consent of all of the individuals, counsellors and clients, and families involved. This aspect of the investigation is described more fully in the Method section, below.

The use of the word 'children' in this chapter refers to "both primary and secondary school age children and young people" as a convenient way of avoiding the need to use the whole phrase on every occasion.

The theoretical and empirical background relevant to this investigation is discussed in Chapters 2 and 3. It will be seen from those chapters that aspects of that literature such as the effects of loss upon children and the role of appropriate communication in "grief resolution" are relevant to this investigation. The justification of this investigation will also be apparent from those chapters.

METHOD

1) **Design**.

The design for this study consisted of a participant naturalistic observation of the communication that occurred within the groups attending the bereavement support programme. A qualitative approach to data collection was adopted; this consisted of noting any aspects of the communication used by counsellors or by the children that 'struck' the researcher as noteworthy. This use of the subjective impressions and judgment of the researcher matches the same principle employed in the methods of analysis adopted for the other investigations which form part of this study (Hollway and Jefferson, 2000). The framework for the researcher's judgements of what was noteworthy was provided by the concepts adopted from the work of Freire (1972) already discussed in Chapter 2, above.

The investigation design could be described also as a cross sectional study (Silverman, 2000) since there were no pre and post test measures or observations; the observation was continuous with the researcher's involvement with the programme whilst the children were attending the support groups. The period of observation was 12 months and there were 4 groups running during that time.

2) **Participants**

The sample consisted of 24 children, 3 qualified counsellors and 3 adult helpers. The researcher attended not only to collect data for this study but also as an extra helper. Since these were pre-existing groups, the sample could be described as a convenience sample (Neale and Liebert, 1986). The 24 children belonged to two separate groups; the sessions for children of primary school age and those for children of secondary school age were each run on a different evening of the week after school and took place on the premises of the

bereavement counselling service. There were both girls and boys in each of the two groups. There were 15 children attending the sessions for those of primary school age and 9 attending the sessions for those of secondary school age. The team of counsellors and adult helpers was the same for both groups.

3) Ethical Issues

The informed consent of the individuals and the families involved in the programme was obtained and all of the participants and their families were assured that confidentiality would be maintained, including in any reporting of any aspect of the study. For this reason, no individuals are identified here and the extra precaution has been taken of not identifying the geographical location of the support service. Hence, no names are used and details of individual situations are kept to a minimum to assist in preventing the identification of any individuals. Participants and their families were also assured of their right to withdraw from the investigation at any time, although none did. Permission was obtained from the consultant and management in the organisation where the service is provided before any families were approached. Initial approach to families was always from staff already involved in the programme and, therefore, known to the families. Approval had already been obtained from the NHS Local Research Ethics Committee because some families came to the programme as a result of a seriously ill family member being referred to the organisation by NHS agencies.

4) Resources

Apart from the resources supplied and utilised by the support programme for the purposes of the group sessions, the only specific resources required for the observation was a notebook and pen for the researcher to record observations after each session.

5) Procedure

In addition to attending during the running of the main part of the programme, the researcher ensured that he was able to attend during the 'familiarisation' phase so that his presence would not become an unsettling factor as the programme progressed. At every session, the researcher took part in 'circle time' (see the outline of the programme, below) and made sure that he was able to share some 'good news' and some 'bad news' on each occasion because this clearly played an important part in defining each person as a member of the group rather than as someone watching on from the outside. After 'circle time', he assisted in whatever activities were taking place and, along with the counsellors and other helpers, engaged in conversation with the children, answering questions and giving encouragement.

During each hour long group session, the researcher participated in the activities of that session but simultaneously observed the communication that occurred between counsellors, helpers and children as well as the communication that occurred between the children, making notes after the session had finished so as not to disrupt the groups. It was customary for the leader of the session to invite other counsellors and helpers to participate in an evaluative discussion of that week's activities after the session had ended and the children had gone home. Communication between team members during the evaluative discussions also formed part of the observation and all of those involved were aware of this fact and that their informed consent included those discussions.

Description of the service

The service was set up as part of the bereavement support services provided by a counselling team operating from a counselling and information centre located across the street from an independent hospice which provides palliative care services for adults and children. The team consists of about 12 qualified counsellors, mostly volunteers, working on a sessional basis.

The hospice had provided bereavement support services for adults since it had opened in the 1980s but the service for children and young people only began in 2002. It offers one to one counselling and a group programme which runs on one evening a week over 12 weeks. There is one group for primary school age children and one group for secondary school age children/young people; each of the two groups has its own evening. Referrals may be from schools, social workers, GPs, other health care professionals such as palliative care nurses or from parents and from children themselves.

Description of the programme.

If the initial, post referral, session is included, the programme consists of 12 sessions which are listed and described in Figure 1, below. The numbers 1 to 12 in sub-section 3 (Specific communication skills observed) correspond to the session numbers in the first column of Figure 1.

Session no.	Session focus	Activity	Theoretical underpinning
Initial assessment	Determining if group appropriate	Interview with team member	Support tailored to individual: 1 to 1 may be appropriate
1	Getting to know everyone	Circle time Setting ground rules Name game	Self identity Importance of boundaries for emotional and physical safety
2	Building self-esteem and sense of identity	Body collage Name game	Importance of self esteem to buffer against loss
3	Bereavement education	Q&A session on death, illness and bereavement	Opportunity to actualise loss Identify gaps in understanding re illness, death and bereavement
4	Feelings	Feeling words checklist Team games/feelings charades	Opportunity to express the pain of grief Equipping with vocalising of feelings
5	Remembering	Photo frame Messages for the balloon Plan sessions 6-8	Opportunity to create a lasting memorial whilst adjusting to a new environment
6	Group choice		Raising self esteem/awareness
7	Group choice		Raising self esteem
8	Treats session	Group choose an activity they would find fun	Raising self esteem
9	Support systems	Word search and worksheets	Identifying sources of support
10	Reviewing group programme Endings	Poster advertising the support service Input to group leaflet Group photo Letting balloons go Writing messages to each other	Raising self esteem by focussing on achievements of the group
11	Review appointment	1 to 1 appointments with a) child and b) parent	Identifying further support needs
Ongoing	Various events	Social time to keep in touch with each other	Recognition that grief is ongoing Children need contact with others in a similar situation

Figure 1 Outline of the support programme

RESULTS

Specific communications skills observed

Examples are cited here of specific aspects of communication skills observed. For the sake of clarity, the observations are described with reference to the part of the programme in which they were made rather than as a succession of individual events. Hence, the numbered sections below refer to the numbering of the sessions in Figure 1, above. The initial 'admission' assessments were not observed by the researcher but some interviewees who took part in Investigation 4 refer to this aspect of the programme.

1.

The use of 'circle time' seemed to the researcher to be important in the interactions between counsellors, helpers and the children. Cold drinks and sweets and crisps were available when the children arrived and throughout 'circle time'. This opening phase of the session seemed to serve more than one purpose. It gave the children an opportunity to make the transition from the school day to a more relaxed time with a different purpose which was going to be neither education nor complete relaxation. It also allowed children and adults to talk about good and bad things that had happened to them (or someone they knew) during the previous week. A consequence of such sharing of 'good and bad news', of course, was that all of those involved with the group came to know each other very well and a sense of group identity was formed.

The researcher observed that, most often, the 'news' did not refer directly to the loss that had occasioned a child's involvement with the group although the issues ranged from significant problems at school or home to comparatively trivial matters when it seemed that a person did not want to talk about what was really on their mind. From time to time, however, those loss events broke into 'circle time'. One example of this occurred when, in the middle of less

serious discussion, a boy of primary school age, whose father had died from a cerebral haemorrhage, began to speak about how "my dad's brain started to bleed and the doctor said that was why he died because all the blood was coming out". The effect of this, naturally, was that the atmosphere in the room changed suddenly and dramatically. There had been laughter and sympathy up to this point as well as good humoured teasing as others had shared about the trials of school (like detention) and home (like as brothers and sisters) or good things such as "it was my birthday and my mum got a big cake for me". For an instant no-one spoke but the counsellor leading the group spoke across the room to this boy, "That must have been really sad, X?" Her facial expression, gestures and general body posture did not change. Her tone did reflect genuineness. The child responded and the conversation moved on. The impression made by this interaction was twofold: 1) the tone used by the counsellor was empathic, communicating a sense of understanding how this child felt and 2) the style of communication adopted by the counsellor appeared to give permission to this child, and therefore to the whole group, to talk about loss and its effects rather than 'shutting him up' and moving on. In this way, the style of communication seemed to underline that it is normal to feel what we feel about loss and that it is normal to talk about it.

In the activity in which ground rules for the programme were negotiated, counsellors and helpers did not impose ground rules of their choice upon the children who, in fact, always came up with the kind of guidelines that the adults would have wanted for the group such as confidentiality and not all talking at once. It seemed clear to the researcher that this negotiation communicated great respect and value on the part of the counsellors and helpers towards all of the children.

2.

The body collage activity involved each child being given a length of lining paper so that someone else could draw around their body outline. The child whose outline had been drawn on that paper was then asked to draw or glue images onto the paper which would result in a depiction of themselves. The idea is to represent what kind of individual the child is rather than to realistically represent their appearance. For this task, the children were asked to work together in pairs.

The researcher noted, when observing this activity that the team wisely avoided doing the line drawing themselves which would, of course, have been completely inappropriate. It seemed that this was handled really well since the counsellors managed, without being completely explicit, to encourage the idea that each partner needed to be respectful towards the person of the other. Needless to say, it was arranged that boys drew around boys and girls drew around girls. In every group, all of the children completed the task of drawing around their partner with complete respect. It was clear, from the beginning of the task, that each one was receiving the message of valuing every member of the group.

Another observation of this activity was that counsellors and helpers consistently provided positive reinforcement to every child. Some children preferred to draw onto their body outline rather than to stick images from magazines provided. Artistic talent varied but praise was given liberally, but genuinely, to everyone's efforts. The message reiterated was that the important thing was that each one was depicting their own view of themselves and not competing for an art prize. At the end of the session, rather than being thrown away, the collages were left to dry and kept for a later session. This also underlined the message that the work carried out, and therefore the person doing it, were valued.

3.

The researcher observed, in each of the groups, that children were quite serious about the question and answer session. This consisted of an invitation from the team to write down anonymously and put into a box questions about death and bereavement (or serious illness) which could then be discussed openly in the group without identifying the questioner. Counsellors and helpers took all of the questions as seriously as the children and this reinforced the communication of value for each individual which is central to the ethos of this service. Answers were given honestly and openly without embarrassment or awkwardness.

4.

The children were given a sheet of A4 paper with words listed describing a range of emotions, both positive and negative. They were asked to circle with various coloured pens the emotions that they experience. They used colour coding to depict which emotions they often experience, which ones they sometimes experience and which emotions they never experience. Having circled the words according to such a colour code, they were then asked to cut out the words describing emotions that they do experience and glue them to their collage. The researcher's observation of this activity was that the children had real autonomy throughout the whole process. They decided which emotion words were appropriate for them and which colours to use for the coding. They also decided which parts of their collage they wanted to stick the words to and were able to say why, when asked. An example of this latter observation is that, sometimes, the word 'anger' was cut out and glued to an arm or a leg. The explanation for this choice was sometimes expressed as "well, when I'm angry, I feel like hitting or kicking". (In fact, anger was a less frequent feeling word than words expressing sadness or pain).

Another observation of this activity was of how much variation and individual difference there was between the children in terms of their choices about where and how to arrange the

emotion words on their collages. The conclusions drawn from this observation were that: a) the counsellors had been successful in facilitating individual expression and b) that the children were neither giving nor receiving pressure from others in the group to conform to a particular response. This confirmed the researcher's impression that each one felt sufficiently valued not to feel the need for that pattern of behavioural interaction to figure in the group dynamics.

5.

Children attending the group were given the opportunity to create a lasting memorial to the person lost. Again, an open communication style was employed by all of the counsellors and helpers. Children were not only allowed but in fact were encouraged to make their own choices about the nature of the memorial and about decisions concerning its appearance.

6.

In the groups observed, the sixth week was usually needed for carrying on with the activity begun in week 5. Most often, the activity served as a catalyst for discussion about the people who had died. On one of these occasions, one of the adolescents shared during the conversation that a baby sibling had died but the rest of the group did not believe this 'story'. The counsellors and helpers present were able to reinforce that this was, in fact, true. The dissension had been over the question of whether babies *do* die. The majority of the group had been convinced that babies are too young to die. The adults were able to support what had been said without appearing to be judgemental towards the rest of the group. This, in the researcher's estimation, showed considerable skill in communication to be able to achieve both of these aims simultaneously.

7.

In weeks 7 and 8, the groups were often split into two halves which swapped activities in week 8. This was because one of the two activities was to visit a part of the hospice which was equipped with quite sophisticated play facilities, including computers and a sensory room. The other activity, for the half of the group not going that day to the 'play' activity, was to make a 'worry box'. This activity consisted of making and decorating a box, again according to personal choices, into which the child could place any notes that they had made about things that were worrying them. The box was to be kept at home to facilitate this function. The rationale was that the box serves to help in the process of externalising anxieties. One boy was observed hiding the box that he had made rather than taking it home. The team did not confront this child in any way but the fact was noted during the post-group evaluation. A decision was made to try to find opportunity for this child to talk about things if he wished to do so. This became possible the next week when the child himself raised various issues and the team member was able to engage in a helpful conversation with him.

8.

The half of the group that did not do the 'worry box' activity were able to visit the sensory room and play facilities provided in a part of the hospice building other than the part of the building where the group sessions took place. Having half of the group provided opportunity for one to one conversations more readily than many other activities might have done. The team took care to establish, each week, that the areas which were to be used were not required at that time for any other users of the hospice services. This activity was always evaluated by each group as one of the best weeks of the whole programme. Even though the activity, being a play opportunity, did not appear to be as serious or as focussed upon loss as did other weeks, it was not unusual for children to share quite deeply about their feelings during these times. One week, for example, two children spent some time playing the piano and this led to

some sharing of feelings about anger. It was clear to everyone that this had been a very helpful experience.

9.

In week 9, children were asked to write down activities, things and people that support them in their lives and make them feel good. Each one of these was to be written on a single sheet of A4 paper. When everyone had completed this task, the sheets of A4 paper were put together on the floor in an open area to make a 'wall' of support. The team then took a group photograph so that each child could have a picture of their group as well as of the 'wall' of support to remind them, after the programme had finished, that they do have support. Sometimes, in the preparatory task, disclosures were made about things that were still a challenge rather than a support.

10.

This session included writing messages for each of the other group members. These were invariably positive and revealed the degree of peer support that the children obtained from attending the programme. In this session, also, they prepared messages for the person lost and attached them to balloons which were then released outside the building. The children were asked to conduct their own evaluation of the programme. The content of the evaluations proved to be very reassuring for the team because the comments were overwhelmingly positive but they proved useful also for making judgments about what particular activities had worked better than others so that the next group could benefit from adjustments made.

11.

An individual review appointment was made for each child so that they could return in week 11 for one to one assessment with a member of the team. Questions discussed included whether the programme had been helpful and whether any further help was needed.

