1	The ART of mating: alternative reproductive tactics and mating success in a nest-
2	guarding fish
3	S. MASCOLINO <sup>†</sup> , C. BENVENUTO <sup>‡*</sup> , C. GUBILI <sup>‡</sup> , C. SACCHI <sup>†</sup> , B. BOUFANA <sup>‡</sup> <sub>\$</sub> , S.
4	MARIANI‡
5	† UCD School of Biology and Environmental Science, University College Dublin, Belfield,
6	Dublin 4, Ireland (srg.mascolino@gmail.com; carlotta.sacchi@ucd.ie)
7	‡ Ecosystems and Environment Research Centre, School of Environment & Life Sciences,
8	University of Salford, Salford, M5 4WT, UK (c.benvenuto@salford.ac.uk;
9	c.gubili@googlemail.com; bboufana@yahoo.com; s.mariani@salford.ac.uk)
10	§Current address: European Union Reference Laboratory for Parasites; Department of
11	Infectious, Parasitic and Immuno-mediated Diseases - Italian National Institute of Health,
12	Rome, Italy.
13	*Author to whom correspondence should be addressed. Tel.: +44(0)161 2955141; email:
14	c.benvenuto@salford.ac.uk
15	
16	Running headline: ARTs and mating success
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

26 Fish use different modalities to access mates for reproduction, often referred to as Alternative 27 Reproductive Tactics (ARTs). ARTs are an example of coexisting phenotypes, which have to 28 hold some degree of reproductive success to persist in a population. In the Mediterranean 29 damselfish (Chromis chromis), territorial males colonise nests on rocky reefs, competing for 30 females, while sneaker males attempt to parasitically spawn in those nests. Here we combine 31 behavioural observations in the field with molecular analyses, using bi-parentally and 32 maternally inherited markers, to investigate reproductive success patterns of the two observed 33 male ARTs in terms of number of eggs sired and number of females contributing to each nest. 34 Cuckoldry was observed in every nest sampled, with at least two and up to seven sneakers per 35 nest; however, the nesting male always significantly fathered the large majority of the eggs (on 36 average 49%) in each