12.

Provision was made in the team's planning for there to be continued contact particularly between the children themselves since the peer support aspect of the programme seemed so strong. Eventually, it became possible to organise a special day out each year to which all the children were invited. One of the good things observed on those days was the way in which the older children were very supportive towards the younger members of the group.

ANALYSIS

The aspects of communication skills identified in the specific observations listed, above, were analysed using a framework provided by the 'core conditions' of person centred counselling (Rogers, 1967) and the principal concepts from Freire's work, referred to in Chapter 1, above. Using this framework, the examples of communication observed were 'mapped' to the Rogerian core conditions of warmth and empathy and to Freire's ideas of the 'subject', of 'speaking one's own word' and of dialogue. This mapping process was not a case of excluding some concepts in favour of others; all of the concepts from both sources were compared with each of the instances of communication listed. The account here simply shows which of the concepts seemed to 'match' the interactions most appropriately.

1) **Warmth**

Example 1 includes the practice of providing refreshments when the children arrived and throughout circle time. Rogers (1967, page 52) defines what he calls "warmth" as being the opposite of being distant, aloof and "professional" in an impersonal way. It is suggested here that the practice of creating of a welcoming, 'normal', environment by providing drinks and snacks in this way constitutes an example of warmth as understood in person centred counselling.

2) Empathy

Example 1 contains the interaction in which a child had spoken about how his "dad's brain started to bleed". A counsellor intervened by observing, "That must have been really sad?". The empathic tone and the quality of genuineness evinced, gave permission to the child to discuss a distressing experience but also demonstrated that the counsellor was able to 'sustain' the distress involved (Symington, 1986). As already pointed out in the account of Example 1, above, the counsellor demonstrated, throughout the interaction, a sense of understanding how the child felt. This ability to 'see through the eyes of another' is central to definitions of empathy (Argyle, 1991; Kalisch, 1971; Eisenberg and Strayer (1987).

It was interesting to note that children supported each other. The older children, for instance, have been very supportive to the younger members of the group during the day out (see Example 12). This kind of support may, of course, have happened no matter what type of communication had been modelled by the counsellors and helpers. If this peer support and empathic behaviour between children from the different groups was not the result of social learning (Bandura, 1977), it may, at least, be reasonable to claim that, by engaging in empathic communication, the counsellors and helpers had created an atmosphere in which children felt free to be empathic.

3) Speaking one's own word

Numerous instances occur in the Examples, above, of children 'speaking their own word' (Freire, 1972). Since they are so numerous, they have been simply listed with the Example number from which they are drawn:

i) Circle Time allowed children to talk about good and bad things that had happened to them during the previous week (Example 1).

ii) The primary school age boy who was able to talk about his father's brain "starting to bleed" (Example 1).

iii) The collage activity resulted in each child producing a depiction of themselves (Example 2).

iv) Cutting out and fixing words (to their collage) which depicted their emotions (Example 4).

v) Individual variations in the choices made when carrying out this activity (the body collage) reinforced the idea that children were speaking their own word (Example 4).

vi) Making choices about creating a lasting memorial to the person lost (Example 5).

vii) The children were encouraged to make their own choices about a) the design of their 'worry box' and b) the content of the notes which they placed into the box (Example 7).

viii) The instances of children sharing deeply about their feelings at various times throughout the programme (Example 8).

ix) The instances of children talking about things that were still a challenge rather than a support whilst engaged in the preparatory task for building the 'wall of support' (Example 9).

x) The messages written for the person lost and attached to balloons which were later released outside the building (Example 10).

4) Dialogue

'Speaking one's own word' is closely connected to the process of 'dialogue' since, it is argued here, and also in Freire's work, that *facilitation* of speaking one's own word takes place in a context of dialogue. For example, in a chapter in which he engages in a lengthy description of the conditions required for dialogue, Freire (1972, pages 60 – 65) argues that, "Consequently, no one can say a true word alone – nor can he say it *for* another, in a prescriptive act which robs others of their words".

Instances of dialogue which may be cited from the Examples listed, above, include:

i) The open discussion of questions concerning death and bereavement (Example 3).

ii) The discussion which took place with a child who hid the 'worry box' that he had made at the previous week's session (Example 7).

iii) The writing of messages for other group members and for the person lost (Example 10). It is suggested here that these activities implicitly involve some communication with oneself (Newson, 1992) and that 'dialogue', as Freire argues, is the means for 'conscientization' (1972).

5) Subjects

Just as 'speaking one's own word' and 'dialogue' are closely linked, so an individual's functioning as a 'subject' (according to Freire's understanding of the term) is implicitly related to both of the other concepts referred to in this analysis. It is proposed in this investigation that the communication skills used by counsellors and helpers have a directly facilitative effect upon children attending the groups. Some instances of children functioning as 'subjects' are now listed from the Examples of the communication skills observed:

i) The giving of permission by a counsellor to a child implicitly signalled that each child had the right to communicate what they, that is, the children, decided they wanted to say (Example 1).

ii) Counsellors and helpers did not impose ground rules on the groups but asked them to formulate their own list (Example 1).

iii) The counsellors encouraged group members to behave respectfully towards each other (Example 2).

iv) The real autonomy that children had in each of the various activities (Example 4).

v) The successful avoiding of pressure to conform to a particular response (Example 4).

vi) Encouraging children to make their own choices (Example 5 and Example 6).

vii) Asking children to conduct their own evaluation of the programme (Example 10).

DISCUSSION

1) Summary of Findings

A bereavement support service and a child bereavement support programme (which is run within that service) have been described briefly. The researcher's participant observation of the children's support programme was reported. As a result of that observation, ten examples of communication skills employed by counsellors and helpers (working with the child bereavement support groups) were analysed using a framework based upon key concepts from Rogers (1967) and from the work of Freire (1972). Concepts from Rogers (1967) which 'mapped' to the examples of communication skills were 'warmth' and 'empathy'. Concepts from Freire (1972) which 'mapped' were 'speaking one's own word', 'dialogue' and 'subjects'. The analysis showed that the counsellors and helpers observed in the children's groups consistently employed a facilitative communication style rather than a controlling communication style.

2) Comment on the analytic approach

The framework for the study is the set of concepts taken from the work of Freire (1972). The principal concept from that framework, used for the purpose of analysis in this study, which seems to occur in this investigation is the notion of "subjects" (1972, page 21 and 58). It would be pertinent then to ask whether, in fact, the analysis of communication skills recounted here provides a full enough account of the function of signs within the approach used by counsellors and helpers in this child bereavement programme. The identification of this question suggests that further investigation is needed to explore what the counsellors and helpers themselves understand the aims of their approach to be and that such further investigation may allow a fuller answer to the question of what sign systems operate within the practice observed. Pending the reporting of that further investigation, a temporary answer to the question is given here. At least one paradigmatic set operates within the approach used by counsellors and helpers in the child bereavement programme observed. The paradigm which seems to operate is that of empathy. Communication practices which feature in that approach are used for the purpose of social facilitation rather than for purposes of social regulation.

3) Evaluative Comments

It was concluded that this investigation provided some helpful observations and that the analysis of the communication skills observed supported assumptions about counselling practice in the child bereavement service. In addition, it allowed for the observation and reporting of the effects of that practice upon the children in the support groups. Those effects seemed to be entirely positive and helpful. The conclusion was reached that signs representing

empathy operate within the interactions observed if 'empathy' is understood in the sense referred to in this thesis:

i) The ability to understand, "the positive and negative experiences of another" (Argyle, 1991, page 103);

ii) The ability to communicate such understanding as in Kalisch's (1971) definition of empathy: "the ability to perceive accurately the feelings of another person and to communicate this understanding to him" (sic) and

iii) the ability to help another whilst so 'feeling with' yet not oneself becoming dysfunctional through such 'feeling with'.

For two reasons, the use of participant observation as a strategy for this investigation seemed appropriate. Firstly, without being present it would not have been possible to report what communication skills were actually used in the group support sessions. Secondly, non-participant observation may well have had an inhibiting effect upon both children and counsellors. The presence of a person who would, in effect, seem to be a 'stranger' to the group might well have prevented children from being so open in their own communication and, in this way, could have obstructed the purpose of the various sessions from being fulfilled.

Chapter 8

Investigation 4: An exploration of communication strategies used by counsellors with bereaved children conducted via interviews with counsellors and other support programme team members

Having observed the communication that took place between counsellors, helpers and children during the bereavement support programme sessions, a decision was taken to discover whether the researcher's interpretation of those observations would be corroborated by interviewing members of the team and asking a series of questions designed to ascertain their own perceptions of working with bereaved children (and children facing serious illness of a family member) and to identify their approach in terms of communication. The theoretical and empirical background relevant to this investigation is discussed in Chapter 1 of this thesis. It will be seen from that chapter that aspects of the literature such as the effects of loss upon children and the role of appropriate communication in "grief resolution", including empathic communication by professionals, are relevant to this investigation. The justification of this investigation will also be apparent from that chapter and from the aim already stated, above.

METHOD

1) Design

The investigation design could be described as an analysis of texts derived from a cross sectional study (Silverman, 2000) since the researcher did manipulate any variables and did not return to any of the interviewees to re-interview them or obtain further data. The purpose of the interviews was to obtain texts which might provide evidence of the signs used by team members in their approach to supporting bereaved children and children facing serious illness of a family member. The practice, described by Hollway and Jefferson (2000) of exploring connotations by using subjective responses was applied in this investigation and this use of the subjective impressions and judgment of the researcher matches the principle employed in the methods of analysis adopted for the other investigations included in this study. The

framework for the researcher's judgements of what was noteworthy was provided by the concepts from the work of Freire already discussed in Chapter 2, above.

2) Participants

The sample consisted of 4 qualified counsellors and 2 adult helpers. Two participants were able to speak from a perspective of being both counsellor and nurse or helper and nurse.

3) Ethical Issues

The informed consent of all participants was obtained. Permission to conduct this particular investigation was obtained from the relevant manager of the organisation through which the programme is offered. All of the participants were assured that confidentiality would be maintained. Participants were also assured of their right to withdraw from the investigation at any time, although none did. Approval had already been obtained from the NHS Local Research Ethics Committee.

4) Resources

The only specific resources required for the observation were a cassette recorder and cassette to tape the interviews, a transcribing machine, and a notebook and pen for the researcher to record any salient observations.

5) Procedure

Appointments were made with each participant at a time convenient for them and for the service. Interviews were conducted in the counselling rooms available at the counselling centre. There were no telephones in the rooms and a '*Do not disturb. Counselling in progress.*' sign was used for the outside of the door to ensure privacy. The plan for the interview was outlined at the beginning of the meeting and tissues, water and hot drinks were available if required. After a few moments of informal conversation to allow for participants

to relax, each respondent was taken through the schedule of prepared questions (see Appendix 1) with extra questions and comments added when clarification or elaboration was needed.

RESULTS

The interviews were transcribed and an analysis of the responses was conducted using a framework adapted from the work of Freire already discussed in Chapter 2, above. The terms 'object' and 'subject' are employed here as in Freire's understanding of those words.

The findings are summarised here:

<u>Texts and practices</u>

1. "Having choice" (children)
2. "Having very little control" (children)
3. "often it's not the child's issue, it's the parent's"
4. "Who is it that's got a problem here?"
5. "clearly upset and dealing with issues"
6. "children have a right not to have the grief battles around them projected onto them"
7. "children can get round to all of this"... "clearly processing her own issues"
8. "when something is really pressing, they will communicate to you in a very direct fashion"
9. "assisting the child"
10. Practice of open communication
11. "I wouldn't push anything"
12. "at the end of the day, I have to over-ride that" (referring to the counsellor's own desire to 'protect')
13. Children's practice of protecting others
14. "but not to make assumptions about what they *do* want to express"
15. "establishing a rapport"
16. Practice of self-disclosure
17. Practice of using language appropriate to the child's developmental stage
18. Practice of giving opportunity for creativity
19. Information volunteered about practices of other professionals which concern the counsellors
20. "giving them space"
21. Giving responsibility
22. "children should be allowed to experience their own feelings"
23. "establishing trust"
24. Children's practice of confiding in counsellors and helpers
25. Giving respect (reducing power issues) (treat as a person)
26. Working with anger by being open about it (for example, pointing out non-verbal cues)
27. "accepting people for who they are"

28. Goal is "to express" (that is, the child) "whatever they want to deal with in whatever way they want to deal with it"
29. Empathy
30. "Accepting distress"
31. Practice of some professionals of "walking away from distress"
32. "They support one another" (children)

Texts/practices 19 and 31 relate to information about experiences with other professionals which contributed to children's difficulties or contributed in an unhelpful way to the work of the counsellors interviewed. These texts/practices will be discussed separately.

1) Children as subjects

Under this heading are included the related concepts of 'speaking one's own word' and 'freedom' (Freire, 1972). In other words, this section deals with those texts and practices which show counsellors and helpers communicating in a way which allows children to be autonomous and gives them freedom to deal with the issues which they chose to address. This communication style is clearly in complete accord with the ethos of person-centred counselling. In counselling work with adult clients, this approach would be an assumed prerequisite. Some adults may, however, have different expectations about working with children. It was very clear that all of the counsellors and helpers interviewed for this investigation approached the children in group work and in one to one counselling as 'subjects' rather than 'objects'.

This approach can be seen in Texts 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 11, 12, 14, 15, 20, 21, 22, 23, 25, 27 and 32. Counsellors spoke about providing a setting in which children were able to make choices about making changes in their lives (Text 1) but contrasted this with a number of instances where a child's problems might have been caused or exacerbated by adults in the family imposing their own choices or problems on the child. A counsellor gave an example to illustrate this: a boy in one group was angry in every session until the very end of the

164

programme. His anger would manifest in a disruptive way in the group sessions. Eventually, he became really angry and said, "I'm not upset. I *was* upset about X dying but I've got over it now. It's my mum that should be coming for counselling". Texts 2, 3, 4 and 6 relate to this issue of adults' problems and choices being imposed over children's choices.

Texts 5, 7 and 8 refer to the counsellors' experience of seeing children decide to address whatever may be upsetting them when given a context in which they have the freedom to make choices about whether to do so, when to do so and how to do so. The counsellors' deliberate policy of treating children in the same person-centred way as they would treat adults can be seen in Texts 9, 11, 20 and 21. They talk about "assisting" rather than 'doing something for them' or 'treating' in some way. One counsellor said, "I wouldn't push anything" and exploration of this statement revealed that her meaning was that she would follow the path decided by the children for addressing whatever was upsetting them.

Quite rightly, however, counsellors emphasised that they establish ground rules about behaviour. (In the group programme, ground rules were negotiated by the whole group at the beginning of the programme). One counsellor explained that her conversation with a child would include the message that, "I will never ever judge you or how you feel but I will set limits about your behaviour". She related that her experience was that children felt safe when made aware that the counsellor was taking responsibility in this way for the well being of each person. This was seen as perfectly congruent with the ideas in Texts 20 and 21 where counsellors spoke about the objective being to give space for exploration and expression of feelings and to give responsibility to children for what they do about their feelings.

All of the counsellors and helpers spoke about the issue of respect for children and Text 25 is included as an excellent illustration of what they meant by this word. The counsellor from whose interview this text is actually cited spoke passionately about her aim of "reducing power issues" in her counselling work with children. When asked to elaborate, she explained that her aim was to treat each child as a person rather a 'subordinate' or a 'patient'. One statement that this counsellor made during the interview was that she aims to show children that she also is vulnerable and "not the all-powerful counsellor who has all the answers". All of the counsellors and helpers expressed similar ideas; this particular person expressed the idea quite passionately and clearly.

Another counsellor spoke of the practice of sometimes physically getting to the level of the child if they had chosen to sit on the floor, for example, and that this was seen by the counsellor as a means of non-verbally reducing "power issues". Yet another counsellor related how one child had arrived for their first appointment physically hiding behind their mother. The counsellor, having asked if he liked football, decided to spend the first 15 minutes of the session playing football in the garden of the counselling centre with this child who, according to the receptionist, went out at the end of the session "looking like a completely different child" in terms of non-verbal signs of apprehension. The remaining 45 minutes of the 'real' session had been conducted in a more productive way than would otherwise have been the case.

Text 15 and Text 23, "establishing a rapport" and "establishing trust" imply treating children as people; it is hard to imagine having any kind of trust in or rapport with someone without doing so. It is suggested also that Text 13 and Text 32, a practice referred to by all of the interviewees, implies that the children are communicating and functioning in the groups as

subjects. If they are protecting and helping each other, they are, by definition, not oppressing one another. An example of this protection and help was witnessed by the researcher when observing one of the primary school age groups. One of the boys began to look upset and someone asked him what was the matter. It seemed difficult for him to answer but another boy in the group simultaneously a) defused the tension of the moment in the group and b) supported and protected the other boy by saying "He's trying not to cry because he's thinking about X" (that is, the person in his family who had died). This statement *supported* because a peer was giving permission to be upset and *protected* because the boy himself no longer felt under pressure from others in the group to answer.

Text 22, "allowing children to experience their own feelings" and Text 27, "accepting people for who they are", indicate an approach to counselling which a) deliberately avoids the kind of protection in which adults often engage, perhaps unconsciously, to actually protect themselves from children's distress and b) gives permission to children to be open and honest about their feelings and their lives.

2) Children as objects

Some of the texts obtained from interviewing counsellors and helpers showed their interpretation of the signs, both in talk and in practices employed by some parents and by some other professionals as revealing a view of children more as 'objects' (in Freire's use of the word, 1972) than a subjects. Texts 2, 3, 4 and 6, whilst implicitly showing the counsellors' approach to working with children, also show that they have encountered cases where adults have "projected" their own battles onto a child or who has a relative who is seriously ill. One instance was cited, above, where, in fact, a child himself was aware that his mother needed counselling support but she could not recognise that he himself had worked through feelings

which had previously been causing him difficulties. The implication of such accounts from the counsellors is that adults in those instances were not seeing the children as people.

Texts 19 and 31 specifically refer to the practices of some other professionals. Whilst the team valued their collaboration with colleagues in education, health care and social care, they recounted experiences where not all professionals had been able to treat children facing issues surrounding death and serious illness as subjects. When the service had first been launched, they had tried, with little success, to find leaflets or booklets that might be helpful in explaining to children about funerals. One funeral director who was contacted had replied, "We don't have any call for that" and the counsellor being interviewed for this study saw this reply as indicating not only the lack of recognition on the part of the funeral director but also on the part of other adults involved with bereaved children who, at least in that locality, did not feel the need to ask for helpful literature on that topic.

A counsellor related a story where a teacher had played 'hangman' with a class even though one member of the class was a child who, one week earlier, had lost their father through suicide by hanging. The counsellor was aware of the effect upon the child and one of the major differences seemed to be that the counsellor was aware of the potential (in this case, actual) effect upon a child whereas the teacher had not been sensitive to that possibility. Another story concerned a child who was in detention every day. This child was in a home situation with a parent facing serious illness. The counsellor's conclusion was that this teacher had been unable to look beyond the immediate behaviour of the child and connect it to the child's circumstances even though those circumstances were known to the teacher. The counsellors reported that, whilst they had excellent working relationships with many schools

and education professionals, there were some schools in their catchment area that *never* referred children to the service.

3) Naming the world

This concept of Freire's is contrasted with another of his ideas which is referred to as "speaking the word of another". Texts 5, 7, 8, 10, 14, 16, 18, 24, 26 and 28 refer to these concepts. Texts 5, 7 and 8 have already been discussed in the context of seeing children as subjects. These same texts show that the experience of counsellors in this service is that children do deal with their own feelings and achieve ways of communicating with themselves and others about their own feelings and experiences.

Text 28 shows that the goal of counsellors in this centre is to give opportunity to children to express their feelings about the issues that concern them in ways which they (the children) find helpful. It is clear that this is achieved by allowing children to "speak their own word" rather than that of another. The practice of open communication (Text 10), the practice of not making assumptions about what children do want to express (Text 14) and the practice of modelling self-disclosure (Text 16) on the part of counsellors (about anger and other feelings) all encourage the possibility of children "speaking their own word" and "naming their world".

All of the interviewees talked about encouraging creativity as part of their communication approach in working with children (Text 18). An instance of "naming the world" which involved creativity using a non-verbal medium was recounted by one interviewee. A child in one to one counselling was not able to articulate verbally his feelings of isolation and separation. The counsellor at this stage did not know that this was what was preoccupying the child. In one session this child picked up some pebbles and used them to represent each

member of his family. The spacing showed the distance that he felt separated him and the counsellor was able to pick up on this non-verbal information by asking questions about why he had spaced the pebbles out as he had. It was then that the child was able to describe his world as it then was for him.

Another counsellor cited her practice of picking up on non-verbal cues such as posture in order to help a child to speak about negative emotions such as anger. The example she gave was of saying to a child, "The way you're sitting makes me think you're really angry about something but I haven't done anything to make you angry, have I?" (Text 26). All of the counsellors and helpers spoke about the sense of privilege they feel because the children feel able to confide in them (Text 24). Telling another about something that you haven't confided in anyone else does, it is suggested here, contain an element of "naming the world" that you are experiencing.

4) Empathy

Reference has already been made, in Chapter 2, above, to Fromm's statement (1964) defining sadism as treating a person as though they were a thing. It could be argued that a converse principle is true: if a human being is treated as a person, there is some degree of empathy at work. Texts obtained from these interviews which illustrate the operation of empathy are: 12, 16, 17, 23, 26, 27, 29 and 30. It seems reasonable to propose that the kind of communication which can be described as 'empathic' actually constitutes a variety of 'dialogue' in the sense in which Freire uses that term. It was noted, in Chapter 2, that Freire understands 'dialogue' as an "encounter by which the world is named". For this reason, 'empathy' in communication is seen in this analysis as an aspect of the framework that based upon Freire's work (1972).

Empathy is cited as a text/practice specifically referred to by interviewees (Text 29). They frequently mentioned this as a part of their repertoire of counselling skills. Sometimes it was called 'empathy' whilst, at other times, counsellors talked about aiming to "look through the child's eyes" in all situations and described how "you feel for that child" when they were specifically talking about children's distress.

Text 12 was taken from an interview in which a counsellor was discussing the issue of adults seeking to protect children from distress. She concluded her comments on this issue by saying, "At the end of the day, I have to override that" and, when asked to elaborate, she explained that her understanding of empathy meant that she had to put aside her 'natural instinct' to protect from distress by giving permission to the child to experience their own emotions. This process of 'overriding', it is suggested here, is at the heart of a definition of professional empathy and can be compared helpfully with the definition described in Chapter 2 of this thesis.

Reference was made, above, to comments from another counsellor about the use of self-disclosure. Text 16 refers to this practice and the belief that revealing one's own vulnerability or referring to one's own negative emotions enables a child to trust the counsellor and to benefit from the empathic communication in which the counsellor is engaging. This point also relates to Text 23. Clearly, the use of age appropriate language (Text 17) will facilitate communication with a child and can be seen as part of the repertoire of empathic communication since it implicitly involves "looking through the child's eyes". The practice referred to in Text 26 also implies that empathy is at work in the counsellor's approach since it requires some observation of and insight into how people feel if a counsellor is going to be able to use the technique of picking up on non-verbal cues to facilitate discussion and

exploration of those feelings on the part of the client. Text 27, accepting people for who they are, and Text 30, accepting people's distress, both seem to fit directly with the concept of empathy since, without these practices, it would not really be possible for empathic communication to take place.

DISCUSSION

1) Summary of Findings

In this investigation, 32 texts were culled from 6 interviews with counsellors and helpers. The texts were analysed using a framework based upon key concepts from the work of Freire (1972). The analysis showed that the texts referred to communicative practices which were based upon a view of children as 'subjects' rather than as 'objects'. Analysis of the texts also showed that a principal aim in the work of the bereavement counselling and support service was to allow children to 'name their own world' and that this was achieved by counsellors' use of empathy and specific related communication skills.

2) Paradigm sets.

As already stated, above, in previous chapters, texts and practices were included under the heading 'texts' following Vygotsky's belief in the relationship between action and meaning (1978) and Freire's view that praxis cannot be reduced to verbalism and activism (1972).

The analysis demonstrated the functioning of signs belonging to 'object' as well as 'subject' paradigm sets. As far as the concept of 'objects' is concerned (Freire, 1972), the texts analysed here refer to objects in the communicative practices of some other professionals although they do not actually occur in the discourse used by the counsellors and helpers. When speaking about their own approach to helping children, the interviewees in this

investigation had referred to the discourse and practice used by some other professionals which they had not found helpful to the children using their service or to themselves in their work. These practices involved avoidance of children's distress and treatment of children as 'objects'. It has been seen very clearly that the approach used in the work of these counsellors and helpers was based upon the concept of children as 'subjects', in Freire's understanding of that term.

The counsellors and helpers all used a person-centred approach in accordance with the thinking of Rogers' ideas (1967) about 'therapy' and personhood although none of them were slavish followers of that one author or of any other. In a sense, to be centred upon the ideas of Rogers, or any other writer, could be said to be a deviation from being person-centred. The system of meanings might be described as consistent with a humanist world view in which people are important and to be treated with respect. In such a perspective, people should be in charge of their own lives as far as possible and, for this reason, counsellors will tend to take a non-directive approach. Fulfilment of potential, in this world view, would be seen as an important goal.

More than one interviewee used terms such as 'non-judgmental' and 'empathy' during the course of the interviews and these terms speak of facilitation rather than control. The discussion around words such as 'power' and 'respect' might also be seen as pertaining to paradigm sets of facilitation versus control. Clearly, the communicative practices of counsellors and helpers reported here do not sanction oppression. The use of Freire's concepts as a framework for analysing the communication employed by counsellors and helpers in this investigation reveals their practice of employing a facilitative style of communication. It also seems clear that the definitions from discourse analysis as understood by many within critical

psychology with which this analysis is incongruent are those which are focussed on issues of power, dominance and oppression. It is suggested in this study that a) there is more to the discourse or "interpersonal meaning" aspect of communication (Halliday, 1978; Mercer, 1996) than issues of power, dominance and oppression and b) that discourse, in this wider understanding of the term, includes the facilitative as well as the regulatory function of social communication.

3) Evaluative Comments

From an evaluative point of view, it seemed clear that this investigation had proved worthwhile. It allowed the identification of communication strategies employed by the counsellors and helpers and, in so doing, it confirmed the conclusions that had been drawn from the observational study. This meant that it was not simply the researcher's own impression that the team were using skills based in an empathic approach but that it was their intention to do so based on deeply held views of how adults may helpfully communicate with children in order, in turn, to facilitate the children's communication with others and with themselves. This was done without 'priming' the respondents and, in this respect, it seemed apparent that the semi-structured interview schedule had been successful in the achievement of the purpose of the investigation.

There was only one aspect of the data collection which would have been changed and that was the inclusion in the schedule of questions which attempted to elicit information about other disciplines. This did not really work as intended. Interviewees actually provided more relevant information about other professionals, in an 'unsolicited' way, when they were responding to other parts of the interview schedule. The questions which had been intended for this purpose were not well understood by the counsellors because they were not easily able

to project themselves into a scenario relating to the work of a completely different discipline whose practice they had not experienced at first hand. It was only in the process of transcribing and analysing that this became completely apparent. The experience did, however, show that a researcher should try to obtain data about a group only from members of that group unless, of course, it is a clear part of the remit to elicit impressions or opinions of another group. In that case, a researcher would need to be much clearer about what it is they wished to find out. In fact, as already stated, above, the respondents supplied some observations about the approach of some members of other professions which revealed significant differences in communication styles.

Investigation 5: An evaluation of the support programme using qualitative data from brief interviews with participating children

METHOD

1) **Design**.

The investigation design could be described as a cross sectional study (Silverman, 2000) since there were no pre and post test measures or observations. Evaluation interviews were conducted using a semi- structured interview schedule.

2) **Participants**

The sample consisted of 24 children. Since these were pre-existing groups, the sample could be described as a convenience sample (Neale and Liebert, 1986). The 24 children belonged to two separate groups; the sessions for children of primary school age and those for children of secondary school age were each run on a different evening of the week after school and took place on the premises of the bereavement counselling service. There were both girls and boys in each of the two groups. The team of counsellors and adult helpers was the same for both groups. There were 15 children attending the sessions for those of primary school age and 9 attending the sessions for those of secondary school age. The 24 children who took part in this evaluation were the same 24 children who participated in the support programme observed in Investigation 3 of this study.

3) **Ethical Issues**

These aspects of Investigation 5 have already been addressed in the equivalent section of the account given of Investigation 3 in Chapter 7 of this thesis. To avoid duplication, the information is not repeated here.

4) Resources

Apart from a set of line drawings (see Appendix 4) and the schedule of questions (see Appendix 4), the only specific resources required for the observation were a notebook and pen for the researcher to record responses during each interview.

5) Procedure

At the end of each twelve week support programme, the researcher conducted a brief evaluative interview with each of the children. In order to respect the concerns expressed by the various research ethics committees that children should not be "subjected" to prolonged questioning (quoting a comment made by one of the committees; see Chapter 4), this interview was limited to a few moments at the end of the session and was not tape recorded. The interviews were quite brief and the researcher was able to make notes of the salient content of the replies. The door of the counselling room was deliberately left open throughout each of these interviews and an adult volunteer was working within sight of the researcher at all times.

A schedule of questions had been prepared by the researcher for this interview in order to elicit information about who and what the children had found helpful during the time since their loss or since they had become aware of the sad news about a family member being seriously ill. Whilst preparing the evaluative investigation, the researcher had decided to use a 'projective' instrument as a way of obtaining some information about this aspect of the children's experience without subjecting children to prolonged questioning. Since the researcher has no ability in graphic art, an artist was commissioned to draw a series of pictures of the various possible dyads of children and their surviving parent; a sample from that series can be seen in Appendix 4. The idea of the 'projective' test was to elicit

information from the children about who had been helpful, and why, without directly probing their own experience and, thereby, risking causing distress.

The procedure adopted was to, first of all, explain to the child what the brief session was about and check that they still consented to take part in the evaluation and then to present each child with a copy of the drawing of the dyad which matched their own circumstances. So, for example, a primary school age girl whose father had died would be presented with a copy of the drawing showing a girl of her age accompanied by an adult woman. A set of pictures was available for each possible variation of ages and ethnicities. The child being interviewed would then be told:

"This x year old girl's Dad has died. This picture shows her with her Mum. Apart from her Mum, who do you think will have helped this girl? Will you draw into the picture anyone that might have helped her?"

When the child being interviewed had finished drawing, she would then be asked:

"What do you think it was that that person/those people did, that was helpful to the girl in the picture?"

When the interview had been completed, each child was thanked for their contribution and rejoined the group.

6) Results

This procedure was run with the first group of children attending the programme and with which also the researcher was involved. It soon became obvious that both primary school age children and secondary school age children preferred to talk directly about their own experience and feelings. In every interview, each child would say something like, "Well *my* Mum helped me but my Gran did as well" or "With me it was my best friend… that helped me most". They would also respond directly to the question about what it was that had been helpful. "My best friend always let me talk about things where [as], with most people, you

could tell they didn't want to talk about it". In response to both questions, every child immediately referred the scenario to themselves and answered directly to the indirect questions. For this reason, with subsequent groups, the use of the projective instrument was abandoned and the questions were simply put directly to each child about their own experience. The findings from those interviews are now summarised.

Summary of brief interviews conducted at Week 12.

The children, without fail, in both age groups, immediately related the questions to themselves and, in every case, it was clear that they welcomed the opportunity to talk about who and what had helped them and why that was the case.

Those who had helped them included family members, friends at school, friends outside school and teachers. All of the children cited the counsellors, the helpers and the other children at the bereavement group as one of the greatest sources of help. A recurring comment about the helpfulness of spending time with other children at the group was that those children understood very well the issues faced by their peers in the support programme where peers at school or in the neighbourhood might not have the same understanding.

When asked what it was that was helpful, the answer most often given was the freedom to talk about how they felt and this was true whether the 'helpful person' was involved with the group or not. Some children volunteered the information that they felt "more free" to talk to people at the group or with their best friend than to people at home because they did not want to upset family members that they knew were themselves grieving.

Many of the children said that they had appreciated being listened to by counsellors, helpers and other children in the group. Some children said that the most helpful thing had been the

assessment which took place at the beginning and at the end of the twelve week programme. On the basis of responses to supplementary questions, the conclusion that can be drawn is that the assessment involved being asked about their own experience and feelings in a context where doing so would not lead to anyone else getting upset.

When asked about communicating with the person lost, many of the children in the group said that they had continued to talk to that person and that they found it helpful to do so.

After comparing the comments and replies (noted during the interviews) with the framework based upon Friere's concepts, it seemed clear that the children taking part were 'speaking their own word' and 'naming the world' that they encountered at the support group and, in this way, were engaging in dialogue. Since they all reported that they were 'doing better' in terms of getting on with life and overcoming the problems which had led to their being referred to the support service, the researcher felt, tentatively, that the conclusion could be drawn that these children had developed some new understanding of their situation. If it was, in fact, the case that new understanding had developed, then it would be the researcher's contention that semiotic mediation must have operated at some point.

The conclusion is 'tentative' because it is based upon qualitative data and the children's own reports about themselves. Having said that, it could be said that those reports involve the children being allowed to have their own voice and that expression does have a certain type of validity. With one exception, the parents of these children also reported that the children were doing better at the end of the programme in comparison with how they had been at the beginning. The one exception was that of a child who was at the group because the mother believed it was a good idea whilst the child believed that it was the parent who 'needed counselling'.

7) Discussion

The qualitative data showed that most children found help from surviving parents, from other family members, from peers and from the support programme. The help derived from the support programme was from peers as well as from adult counsellors and helpers. The common denominator, across all sources of help, was being able to talk, being listened to, being allowed to be upset and not having to worry about others being upset.

Reflecting on this investigation involved a consideration of the process and of the findings not only in relation to any intrinsic value of Investigation 5 but also in relation to the principal themes of the study as a whole. That reflection led to the identification of some successes and of some limitations. These are summarised, below: A summary of successful aspects of this investigation would include:

1) Interviewing bereaved children without causing distress and so showing that this is perfectly possible;

2) Interviewing bereaved children and finding that they actually appreciate being able to talk about their experience;

3) Finding from the observations of the group programme that discursive practices operating via peer support can facilitate and

4) Finding from the observations of the group programme that discursive practices operating via adult support can facilitate.

A summary of the limitations of this investigation would include:

1) The small sample size which does not allow for significant quantitative measures to be employed and

2) The brief amount of time devoted to the evaluation interviews limited the possible extent of exploration of the children's perspective on their experience of bereavement and of the support group.

It is the researcher's belief that this study does provide some evidence of facilitative discourse and discursive practices. It seems clear that the programme had a beneficial effect upon the children studied and that the benefit derived from the culture of empathic communication which informs the whole service and the programme.

Previous studies (see Chapter 3) have made tentative conclusions about whether girls or boys, younger or older children, fare better after bereavement and those conclusions were based upon outcomes. The intention has been to obtain evidence which would allow for the identification of predictors of difficulty. Whilst supporting the intention of obtaining such evidence, because the potential benefits of the application of such knowledge are clear, it is, nevertheless, perfectly possible that the true predictor may well be identified by means of the study of the psychological tools (Vygotsky, 1934; 1978) employed by adults involved with grieving and distressed children rather than by the sole means of the study of outcomes in comparison with variables such as gender, age, gender of the parent lost or the nature of the death in terms of whether it had been a sudden or an expected death. In other words, the findings from the investigation reported here suggest that the best predictor of how children fare after bereavement may actually be the operation of dialogue versus the operation of 'silence' as the predominant paradigm in the communication between bereaved children and those who are involved in their lives.

Recommendations for further research.

Some evidence has been obtained, in this investigation, about the benefits of child bereavement support programmes. An infrastructure has now been put in place (in the service where the programme runs) which makes further study more feasible. From those studies it may well be possible to plan services which are focussed even more effectively. Of course, it will also be possible to offer even better advice to parents, teachers and other adults involved with bereaved children.

In the researcher's view, however, there still remains a need to gather information about the mastery of grief in children since the findings so far obtained allow only tentative conclusions. The choices that professionals make about interventions must be based on an understanding of how children at different ages, experiencing different responses to loss, are actually able to move forward in their lives. Studies cited in Chapter 3, and the various investigations reported here, suggest that communication is a vital key and this includes not only the communication between children and their surviving parent but also the communication that allows children to maintain connections to their parent who has died. This latter finding is supported by the qualitative data obtained in carrying out Investigation 5 of this study.

Chapter 10

Discussion

This chapter presents a discussion of the whole study and consists of: 1) a concluding overview of the principal analysis; 2) a discussion of the implications of this study for semiotic analysis; 3) a discussion of the implications of this study for theory; 4) a discussion of the implications of this study for further research and 5) a discussion of the implications of this study for professional practice. The discussion of the whole study, therefore, is presented in five distinct sections according to the list given above.

SECTION 1: A CONCLUDING OVERVIEW OF THE PRINCIPAL ANALYSIS

The purpose of this section is to examine the conclusions reached by means of the five investigations and to go through Freire's (1972) set of concepts drawing together the various threads of the principal analysis and also drawing upon the theoretical constructs from Vygotsky (1934, 1978). By this means, certain conclusions concerning communication in relation to children's grief will be made.

1) Texts.

A number of texts were selected for this analysis. It is not proposed, in this chapter, to reproduce all of the texts from each of the investigations; all of the texts explored in each investigation can be seen in detail in the relevant chapters of the thesis. The texts were selected by a variety of means and it seems worthwhile, in order to illustrate the flexibility of the approach taken, to summarise these here. In Investigation 1, the texts consisted of narratives from adults who had been bereaved as a child. In Investigation 2, the texts consisted of sections and aspects of literary narratives which had been 'noticed' by the researcher, in the sense used by Hollway and Jefferson in their description of their approach to narrative analysis (2000). In Investigation 3, the texts consisted of talk and practices observed in the interactions between the children and counsellors and adult helpers. In

Investigation 4, the texts were reproduced in the comments and answers provided by counsellors and helpers during the interviews about the support programme.

2) Tools and Objects.

Vygotsky's view of the use of psychological tools, including signs, has been utilised as a theoretical underpinning for this study and the work of Friere (1972), including his understanding of the word 'object', has been employed as a framework for implementing the research reported in this thesis.

It would seem an unnecessary duplication to list all of the identified tools again when they have already been listed in the corresponding chapters. It seems potentially more fruitful to briefly compare the investigations in terms of which of them refer to objects and which do not. The word 'objects' is used here to denote that construction, achieved by talk and practices, in social relations, by which some of those affected by the talk and practices are involved without actually having the right or freedom to 'say' anything; a usage consistent with Freire's (1972) use of this word. Seen from this perspective, both Investigation 3 and Investigation 4 could be said *not* to reflect a social reality in which objects are created in such a way as that just described.

The talk and practices selected in those investigations emphasised the children's autonomy, their right to feel that which they felt and to identify and to express those feelings. The talk employed at times of breaking sad news and the talk which surrounded death and bereavement identified in the narratives recounted in Investigation 1, however, for whatever good motives, deprived those individuals of the freedom to 'speak their own word' and to 'name their world' (Freire, 1972). These texts consisted of talk which did *not* communicate important things that needed to be communicated and, thereby, created silence between each

of the four children telling their narratives now as adults and the adults in their world, when they were children, but also, thereby, created a situation for each of those children in which they, too, were compelled to be silent. The practices employed by some professionals mentioned by counsellors in the interviews for Investigation 4 represented a depersonalising way of communicating or failing to communicate with bereaved children and, therefore, by definition, those children were treated as 'objects'. For children to receive no reply when they are trying to communicate something important, be that consciously and verbally or unconsciously and behaviourally, from adults who are entrusted to provide care for them is, it could be argued, to fail to treat them as human beings.

The objects which appear in the texts cited in the 'Ethics' section of Chapter 4 involved the complication that some of those objects were constituted in the texts in such a way that, although they are expressed as 'objects', they also contain implications of some 'subject' realized elsewhere in the texts by means of the rights of some person or body to speak or act in ways which remove from or deny that right to others. Examples of this included: "the NHS" and "the Association". The conclusion was reached that the 'objects' with implicit 'subjects' were referred to as 'objects' because to talk about them as 'objects' serves to present them as 'objective' things or processes and this serves the purposes implicit within those texts. It was noticed, at the same time, that there are 'objects' which sound like 'subjects' but are actually treated in an 'objectified' manner (which should be distinguished from an 'objective' manner). Examples included: "a child", when referred to in the context of a child's 'best interest' and "the patient" when referred to in the context of giving consent.
A further complication identified in that investigation was that the texts use the word 'subject' to mean someone who participates in a research project whereas this thesis normally refers to

a 'subject' in the sense in which Freire (1972) uses the word, that is, to denote a person who is neither oppressed nor oppressing another.

The orphan protagonists of the various literary narratives examined in Investigation 2 are all constructed as objects by the texts and practices illustrated in those narratives with the sole exception of Daniel in *The Shadow of the Wind* who, the researcher suggests, is the only orphan protagonist to overcome by being a 'subject' and who experiences the reality of 'dialogue' and of being able to 'name the world' and 'speak his own word'. It is a further suggestion of this thesis that, in addition to the principal characters in the other narratives, there are other child characters who are depicted in ways which show their construction as objects by the texts and practices described. It is not suggested that this construction is in any way intentional on the part of the authors but it *is* proposed that the depiction represents a shared aspect of human social reality and a common adult reaction to children's grief and distress.

The talk and practices implicit in the programme evaluated in Investigation 5 were, of course, the same as those examined in Investigations 3 and 4, and which, it has already been noted, above, emphasised the children's autonomy, their right to feel that which they felt and to identify and to express those feelings. The talk and practices did not 'objectify' the children who attended the support programme. Therefore, along with both Investigation 3 and Investigation 4, it is suggested here that the evidence of Investigation 5, of positive evaluation of the programme by the participants, whilst not answering every question about children's grief, does support the proposition that not to 'objectify' children does result in helpful outcomes for grieving and distressed children.

3) Subjects.

Freire (1972) refers to subjects as speaking their own word and not oppressing or being oppressed. In the researcher's view, some accounts of discourse analysis in critical psychology (for example Burman and Parker, 1993) in comparison with Freire's work (1972) refer to a subject as being a person who has the right to speak but may not, by means of the discourse, allow others the same right to speak. It may, in fact, be the case that the operation of the discourse does itself objectify others in ways that prevent them from speaking (Parker, 1992). Freire, however, uses the word 'subject' to denote a person who is neither oppressed nor oppressing (1972). This difference in denotation is explored further, below.

It has already been noted, above, in commenting on Investigations 3, 4 and 5, that the counsellors and adult helpers in the bereavement support programme facilitated the children's communication in such a way that they were able to function as subjects rather than as objects.

The adults were responsible for physical and emotional safety of the children whilst they were attending the premises used for the group sessions but the communication style adopted was based upon a belief that children are able to communicate in their own way and that they have the right to decide how and whether they will do so. Such a belief implicitly leaves no room for 'objectifying' those whose communication the adults are attempting to facilitate. This argument is pursued further, below, in discussing implications for theory and for methods of analysis.

In Investigation 1, the adults functioned as 'subjects', in the critical psychology, discourse analysis, understanding of this term, whilst the bereaved children were placed in the role of 'objects' since the former knew the truth about events and were able to speak about them if

they wished whilst the latter were kept ignorant of events and adults did not speak the truth to them about those events. By not responding to the expression of children's feelings, and thus by 'control', by abdicating responsibility and by employing depersonalising styles of communication, the professionals referred to by counsellors in Investigation 4 maintained the position of 'subject' and placed the children in the position of 'objects'. This provides a helpful illustration of the use of the term 'subject' in discourse analytic work such as that of Burman and Parker (1993) which can be compared and contrasted with Freire's concept of 'subject' (1972).

The subjects in the instances of communication with ethics committees recounted on Chapter 4 were the members of the research ethics committees and the professionals effectively served by those committees. Objects defined by those texts have already been seen as: the 'subjects' of research projects, children, patients and, in certain ways, applicants to the committees. If successful in their applications to conduct research, of course, the researcher may then, in their turn, become a 'subject' if they adopt an approach which is not 'emancipatory' in character. 'Subjects' discernible in Investigation 2 are children's guardians such as Pip's sister, Jane's aunt and the beadle and surviving parents such as Amir's father and Finn's mother. The issue of what subjects are contained in the texts employed in Investigation 5 has already been addressed in the course of the discussion, above, about that investigation and Investigations 3 and 4 since the communication style examined belonged to the same interactions although they were investigated in three separate ways.

4) Paradigmatic Associations.

Chandler (2007), along with other semioticians, advocates paradigmatic as well as syntagmatic analysis of texts, following Saussure's arguments about sign relations, although Saussure used the term 'associative' relations rather than 'paradigmatic' (Saussure, 1974).

'Syntagmatic' analysis refers to the surface and linear or 'horizontal' axis of a text (Chandler, 2007) and so, for example, considers whether a verbal text presents an argument or a narrative, and, to take another example, considers whether a visual text is presented as a montage or a sequence of images. 'Paradigmatic' analysis considers the functioning or 'vertical' axis of a text and is concerned with associations of signifiers, signifieds and signs (or any combination of them) by which they each are seen to be members of some defining category. Such associations are discerned only by means of analysis because they are not necessarily visible on the 'surface' of a text although they will be 'speaking to an observer' via the text (Chandler, 2007; Magariños, 2008) . Chandler (2007) refers to this as the process of making explicit what is usually implicit.

By means of the investigations reported here, the researcher suggests that a number of categories of tools and signs can be identified within the texts sampled. Tools discernible in the adult-child communication investigated include control, oppression and depersonalisation; it has also been suggested that these psychological tools function very often by means of silence. In contrast, and also by means of the investigations reported here, the researcher suggests that, in the context of their contact with bereaved children, some adults utilise facilitative psychological tools such as dialogue and empathic non-verbal behaviour which enables children to communicate productively with adults, with their peers and with themselves.

Magariños (2008) advocates the constructing by semioticians of the possible semiotic worlds presented by the signs contained in texts analysed. Chandler (2007) advises that semioticians should look at what sort of reality is constructed by the texts being studied. The psychological

tools (or signs as they would usually be called in semiotics) listed above are considered, with this objective in mind, in more detail, below.

Control: The word, "control" has been employed here to indicate a style of communication which presents a picture of a world in which children are to be, "seen and not heard". In these texts, children receive no response and this is seen as a practice which is actually good for the child as, evidenced, for example, in practices such as Jane being locked in a room and in the statement that she had cried out on purpose to gain attention. The work of Light (1979) and of Raphael-Leff (1991) shows the existence of two general approaches to parenting, one in which the prevailing tendency is to control and the other in which the prevailing tendency is to facilitate. Light calls these two types of parenting "positional" and "personal" whilst Raphael-Leff uses the terms "regulators" and "facilitators". Both researchers really are reflecting the same "pictures of the world" in that the world of the "positional" or "regulator" parent is predominantly centred on their own agenda whilst the "personal" or "facilitator" parent's world is predominantly centred on their child's agenda or, at least takes reasonable account of the child's agenda and can make room for seeing the world through the eyes of the child. It is interesting that, in the case of Light's research, there is a clear connection between empathic communication on the part of parents and the degree of social sensitivity measured in their children (1979).

It is possible, in the researcher's view, and in attempting to construct a possible semiotic world represented by this type of communication, that professionals, and other adults who are not the child's parents, can fall into a 'positional parent mode' when they encounter children's grief. Some support for this view can be found in the ideas of Parsons (1951) concerning the sick role and paternalism and of Berne (1964) and transactional analysis. It is not suggested

here that the specific concept of patients *adopting* the sick role necessarily applies to children since, obviously, they are already dependent upon adults by virtue of the fact that they are children, but that adults, when faced with the needs of children may fall into the paternalistic stance of 'control' which is described by Parsons (1951) as the 'expert's' share of the relationship with patients whose share is to be compliant. The view of grief as an illness (to which reference was made in Chapter 2) could mean that adults may also fall into these modes of control and the equivalent expectation of compliance. Emke (2002) has discussed contemporary implications of Parsons' model and emphasises the unequal rights and obligations between the two roles of 'patient' and 'healer'. Emke (2002) refers to Trostle (1988), who sees 'compliance' as a euphemism for "physician control" and claims that it is an ideology which reaffirms and legitimizes "the unequal doctor/patient relationship" (quoted and partly paraphrased from Emke, 2002). Berne's concept (1964) of the human personality as allowing the three possible modes of parent, adult and child could be considered here in attempting to explain how professionals, such as teachers, can fall into the 'parent' mode when dealing with children and even with adults (in the usual sense of the word rather than its transactional analysis sense) when, in fact, they have no real 'parental' responsibility in that particular interaction.

Oppression: This type of communicative function was not identified in the texts and practices examined in Investigations 3, 4 and 5 for the reasons already given, above. It is the researcher's belief, however, that the texts and practices reported in Investigations 1, and 2 imply or, in some instances, manifest, certain degrees of oppression. It seems reasonable to suggest that for a child to be 'kept in the dark' about major events affecting their life and/or not to be allowed to discuss those events, as reported by adults in Investigation 1, would produce an oppressive emotional environment for that child to live within, since there would

be an implicit lack of freedom involved. It seems reasonable, also, to suggest that the children whose experience with other professionals is referred to by counsellors in Investigation 4 were oppressed by the failure on the part of those professionals to actually provide appropriate psychological care in the absence of parents. In the communication between the researcher and various research ethics committees, recounted in Chapter 4 of this thesis, the hegemony exerted by the medical establishment over the field of health care research, although that may now be diminishing, implies some degree of oppression for those from outside of that dominant assemblage, to use a Foucauldian term.

The oppression of children is perhaps most clearly seen in the literary texts discussed in Investigation 2 which may be because, in the case of the nineteenth century texts selected, it is usual in the present day to think of that era as one in which children were badly treated by being employed as, for example, chimney sweeps and in which beating children was thought to be good for their souls. It can be argued, however, that the world depicted in *The Kite Runner* shows the world to be at least as oppressive for Sohrab, in Afghanistan, as it was for Oliver Twist or Jane Eyre in Victorian England. This question of the oppression of children raises theoretical issues of how children are perceived which are considered in greater detail, below, in discussing some implications of this study for theory. The researcher's general conclusion, as far as these instances are concerned, is that, in the context of child bereavement, the use of psychological tools by some adults, including some professionals, can communicate depersonalisation, control and abdication and that all of these functions contain implicit elements of oppression.

Depersonalisation: In depersonalising communication, people's names are not used. On the contrary, labels, often derogatory ones, are employed instead, as, for example, "you are a dependant" (said to Jane Eyre, page 17). The effect of this, it is suggested, is to present the

person as less than a person, in fact, as a dehumanised being. Some texts sampled in this study could actually be presented as representing a medical 'sign system' because they use a medical terminology and labels to describe people as, for instance "human subjects". The context of the letters which include these terms clearly shows that the term is used in a depersonalizing way, as well as, in this instance the subordinate, medical, sense. Depersonalising communication depicts a world in which professionals do not have to take on board either the human feelings of those they are supposed to be providing care for or their own human feelings of being unequal to the task of "making things better" for others who are suffering (Menzies, 1959). When faced with grief and distress, the, apparently, easier way of coping is to switch off to the personal and to adopt the professional mode of behaviour. The medical 'sign system' presents a world in which individuals, and less powerful professions, are subordinated to the power of the medical expert and, thereby, to the power of the institution.

Silence: It may seem to be a contradiction, at first sight, to suggest that some of the discourse studied here consists of silence if 'discourse' is understood to consist of 'talk'. Of course, communication happens by means of various channels including the non-verbal and para-verbal. In Chapter 1 of this thesis, reference was made to Graddol, Cheshire and Swann's exploration of the difference between the terms 'discourse' and 'text'(1994) and to their explanation that, traditionally, the distinction was similar to that between 'spoken' and 'written' communication. They suggest that, for two reasons, the "correspondence has been eroded" (page 190). Furthermore, in Chapters 2 and 4 of this thesis, the researcher has referred to the understanding of 'texts' brought by post-structuralist' authors such as Derrida (1976), Foucault (1971, 1976) and Barthes (1972, 2000) who see verbal (written and spoken) texts, visual texts and practices as all constituting examples of discourse. For these reasons, it

is suggested that silence can 'speak' in the communication of interpersonal meaning (Halliday, 1978).

The possible semiotic world presented by the functioning of silence as a psychological tool, in this context is one in which it is thought to be safer not to speak of things which are distressing or which grieve us. Ostensibly, the safety to be guaranteed is that of the child but, of course, silence, supposedly, also serves to protect the adults. Unfortunately, like physiological defence mechanisms, the attempt to protect can cause further difficulties. It is interesting to note, from Investigation 2, that this discourse of silence in connection with distress and grief is not solely a feature of the British (that is, English) culture of 'the stiff upper lip' and of 'not wearing your heart on your sleeve'. It can be seen, also, that a world in which children are silent, that is, they are not expressing their distress or grief, is a world over which the adults believe they have achieved control.

This also takes the discussion back to Freire's idea that oppression involves a lack of freedom on the part of 'objects' who are not free because unable to 'speak their own word'. It can be argued, also, that, the silence employed by some adults results in children 'speaking the word of the oppressor' or, in this case, reproducing the silence of the oppressor. Investigation 1, reported here, provides a striking example of this phenomenon; Adult 1 reproduced the silence of the adults in his life by not letting any of them know how he had come to find out the truth about his mother having died.

 The world presented by 'silence', then, is one in which not being able to talk about grief and distress actually imprisons both adults and children in a state of being oppressed by the effects of the lack of communication upon their relationships.

<u>Dialogue</u>: The possible world presented by 'dialogue' is of a world where each person, including a child, has the right to 'speak their own word' (Freire, 1972) but in which, also, a child has the right to credibility. This means that individuals know what they feel and think and that others respect that reality rather than imposing their own feelings and thoughts on to another. A world in which children can engage in dialogue is one where the adults are not afraid that a child's thoughts and feelings are 'too much' for them and so try to protect them from what they are already experiencing. It implies listening. It is interesting that the children involved in Investigation 5, reported here, cited 'being listened to' as one of the good things about the groups.

'Dialogue' facilitates relationships because, without dialogue, no-one can know what it is that they are relating to in the other and it also facilitates growth and development because 'dialogue' is the means for 'conscientization' (Freire, 1972). It is suggested here, also, that Friere's 'conscientization' mirrors Vygotsky's concept of 'semiotic mediation' because both ideas refer to new understanding taking place 'intrapsychologically' as a result of socially meaningful activity in the form of dialogue.

In Chapter 1 of this thesis, a research question and a working hypothesis were provided. The research question was stated as:

What psychological tools, including signs, operate in adult-child communication in the context of childhood bereavement?

The working hypothesis was stated as:

The psychological tools, including signs, which operate in adult-child communication in the context of childhood bereavement reflect both open and closed communication styles.

It seems justifiable, on the basis of the evidence presented here, to say that the response to the above research question is that the psychological tools, including signs, which operate in adult-child communication in the context of childhood bereavement consist of verbal and non-verbal tools which refer to objects and to subjects.

Furthermore, it seems justifiable to say that the above hypothesis appears to be confirmed since the tools identified produce either open communication, where subjects are addressed, or closed communication, where objects are addressed. These two styles produce either dialogue, where subjects are addressed or silence where practices of non-communication prevail. It is further argued that the facilitation of dialogue also facilitates conscientization in the form of a degree of re-organisation in the lives of the bereaved children included in Investigation 5. Whether this re-organisation constitutes any form of cognitive restructuring must be the subject of further investigation.

SECTION 2: IMPLICATIONS OF THIS STUDY FOR SEMIOTIC ANALYSIS

In this section, the researcher suggests that there are two main implications of this study for semiotic analysis. Firstly, Chandler (2007) describes the task of semiotic analysis as: the identification of signs (and therefore of meanings) within texts; making explicit the ideological functions of the signs and establishing the underlying paradigmatic sets contained within the texts. It is the researcher's belief that the study so far has achieved those objectives by employing the framework derived from Freire (1972) and without the use of those criteria offered by the most well known semioticians which very often are rather abstract. One conclusion reached by the researcher is that semiotic analysis could be used more widely in research if similar, less abstract, frameworks for the analysis of texts were developed.

Frameworks which took those elements of semiotic analysis which are readily applicable and employed them in ways which were specific to particular contexts might also assist such an expansion. One criticism against which the literature describing semiotic analysis is not particularly well defended is that it does not provide clear criteria for implementing analyses.

Reference has already been made in Chapter 1 of this thesis to the self-perpetuating character of Peirce's definition of signs which can make analysis appear impossible. Potter, Wetherell, Gill and Edwards (1990, page 205) in their critique and rejection of discourse analysis as propounded by critical psychologists, cite Foucault (1971, 1972, 1980 and 2003) as an author whose influential work about discourse analysis is centred in the "tradition of continental social philosophy and cultural analysis" whose proponents mostly "worked with the titles of semiology or post-structuralism". Magariños (2008, page 117) points out that Foucault does not specify "methodological operations" and this does present challenges to those seeking to follow where semiological theories lead. Magariños (2008) and Chandler (2007) both have proposed criteria for semiotic analysis but an examination of those proposals reveals quite quickly the diffuse and abstract nature of the schemas. This is not to say that some of the criteria do not appear potentially very helpful and one aspect of Chandler's work is now taken as an illustration of this view; this example is cited to support the second strand of the argument in this section.

Chandler (2007) advocates the identification of oppositions as a helpful facet of semiotic analysis. This is an aspect of the approach taken by Chandler and other semioticians which so far has not been addressed here. Saussure's notion that language works through relations of difference which place signs in opposition to one another has endured throughout the ninety years which have elapsed since his work was published (1974 [1916]). A simple illustration

of this would be that a person needs to understand light/darkness as a 'binary opposition' in order to fully understand either concept. Chandler (2007) suggests that the identification of distinctions and oppositions in texts will assist semiotic analysis. Magariños (2008) proposes that one of the final steps in semiotic analysis is to understand the meaning of the phenomena to which signs refer as semantically differential.

Freire (1972) explains that the process of dialogue, in which his team engaged, involved identifying contradictions. However, the utilisation of Freire's concepts in this study has not explicitly focussed on the question of contradictions and oppositions. With the benefit of reflective hindsight, it seems possible that, in adopting the framework based in Freire's work, the researcher was too eager to avoid the 'political' aspects of Freire such as his belief that dialogue is automatically revolutionary, in the political sense. It can be observed, now, that dialogue/silence and subject/object are actually examples of contradiction and binary opposition and, therefore, it could have been possible to incorporate this criterion of semiotic analysis into the framework formulated for the implementation of the study.

The two implications, referred to at the beginning of this section are therefore: 1) that it is possible to conduct semiotic analysis with concrete frameworks more readily than with the more abstract schemas proposed by some semioticians and 2) that it would be helpful to incorporate some of the criteria from those schemas into concrete frameworks devised to facilitate semiotic analysis of texts. This latter development would probably depend for its usefulness upon whether the criteria incorporated actually a) have validity based in linguistic theory and b) are appropriate to the text type being studied. Support for this view can be found in Hatim and Mason's account of the basic assumptions of semiotics which they list as: 1) signs refer to cultural structures; 2) semiotics transcends verbal language; 3) basic

mechanisms of signification are universal and 4) context and co-text are crucial to the act of signification (1990, pages 114 – 116).

SECTION 3: IMPLICATIONS OF THIS STUDY FOR THEORY

The analysis of texts and practices in the various investigations has shown that both silence as a psychological tool and the signs functioning via empathic communication can be found across culture and across time periods. From the findings reported here, it seems clear that the employment of sign systems in social life includes not only practices which are intended to control others but also practices which are used to facilitate the communication of others and to engage in 'dialogue'.

In terms of relevance to theories of loss and grief, there is support both for the 'cognitive restructuring' model (rather than 'grief work' or 'evolutionary' psychology) and for the 'continuing bonds' model since children participating in the evaluation of a support service reported that they experienced both an improvement in how they were feeling and coping and also provided some reports of communicating with the lost person in some way.

In relation to the question of whether or not children grieve, the clear answer from this study seems to be that they do, not only because of the evidence from the support service but also because of the narratives related by adults who lost a parent in childhood. None of the four participants had reached the age of adolescence when their parents died.

Reference was made, Chapter 2 of this thesis, to the issue of internal working models and the view expressed by Main, Kaplan and Cassidy (1985, page 67) individual differences in attachment relationships are based "in the mental representations of the self in relation to

attachment". Main et al. proposed that differences in secure versus insecure types of attachment "can best be understood as terms referring to particular types of internal working models of relationships" (1985, page 67). Interestingly, they suggested a connection between differences in the internal working models and "individual differences in patterns of nonverbal behaviour" and "patterns of language and structures of mind". The findings reported in this thesis also raise the question of the nature of the link between mental representation and spoken or 'externalised' communication.

This question, in turn, connects back to the ideas of Vygotsky about mastery through the use of 'sign'. If, in 'dialogue' and 'empathic communication', human beings are engaging in 'mastery of self' just as, with the whole repertoire of physical tools, they master their material environment and, through social 'control', they master others, it can be said that human use of tools is even more sophisticated than appears from a consideration of simple mastery of the environment. The challenge of whether to master self in such a way, of course, involves moral and political choices. It can be concluded, also, that these are socially constructed behaviours, as Vygotsky argued, and that language, via dialogue, is the tool for that construction.

As far as epistemology is concerned, it was suggested in Chapter 4 of this thesis, that Vygotsky's concept of understanding being generated by semiotic mediation may be mirrored in the process of generating knowledge through the research process. It is the researcher's view that this is, in fact, the case since, in this study, the knowledge acquired about psychological tools employed in adult-child interactions and about communication styles has been generated as a result of dialogue taking place between himself and the respondents and also between himself and the data obtained. In quantitative research, the

process may well be different but this is a question which could be tested by the researcher when engaged in research investigations of that type.

The researcher believes that this study has some implications, also, for the theoretical underpinning of discourse analysis as understood in critical psychology. Parker describes seven criteria or steps for discourse analysis as "necessary and sufficient for marking out particular discourses" but he also draws attention to "three more aspects of discourse that research should focus upon" (1992, page 17). These "auxiliary criteria" he describes as:

Definition 8 : Discourses support institutions.

Definition 9 : Discourses reproduce power relations.

Definition 10 : Discourses have ideological effects.

These three criteria are considered together here because:

a) all three are described by Parker as "auxiliary criteria";

b) all three criteria are unified by the theme of oppression and

c) all three, in the researcher's view, conform to the negative part of Parker's comment about the function of discourses (1992, page xiii) that they "limit…and constrain what can be said (by whom, where, when)" rather than the positive aspect of that comment in which Parker also says that discourses "facilitate" and "enable… what can be said (by whom, where, when)" (page xiii).

Of course, it could be said that some communication functions in such a way as to facilitate and enable what can be said by those who have power in power relations and by those who are empowered by institutions; they could likewise be said to facilitate and enable the effects of ideologies supporting such institutions. The main purpose in discussing these three

204

auxiliary criteria is to emphasise the researcher's view that much discourse analytic writing and research has focussed upon the oppressive functioning of communication and has neglected the power of psychological tools to facilitate and enable.

It is the researcher's contention that the prevailing 'mode' within discourse analytical research and writing within the field of psychology is the consideration of the oppressive and subjugating functions of discourse. This view is put forward not as a judgment but merely as an observation and as part of an argument for the wider consideration of other approaches to the study of tools and signs.

To take Parker's approach as an example, it could be suggested that, for three reasons, the focus of that approach is predominantly upon the function of discourse as a means of oppression. This focus gives Parker's approach a political as well as psychological slant. The three reasons are:

1) the political underpinning of the three 'auxiliary' criteria (definitions 8, 9 and 10);

2) the definition of discourse as "A system of statements which constructs an object" (page 5) gives emphasis to the "objectification" (page 8) function of discourse and

3) the view of 'subjects' contained within a discourse as predominantly concerned with the rights to speak within the discourse that subjects may have.

Potter, Wetherell, Gill and Edwards (1990) have criticised Parker's approach to discourse analysis, as tending "to reify discourses" and this lends support to the second argument listed, above. Potter et al. (1990) even suggest that the term "discourse analysis" itself is unhelpful not only because they can trace at least four different strands of work which use this term but also because of the assumptions made by Parker in using the term, such as his belief that discourses are sets of statements which construct objects (page 212).

An examination of Parker and Shotter (1990) and Burman and Parker (1993) shows the focus upon 'subjugated' discourses and upon discourse as a vehicle for oppression. Lacan (2006) provides another example of this 'slant' within discourse analysis. The four discourses proposed by Lacan, the Master's, the University's, the Hysteric's and the Analyst's all reflect the political and philosophical preoccupations of France in the 1960s. Derrida (1976), Foucault (1972) and other 'postmodernists' all attended Lacan's seminars at some time and, whilst they share his emphasis upon the function of language within psychoanalysis and social life, they also share, in varying ways, his focus upon power. It can be argued that there is tension and conflict in Lacan's thinking in relation to power. On the one hand, he inherits Freud's phallocentric view of the psyche and has, as a result, been accused of being sexist, but, on the other, he is critical of the gender bias in society that is based upon a view of women as deficient. It is the latter emphasis which has been helpful to feminist thinkers.

The *most* helpful part of Lacan's work, in the researcher's view, is the recognition of signifiers in unconscious discourse and in verbal discourse as well as the relationship between the two aspects of subjectivity and mental life. In the researcher's view, however, the use of discourse (whether 'unconscious' or verbal) as evidence of the functioning of mental life has been largely restricted to the negative aspects of that function. There seems to be a link via Bakhtin (1981) between Lacan (1977) and Vygotsky (1934; 1978) (and the other Soviet psychologists) which may explain the helpful emphasis upon discourse in Lacan's work.

If Freire (1972) is right in suggesting that it is possible for human beings to relate to others in ways which do not serve to oppress those others nor bring them into an oppressed state themselves, then it seems reasonable to suggest that those relationships must be conducted via 'discourse' and 'discourse practices' which facilitate such non-oppressive relationships. The

researcher's suggestion is that it may be beneficial to have at least as much emphasis upon those styles of communication as there has been upon the oppressive functions of discourse.

SECTION 4: IMPLICATIONS OF THIS STUDY FOR FURTHER RESEARCH

Some specific recommendations for further research into children's experience of bereavement have been presented in Chapter 9, above. Some brief, and more general, additions to those recommendations are included here. In the light of Morgan's argument (2007), already discussed in Chapter 4, and in the light of the outcomes of this study, it is suggested that:

- Social science research can profit from casting its net more widely in terms of the methods employed in its investigations.

- Social science research can profit from abandoning an adherence to what Morgan (2007) calls 'metaphysical' and Vygotsky called 'phenomenological' paradigms in favour of the 'pragmatic' paradigm. Morgan here is not referring to 'pragmatics' as one of the three branches of semiotics but is advocating the 'pragmatic' paradigm as that approach to research which a) enables phenomena to be investigated successfully and b) facilitates the improvement or even survival of services, where appropriate.

- Adopting Vygotsky's concept of psychological tools as instruments for the investigation of specifically human phenomena could increasingly free social science, and specifically, psychological, research from the contradiction inherent in attempting to study human beings 'scientifically'. Harré and Secord's (1972) exhortation that "for scientific purposes" we should: "treat people as if they were human beings" is clearly in harmony with this view of scientific investigation but it seems to me that there is more potential in

the focus upon psychological tools in research than has been seen so far with an emphasis in the social sciences on power, oppression and ideology.

- Following on from the discussion in Section 2 of this chapter, concerning two implications of the study for semiotic analysis, it could be recommended that future research takes account of the possibility of conducting semiotic analyses with concrete frameworks rather than with the more abstract schemas proposed by some semioticians and that it would be helpful to incorporate some of the criteria from those schemas into concrete frameworks devised to facilitate semiotic analysis of texts. Examples of such criteria include the examination of oppositions and the consideration of intertextuality (Magariños, 2008, Chandler, 2007). Inclusion of such criteria in frameworks for semiotic analysis would need to appropriate to text type and to genre (Hatim and Mason, 1990).

5) IMPLICATIONS OF THIS STUDY FOR PROFESSIONAL PRACTICE AND FOR PREPARATION FOR PROFESSIONAL PRACTICE.

Some comments made by counsellors in the course of the interviews conducted with them for Investigation 4 seem to demonstrate clearly that there are aspects of professional practice and, therefore, of the preparation for professional practice, which have been unyielding in the face of change across a number of years. The implications of this seem to be that:

- In spite of rhetoric about personalised learning and well being (Department for Children, Schools and Families, 2008; Department for Education and Science, 2004; Department of Health, 1999), professional work often is still organised in ways which fail to be centred upon human beings;
- In spite of changes to the way in which people are prepared for professional practice, many still are socialised into the non-person-centred approach to professional work;

- Professional defendedness is a phenomenon which still prevents some professionals from interacting with children in an empathic manner;

- Many education and social care professionals, like many health care professionals, often feel unprepared for supporting, and understanding the experience of, bereaved children and

- Courses of preparation for practice and continuing professional development courses need to include not only issues specific to childhood bereavement but also some strategies for addressing the fact that non-person-centred approaches seem to prevail too often in professional practice.

It may well be that, if the health and social care professions are going to really address these issues, it will require radical strategies to change the culture which prevails in too many instances. Reference was made, in Chapter 3, to retrospective evidence that the death of a parent may be a factor in some cases of depression both in adolescence and in adult life and in some cases of delinquent behaviour in adolescence (Finkelstein, 1988; Harris et al., 1986; Tennant et al., 1980; Brown et al., 1977; Bendiksen and Fulton, 1975 and Roberts and Gotlib, 1997). Although, it would be wonderful for change to occur simply out of genuine human concern, it may be that those with the power to effect radical change will only respond when there is: a) some demonstration through further prospective research findings that some cases of depression and delinquency are linked to the effects of loss unmitigated by appropriate support and b) some demonstration through further research findings that *preventing* problems associated with internalising behaviour (that is, depression) and externalising behaviour (that is to say 'conduct disorders') is an endeavour which makes economic sense.

Chapter 11

CONCLUSIONS

An argument has been made for a) the relevance and usefulness of semiology within social psychology as originally proposed by Saussure (1974) and b) for the value of semiotic analysis in the study of communication within health and social care, including counselling. The professions working within health and social care have, for a long time, looked to disciplines such as psychology for the understanding of human behaviour and for indicators for practice. It is the researcher's belief that such application is beneficial for the development and improvement of practice within the health and social care professions. It could be argued that since most of the adults in contact with bereaved children are family members and friends there is little relevance of such study and application to the context of child bereavement. In the researcher's view, however, it is an important part of the role and responsibility of health and social care professionals to provide leadership within society as a whole by demonstrating in their practice those approaches which promote the well being of individuals who make up that society, including children.

A research question had been formulated for this study and was stated as:

What psychological tools, including signs, operate in adult-child communication in the context of childhood bereavement?

It is the researcher's contention that the study has answered this question by identifying the functioning of signs in the adult-child communication analysed here. Both positive and negative signs were identified and they consisted of: empathy; warmth; allowing children a voice by treating them as 'subjects'; initiating dialogue which allowed new understanding; silence; oppression and treating children as 'objects' via depersonalisation

The researcher had also formulated a working hypothesis which was stated as:

The psychological tools, including signs, which operate in adult-child communication in the context of childhood bereavement reflect both open and closed communication styles.

In the researcher's view, this hypothesis has been supported because the paradigmatic aspect of the semiotic analysis showed the existence of particular paradigm sets which denoted both a) facilitative and b) controlling styles of communication. It is the researcher's contention that this contrast of styles is synonymous with or parallel to the contrast between open and closed communication.

The main contributions of this study have been that: a) findings have been obtained which provide qualitative evidence which can guide adult communication with bereaved children by showing the development of new understanding as a result of semiotic mediation and b) the potential usefulness has been demonstrated of an adapted framework for the semiotic analysis of texts relevant to caring communication in a variety of contexts. It may be that further work will allow for the refinement of the framework so that it can be more comprehensive whilst remaining more precise than those strategies previously described in the existing literature about semiotic analysis.

In terms of theory, there is some support from this thesis that language not only provides tools as suggested by Wittgenstein (1953, 1980) but also provides signs by which new understanding is mediated as Vygotsky argued (1934, 1978).

Four articles resulting from this study have already been submitted for publication and two of them have been accepted. An account of the support service has been accepted by *Bereavement Care* and a discussion of the issue of whether bereavement counselling is

helpful or harmful for children was accepted by *The Psychologist*. The other two articles already submitted for publication are: a) a critical review of relative theoretical positions on the issue of childhood bereavement has been submitted to the *International Journal of Psychology* and an abbreviated version of the reflective analysis of the researcher's communication with various research ethics committees which was included in Chapter 4 of this thesis has been submitted to *Nursing Ethics*. Two further papers are currently in preparation: a report of the findings of this study will be submitted to Bereavement Care and an account of the method utilising semiotic analysis will be submitted to the *Journal of Linguistics*. Hopefully, the dissemination of this material (and any subsequent debate) will increase understanding of the issues examined in this thesis.

REFERENCES

Ainsworth, M. (1982) Attachment: retrospect and prospect. In Parkes, C. And Stevenson-Hinde, J. (eds) *The Place of Attachment in Human Behaviour*. London: Tavistock.

Ainsworth, M. (1989) Attachments beyond infancy. *American Psychologist*, 44: 709-16.

Ainsworth, M., Blehar, M., Waters, E. And Wall, S. (1978) *Patterns of Attachment: Assessed in the Strange Situation and at Home*. Hillsdale, NJ: Erlbaum.

American Psychological Association (2001) *Publication Manual of the American Psychological Association*, 5th edition, Washington, DC: APA.

Archer, J. (1999) *The Nature of Grief*. London: Routledge.

Archer, J. (2001) Broad and narrow perspectives on grief: Comment on Bonanno and Kaltman (1999). *Psychological Bulletin*, 127(4): 554-560.

Argyle, M. (1991) *Cooperation: The basis of sociability*. London: Routledge.

Bakhtin, M.M. (1981) *The Dialogic Imagination*. (edited by: Holquist, M. and translated by Emerson, C. And Holquist, M.). Austin: University of Texas Press.

Balint, M. (1964) *Primary Love and Psychoanalytic Technique*. London: Tavistock.

Bandura, A. (1977) *Social learning theory*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice- Hall.

Banyard, P. and Hayes, N. (1994) *Psychology: Theory and Application*. London: Chapman & Hall.

Barnes McGuire, J., Stein, A. and Rosenberg, W. (1997) Evidence-based Medicine and Child Mental Health Services. A Broad Approach to Evaluation is Needed. *Children & Society*, 11(2) : 89-96.

Barrie, J.M. (1911) *Peter Pan*. London: Hodder and Stoughton.

Barthes, R. (1972) *Mythologies*, London: Jonathan Cape.

Barthes, R. (1977) *Image-Music-Text*, London: Jonathan Cape.

Barthes, R. (2000) *The Death of the Authors*, in Lodge, D. and Wood, N. (2000) *Modern Criticism and Theory: A Reader*, 2nd edn, Harlow: Longman.

Belsky, J. (1984) The determinants of parenting: a process model. *Child Development*, 55: 83-96.

Bendiksen, R. and Fulton, R. (1975) Death and the child: an anterospective test of the childhood bereavement and later behaviour disorder hypothesis. *Omega*, 6 1): 45-59.

Benner, P. and Wrubel, J. (1989) *The primacy of caring*. Engelwood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall.

Berlinsky, E.B. and Biller, H.B. (1982) *Parental death and psychological development*, Lexington, MA : D.C. Heath.

Berne, E. (1964) *Games People Play*. London: Penguin Books.

Bertens, H. (2008) *Literary Theory: The Basics*, London: Routledge.

Black, D. (1998) Bereavement in childhood, *British Medical Journal*, 316: 931-933.

Black, D. and Urbanowitz, M.A. (1987) Family intervention with bereaved children, *Journal of Child Psychology and Psychiatry*, 28: 467-76.

Black, D., Harris-Hendriks, J. and Kaplan, T. (1992) Father kills mother. *Psychotherapy and Psychosomatics*, 57: 152-157.

Bonanno, G. A. (2001) The Crucial Importance of Empirical Evidence in the Development of Bereavement Theory: Reply to Archer (2001). *Psychological Bulletin*, 127(4): 561-564.

Bonanno, G. A. And Kaltman, S. (1999) Toward an Integrative Perspective on Bereavement. *Psychological Bulletin*, 125(6): 760-776.

Bower, T.G.R. (1974) *Development in Infancy*. San Francisco: W.H. Freeman.

Bowlby, J. (1946) *Forty-four Juvenile Thieves: Their Characters and Home-Life*. London: Baillière, Tindall & Cox.

Bowlby, J. (1951) *Maternal Care and Mental Health*. Geneva: World Health Organisation, Monograph Series No. 2.

Bowlby, J. (1953) *Child Care and the Growth of Love*. Harmondsworth: Penguin Books.

Bowlby, J. (1960) Grief and mourning in infancy and early childhood. *The Psychoanalytic Study of the Child*, XV: 9-52.

Bowlby, J. (1969) *Attachment and Loss, v*ol.1*, Attachment*. London; Hogarth Press.

Bowlby, J. (1973) *Attachment and Loss, v*ol.2*, Separation: Anxiety and Anger*. London; Hogarth Press.

Bowlby, J. (1980) *Attachment and Loss, v*ol.3*, Loss: Sadness and Depression*. London; Hogarth Press.

Bowlby, J. (1981) Psychoanalysis as a natural science. *International Review of Psycho-Analysis*, 8, part 3: 243-56.

Bowlby, J. (1991) Postscript. In Parkes, C., Stevenson-Hinde, J. And Marris, P. (1991) *Attachment Across the Life Cycle*. London: Routledge.

British Psychological Society (1992) Ethical Principles for Conducting Research with Human Participants. *The Psychologist*, 6: 33-35.

Broks, P. (2006) The ego trip. *The Guardian*, 6th May 2006.

Brontë, C. (1847; 2003) *Jane Eyre*, Penguin Books, London.

Brown, G.W., Harris, T.O. and Copeland, J.R. (1977) Depression and loss. *British Journal of Psychiatry*, 130: 1-18.

Burman, E. and Parker, I. (eds) (1993) *Discourse Analytic Research: Repertoires and Readings of Texts in Action*. London and New York: Routledge.

Campbell, D.T. and Stanley, J.C. (1966) *Experimental and Quasi-Experimental Designs for Research*. Chicago: Rand McNally.

Chandler, D. (2007) *Semiotics: The Basics.* London and New York: Routledge.

Christ, G.H. (2000) *Healing Children's Grief: Surviving a parent's death from cancer*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Churchill, S. And Bayne, R. (1998) Psychological type and different conceptions of empathy in experienced counsellors. *Counselling Psychology Quarterly*, 11(4): 379-90.

Cohn, J. (no date supplied) *The Orphan Project*.
    www.trincoll.edu/facresearch/proposaltexts/OOL-cohn.htm

Cole, M., John-Steiner, V., Scribner, S. and Souberman, E. (1978) (eds) Vygotsky, L.S. (1978) *Mind in Society: The Development of Higher Psychological Processes*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press.

Craik, K. (1943) *The Nature of Explanation*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Crossley, D. And Stokes, J. (2001) A Child's Grief. Cheltenham: Winston's Wish.

Darwin, C. (1872) *The Expression of the Emotions in Man and Animals*. London: Murray (1904 edn).

Das Gupta, P. (1994) Images of childhood and theories of development. In Oates, J. (ed) *The Foundations of Child Development*. Oxford: Blackwell/The Open University.

Das Gupta, P. and Richardson, K. (1995) Theories of Cognitive Development. In Lee, V. and Das Gupta, P. (eds) *Children's Cognitive and Language Development*. Oxford: Blackwell/The Open University.

Department for Children, Schools and Families (2008) *Personalised Learning – a practical guide*, London: Department for Children, Schools and Families.

Department for Education and Science (2004) *Every Child Matters – Change for Children*, London: Department for Education and Science.

Department of Health (1999) *Making a Difference*, London: Department of Health.

Department of Health (2001) *Consent: A guide for children and young people*. London: Department of Health.

Derrida, J. (1976) *Of Grammatology*. Baltimore: John Hopkins University.

Dickens, C. (1837-8; 2003) *Oliver Twist*, Penguin Books, London.

Dickens, C. (1849-50; 1972) *David Copperfield*, Penguin Books, London.

Dickens, C. (1860-1; 1966) *Great Expectations*, Penguin Books, London.

Donahue, D. (2003) Orphans in literature empower children. *USA Today*, 2nd July 2003.

Donaldson, M. (1978) *Children's Minds*. London: Fontana Press.

Dowdney, L., Wilson, R., Maughan, B., Allerton, M., Schofield, P. and Skuse, D. (1999) Psychological disturbance and service provision in parentally bereaved children: prospective case-control study. *British Medical Journal*, 319: 354-357.

Eco, U. (1976) *A Theory of Semiotics*, Indiana: Indiana University Press.

Eisenberg, N. and Strayer, J. (1987) (eds) *Empathy and its development*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Eisendrath, S.J. and Dunkel, J. (1979) Psychological issues in ICU staff. *Heart & Lung*, 8(4): 751-758.

Elizur,E. and Kaffman,M. (1983) Factors influencing the severity of childhood bereavement reactions, *American Journal of Orthopsychiatry*, 53(4): 668-676.

Emke, I. (2002) Patients in The New Economy: The "Sick Role" In A Time of Economic Discipline. *Animus*, Vol. 7.

Engel, G.L. (1962) Anxiety and depression-withdrawal: the primary effects of unpleasure. *International Journal of Psychoanalysis*, 43: 89-97.

Engels, F. (1925) Dialektik der Natur, *Arkhiv K. Marksa i F. Engelsa*, Moscow. [parallel Russian and German text].

Engels, F. (1964) *The Dialectic of Nature*, Moscow, Progress Publishers. [English text].

Finkelstein, H. (1988) The long-term effects of early parental death: a review. *Journal of Clinical Psychology*, 44: 3-9.

Fitz, C.J. (2010) *Palliative Care Strategy Implementation Report on Child Bereavement*, Welsh Assembly Government.

Flavell, J. H. (1985) *Cognitive Development*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice- Hall.

Foucault, M. (1971) Orders of discourse, *Social Science Information*, 10, pp. 7-30.

Foucault, M. (1972) *The Archaeology of Knowledge*. London: Tavistock.

Foucault, M. (1976) *The History of Sexuality Vol. 1: The Will to Knowledge*. London: Penguin.

Foucault, M. (1980) *Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings 1972-1977*. Hassocks, Sussex: Harvester.

Foucault, M. (2003) *The Birth of the Clinic*. London: Routledge.

Freire, P. (1972) *The Pedagogy of the Oppressed*. London: Penguin Books.

Freud, S. (1917) *Mourning and Melancholia*. SE 14, London: Hogarth.

Freud, S. (1926) *Inhibitions, Symptoms and Anxiety*. SE 20, London: Hogarth.

Freud, S. (1938) *Splitting of the Ego in the Defensive Process*. SE 23, London: Hogarth.

Freudenberger, H.J. (1975) The staff burnout syndrome in alternative institutions, *Psychotherapy: Theory, Research and Practice,* 12(1), 73-82.

Freudenberger, H.J. (1980) *Burnout – The high cost of success and how to cope with it*. London: Arrow Books Ltd.

Fromm, E. (1964) *The Heart of Man*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.

Furman, E. (1974) *A child's parent dies: Studies in childhood bereavement*. New Haven: Yale.

Furman, E. (1983) Studies in childhood bereavement, *Canadian Journal of Psychiatry*, 28(4): 241-247.

Garmezy, N. (1988) Longitudinal strategies, causal reasoning and risk research: a commentary. In M. Rutter (ed) *Studies of psychosocial risk.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Gaskell, E.C. (1857) *The Life of Charlotte Brontë*. London: Smith, Elder & Co.

Gergen, K.J. (1973) Social psychology as history. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 26: 309-20.

Gergen, K.J. (1982) *Toward Transformation in Social Knowledge*. New York: Springer Verlag.

Gibbs, G. (1988) *Learning by Doing: a guide to teaching and learning methods*. Oxford: Further Education Unit, Oxford Polytechnic.

Gladstein, D.L. (1984) Groups in context: a model of task group effectiveness. *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 29: 499-517.

Graddol, D., Cheshire, J. and Swann, J. (1994) *Describing Language*. Maidenhead: Open University Press.

Guba, E. (1978) *Toward a methodology of naturalistic inquiry in educational evaluation*. Los Angeles: Center for the Study of Evaluation, University of California, Los Angeles.

Guba, E. and Lincoln, Y. (2005) Paradigmatic controversies, contradictions, and emerging influences. In Denzin, N. & Linclon, Y. (eds) *Handbook of qualitative research* (3rd ed., pp 191-215) Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Gunn, N. (1941; 1969) *The Silver Darlings*, Faber & Faber, London.

Gunn, N. (1977; 2006) *The Drinking Well*, Polygon, Edinburgh.

Halliday, M.A.K. (1978) *Language as Social Semiotic: the social interpretation of language and meaning*. London: Edward Arnold.

Hammersley, M. and Atkinson, P. (1983) *Ethnography: Principles in Practice*. London: Tavistock.

Harlow, H.F. and Harlow, M.K. (1965) The affectional systems. In Schrier, A.M., Harlow, H.F. and Stollnitz, F. (eds) *Behavior of Nonhuman Primates, Vol. 2* (pp. 287-334). New York and London: Academic Press.

Harré, R. (1979) *Social Being: A Theory for Social Psychology*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell.

Harré, R. (1983) *Personal Being: A Theory for Individual Psychology*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell.

Harré, R. and Secord, P.F. (1972) *The Explanation of Social Behaviour*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell.

Harris, T., Brown, G.W. and Bifulco, A. (1986) Loss of parent in childhood and adult psychiatric disorder: the role of lack of adequate parental care. *Psychological Medicine*, 16: 641-659.

Hatim, B. and Mason, I. (1990) *Discourse and the Translator*, London: Longman.

Hay, D. and Oken, D. (1972) The psychological stresses of intensive care nursing. *Psychosomatic Medicine*, Vol. 34, No. 2: 109-118.

Hayward, M. and Harari, M. (2002) (translators) Pasternak, B. (1958; 2002) *Doctor Zhivago*, Vintage, London.

Hillis Miller, J. (1987) The Fiction of Realism: 'Sketches by Boz', 'Oliver Twist', and Cruikshank's Illustrations. In Nisbet, A.B. and Nevius, B. (eds) *Dickens Centennial Essays*. London: Methuen.

Hofer, M.A. (1984) Relationships as regulators: a psychobiological perspective on bereavement. *Psychosomatic Medicine*, 46: 183-197.

Hollway, W. And Jefferson, T. (2000) *Doing Qualitative Research Differently: free association, narrative and the interview method*. London: Sage.

Holmes, J. (1993) *John Bowlby and Attachment Theory*. London: Routledge.

Hosseini, K. (2003) *The Kite Runner*, Bloomsbury Publishing, London.

Jung, C.G. (1953) On Psychical Energy. In *Collected Works*. Vol. VIII. New York: Pantheon.

Kaffman, M., Elizur, E. and Gluckson, L. (1987) Bereavement reactions in children : therapeutic implications, *Israeli Journal of Psychiatry and Related Sciences*, 24(1-2): 65-76.

Kalisch, B.J. (1971) Strategies for developing nurse empathy. *Nursing Outlook*, 19: 714-17.

Kimball, M. (1999) From Folktales to Fiction: Orphan Characters in Children's Literature. *Library Trends*, 1st January, 1999.

Klass, D., Silverman, P. and Nickman, S. (1996) *Continuing Bonds*. Washington, DC: Taylor and Francis.

Kliman, G. (1979) Childhood mourning : a taboo within a taboo. In Gerber,I. *Perspectives on bereavement*. New York: Arno Press.

Klinger, E. (1975) Consequences of commitment to and disengagement from incentives. *Psychological Review*, 82: 1-25.

Klinger, E. (1977) *Meaning and Void: Inner Experience and the Incentives in People's Lives*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Kozulin, A. (1986) (ed) Vygotsky, L.S. (1986) *Thought and Language*. London: The MIT Press.

Kristeva, J. (1980) *Desire in Language: A Semiotic Approach to Literature and Art.* New York: Columbia University Press.

Krupnick, J. L. (1989) Bereavement during childhood and adolescence. In : Osterweis,M., Solomon, F. and Green, M. *Bereavement : Reactions, consequences and care*, Washington,D.C., National Academy Press.

Kubler-Ross, E. (1970) *On Death and Dying*. London: Tavistock.

Kuhn, T. (1996; 1962) *The structure of scientific revolutions* (3rd ed.) Chicago: University of Chicago Press. (Original work published 1962).

Kulpa, K. (2003) Out of the Jungle: The Power of the Child Protagonist in Fiction. www.kmareka.com/free-literture-online/kulpa4.htm

Lacan, J. (1977) *Écrits: A Selection*. London: Tavistock.

Lacan, J. (1979) *The Four Fundamental Concepts of Psychoanalysis: an Introduction*. Harmondsworth: Penguin.

Lacan, J. (2006) *Écrits: The First Complete Edition in English, transl. By Bruce Fink, New York: W.W. Norton & Co.*.

Leontiev, A.N. (1981) *Problems of the Development of the Mind*. Moscow: Progress.

Light, P.H. (1979) *The Development of Social Sensitivity*. Cambridge, Cambridge University Press.

Light, P. (1983) Social interaction and cognitive development: a review of post-Piagetian research. In Meadows, S. (ed) *Developing Thinking*. London: Methuen.

Lincoln, Y. and Guba, E. (1985) *Naturalistic inquiry*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.

Lincoln, Y. and Guba, E. (1988) Do inquiry paradigms imply inquiry methodologies? In Feterman, D. (ed) *Qualitative approaches to evaluation in educational research* (pp 89-115). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Longford, E. (1964) *Victoria R. I.* London: Wiedenfeld and Nicolson.

Lunt, I. (1983) Assessment of cognitive development. In Meadows, S. (ed) *Developing Thinking*. London: Methuen.

Luria, A.R. (1976) *Cognitive Development: Its Cultural and Social Foundations*. Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press.

Magariños, J.A. de Morentin (2008) *La semiótica de los bordes. Apuntes de metodología semiótica*. Córdoba, Ed. Comunicarte.

Mahler, M., Pine, F. And Bergman, A. (1975) *The Psychological Birth of the Human Infant*. London: Hutchinson.

Main, M., Kaplan, K. And Cassidy, J. (1985) Security in infancy, childhood and adulthood. A move to the level of representation. In Growing points of attachment theory and research. Bretherton, I. And Waters, E. (eds) *Monographs of the Society for Research in Child Development*, 50: 66-104.

Marx, K. (1920) *Kapital* (*Capital*). Vol. 1, Moscow: Sozekgiz.

Maslach, C. (1976) Burned – Out. *Human Behaviour*, 5th September 1976: 16-22.

Masterman, M. (1970) *The nature of paradigms*. In Lakatos, I. And Musgrave, A. (eds) Criticism and the growth of knowledge. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Mattson, D.P. (1997) Finding your way home. Orphan Stories in Young Adult Literature. *The ALAN Review*, 24(3): 17-21.

McCarthy, J.R. and Jessop, J. (2005) *Young people, bereavement and loss: /disruptive transitions?* Joseph Rowntree Foundation, National Children's Bureau.

McDougall, W. (1923) *An Outline of Psychology*. London: Methuen.

Menzies, I. (1959) The functioning of social systems as a defence against anxiety. *Human Relations*, 13: 95-121.

Menzies-Lyth, I. (1988a) *Containing Anxiety in Institutions*. London: Free Association Books.

Menzies-Lyth, I. (1988b) Still craving after all these years. London: *The Guardian*.

Mercer, N. (1996) English at Work. In Maybin, J. And Mercer, N. (eds.) *Using English: from conversation to canon*. Abingdon: Routledge.

Morgan, D.L. (2007) Paradigms Lost and Pragmatism Regained: Methodological Implications of Combining Qualitative and Quantitative Methods. *Journal of Mixed Methods Research*, 1(1): 48-76.

Mulcahey, A. L. and Young, M. A. (1995)   A bereavement support group for children, *Cancer Practice*, 3(3): 150-156.

Murray Thomas, R. (1992) *Comparing Theories of Child Development* (3rd edition). Belmont, CA: Wadsworth.

Nagy, M. (1948) The child's theories concerning death. *The Journal of Genetic Psychology*, 73: 3-27.

National Health Service Centre for Research and Dissemination (1997) *Effective health care bulletin, Mental Health Promotion in high risk groups*, York, National Health Service Centre for Research and Dissemination.

Neale, J.M. and Liebert, R.M. (1986) *Science and Behavior: An introduction to methods of research*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall.

Newson, E. (1992) The barefoot play therapist: adapting skills for a time of need. In Lane, D.A. and Miller, A. (eds) *Child and Adolescent Therapy: a handbook*. Buckingham: Open University Press.

Parker, I. (1989) *The Crisis in Modern Social Psychology, And How to End It*. London: Routledge.

Parker, I. (1992) *Discourse Dynamics*. London: Routledge.

Parker, I and Shotter, J. (1990) *Deconstructing Social Psychology*. London: Routledge.

Parkes, C.M.   (1965) Bereavement and Mental Illness. *British Journal of Medical Psychology*, 38: 1-26.

Parkes, C. M. (1969) Separation Anxiety: An Aspect of the Search for a Lost Object. In Lader, M.H. (ed) *Studies of Anxiety*. British Journal of Psychiatry Special Publication No. 3. Published by authority of the World Psychiatric Association and the Royal Medico-Psychological Association.

Parkes, C. M , Stevenson-Hinde, J. And Marris, P. (1991) *Attachment Across the Life Cycle*. London: Routledge.

Parkes, C. M. and Weisss, R.S. (1983) *Recovery from Bereavement*. New York: Basic Books.

Parsons, T. (1951) *The Social System*. Glencoe, IL: Free Press.

Pasternak, B. (1958; 2002) *Doctor Zhivago*, Vintage, London.

Peirce, C. (1931-58). *Collected Papers* (ed. C. Hartshone).   Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press.

Peters, L. (2001) *Orphan Texts: Victorian Orphans, Culture and Empire*. Manchester: Manchester University Press.

Piaget, J. (1926/1929) *The Child's Conception of the World*. New York: Harcourt Brace.

Piaget, J. (1954) *The Construction of Reality in the Child*. New York: Basic Books.

Potter, J. And Wetherell, M. (1987) *Discourse and Social Psychology: Beyond Attitudes and Behaviour*. London: Sage.

Potter, J., Wetherell, M., Gill, R. and Edwards, D. (1990) Discourse: noun, verb or social practice? *Philosophical Psychology*, 3(2), 205-17.

Raphael-Leff, J. (1991) *Psychological Processes of Childbearing*. London: Chapman & Hall.

Rauchs, G. (2004) *Sleep and memory consolidation in healthy subjects and in Alzheimer's disease. Cognitive Neuropsychology and Brain Imaging*. (Doctoral thesis). Caen: University of Caen.

Raveis, V.H., Siegel, K. and Karus, D. (1999) Children's psychological distress following the death of a parent. *Journal of Youth and Adolescence*, 28 (2): 165-180.

Roberts, J.E. and Gotlib, I. H. (1997) Lifetime episodes of dysphoria: gender, early childhood loss and personality. *British Journal of Clinical Psychology*, 36: 195-208.

Robertson, J. (1953) *Film: A Two-year-old Goes to Hospital*. 16mm, 40-minute and 30-minute versions, in English and French. Concord Video and Film Council. New York University Film Library.

Robertson, J. (1971) *Young Children in Hospital*. (2nd revised edition with postscript). London: Tavistock.

Robertson, J. and Robertson, J. (1989) *Separation and The Very Young*. London: Free Association Books.

Rogers, C. R. (1967) *On Becoming a Person: a Therapist's View of Psychotherapy*. London: Constable.

Rolls, L. and Payne, S. (2003) Childhood bereavement services: a survey of UK provision. *Palliative Medicine*, 17(5): 423-432.

Rutter, M. (1971) *Maternal Deprivation Reassessed*. London: Penguin Books.

Sameroff, A.J. (1991) The social context of development. In Woodhead, M., Carr, R. and Light, P. (eds) *Becoming a Person*. London: Routledge.

Sameroff, A.J. and Chandler, M.J. (1975) Reproductive risk and the continuum of caretaking casualty. In Horowitz, F.D. (ed) *Review of Child Development Research* (Vol. 4) Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Sandler, I.N., West, S.G., Baca, L., Pillow, D.R., Gersten, J.C. and Rogosch, F. (1992) Linking empirically based theory and evaluation: the family bereavement program, *American Journal of Community Psychology*, 20(4): 491-521.

Saussure, F. de (1974) *Course in General Linguistics* Trans. Wade Baskin. London: Fontana. [Original work published in 1916, in French].

Schaffer, H.R. (1996) *Social Development*. Oxford: Blackwell.

Schaffer, H.R. and Emerson, P.E. (1964) The development of social attachments in infancy. *Monographs of the Society for Research in Child Development*, 29 (3, Whole No. 94).

Schneiderman, G., Winders, P., Tallett, S. and Feldman, W. (1994) Do child and/or parent bereavement programs work? *Canadian Journal of Psychiatry*, 39(4): 215-218.

Schonfield, D. J. (1989) Crisis intervention for bereavement support, *Clinical Pediatrics*, 28(1): 27-33.

Seay, B., Hansen, E. and Harlow, H.F. (1962) Mother-infant separation in monkeys. *Journal of Child Psychology and Psychiatry*, 3: 123-132.

Shand, A.F. (1920) *The Foundations of Character*. London: Macmillan.

Silverman, D. (2000) *Doing Qualitative Research*. London: Sage.

Silverman, P.R. and Worden, J. W. (1993) Children's reactions to the death of a parent, In : Stroebe, M. S., Stroebe, W. & Hansson, R.O. (1993) *Handbook of Bereavement* , Cambridge, Cambridge University Press.

Stroebe, W. and Stroebe, M.S. (1987) *Bereavement and Health*. Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press.

Stroebe, M.S. and Stroebe, W. (1991) Does 'grief work' work? *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology*, 59: 479-482.

Stroebe, W. and Stroebe, M. S. (1992) Bereavement and health: processes of adjusting to the loss of a partner. In Montada, L., Filipp, S-H. And Lerner, M. J. (eds) *Life Crises and Experiences of Loss in Adulthood*. Hillsdale, NJ: Erlbaum.

Stroebe, W. and Stroebe, M. S. (1993) Determinants of adjustment to bereavement in younger widows and widowers. In Stroebe, M. S., Stroebe, W. and Hansson, R. O. (eds) *Handbook of Bereavement: Theory, Research and Intervention*. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Summers, K. H. (1993) Camp Sunrise, *American Journal of Hospice and Palliative Care*, 10(3): 24 -27.

Sutton, A. (1983) An introduction to Soviet developmental psychology. In Meadows, S. (ed) *Developing Thinking*. London: Methuen.

Symington, N. (1986) *The Analytic Experience: Lectures from the Tavistock*. London: Free Association Books.

Tennant, C., Bebbington, P. And Hurry, J. (1980) Parental death in childhood and risk of adult depressive disorder: a review. *Psychological Medicine*, 10: 289-299.

Thompson, M.P., Kaslow, N.J., Price, A.W., Williams, K. And Kingree, J.B. (1998) Role of secondary stressors in the parental death child distress relation. *Journal of Abnormal Child Psychology*, 26(5): 357-366.

Tisdale, S. (1986) *The Sorcerer's Apprentice: Tales of the Modern Hospital*. New York: McGraw Hill.

Trostle, J. (1988) Medical compliance as an ideology. Social Science & Medicine, 27(12): 1299-1308.

Van Eerdewegh, M.M., Bieri, M.D., Parrilla, R.H. and Clayton, P.J. (1982) The bereaved child, *British Journal of Psychiatry*, 140: 23-29.

Van Eerdewegh, M.M., Clayton, P.J. and Van Eerdewegh, P. (1985) The bereaved child: variables affecting early psychopathology, *British Journal of Psychiatry*, 147: 188-194.

Vygotsky, L.S. (1934) *Thought and Language*. Moscow-Leningrad: Sozekgiz.

Vygotsky, L.S. (1978) *Mind in Society: The Development of Higher Psychological Processes*. (Edited by Cole, M., John-Steiner, V., Scribner, S. and Souberman, E.) Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press.

Vygotsky, L.S. (1986) *Thought and Language*. (Edited by Kozulin, A.) London: The MIT Press.

Walter, T. (1999) *On Bereavement: The Culture of Grief*. Buckingham and Philadelphia: Open University Press.

Ward, B. (1995) *Good Grief: exploring feelings, loss and death with under 11s*. London: Jessica Kingsley Publishing.

Ward, B. (1996) *Good Grief: exploring feelings, loss and death with over 11s and adults*. London: Jessica Kingsley Publishing.

Wertsch, J.V. and Tulviste, P. (1996) L.S. Vygotsky and contemporary developmental psychology. In: Daniels, H. *An Introduction to Vygotsky*, London: Routledge.

Wetherell, M. (1986) Linguistic repertoires and literary criticism: new directions for the social psychology of gender. In: Wilkinson, S. (ed) *Feminist Social Psychology*, Milton Keynes: Open University Press.

Wetherell, M., Potter, J. And Stringer, P. (1983) Psychology, literature and texts. *Bulletin of the British Psychological Society*, 36: 377-9.

Wittgenstein, L. (1953) *Philosophical Investigations*, Oxford: Basil Blackwell.

Wittgenstein, L. (1980) *Remarks on the Philosophy of Psychology. (Volume 1),*, Oxford: Basil Blackwell.

Wolfenstein, M. (1966) How is mourning possible? *Psychoanalytic Study of the Child*, 21: 93-123.

Worden, J.W. (1991) *Grief Counselling and Grief Therapy*. London: Routledge.

Worden, J.W. (2001) Children who lose a parent to divorce and children who lose a parent to death, *Australian Journal of Grief and Bereavement*, 4: 3-5.

Xavier, J. (2013) Reviews of Paolo Freire's Books, www.fcis.oise.utoronto.ca/~daniel_sc/freire/jx.html

Ruíz Zafón, C. (2004) *The Shadow of the Wind*, Phoenix, London.

Zambelli,G.C. and DeRosa, A.P. (1992) Bereavement support groups for school -age children, *American Journal of Orthopsychiatry*, 62(4): 484-493.

Interview schedule for Investigation 4

Interviews with Counsellors and Helpers

1. Have you been involved in helping bereaved children?

2. What would you say are the difficulties and challenges that you have observed or experienced?

3. What would you say have been the most satisfying aspects of you involvement?

4. How do you approach the issue of children's emotional distress?

5. If you were a nurse or social worker, in this organisation, do you think you would be aware of the referral process for the support service?

6. Subsidiary questions will be asked according to the responses to the above questions.

Thank you for your time and for your help.

Interview schedule for Investigation 1

1. How old were you when your father/mother died?

2. *How would you say that loss has affected your life since then?*

3. *What has helped you to cope/come to terms with that loss in your life?*

4. *Do you mind if I ask you how the news was actually communicated to you at the time of your father's/mother's death?*

5. *Who told you?*

6. *Can you remember what they actually said?*

7. *Did anybody seem to be thinking about helping you to cope?*

8. *What did they do that was designed to help you?*

9. *Were you allowed/encouraged to attend the funeral?*

Thank you for your time and for your help.

Appendix 3

Interview schedule for Investigation 5

and

Sample of Line Drawings Used at Time 2

<u>Original Schedule</u>

"This x year old girl's Dad has died. This picture shows her with her Mum. Apart from her Mum, who do you think will have helped this girl? Will you draw into the picture anyone that might have helped her?"

When the child being interviewed had finished drawing, she would then be asked:

"What do you think it was that that person/those people did, that was helpful to the girl in the picture?"

<u>Amended Schedule</u>

Who would you say has helped you during the time since X died?

What was it that they did that was helpful to you?

 Or, for pre-bereavement situations:

Who would you say has helped you during the time since X has been very ill?

What was it that they did that was helpful to you?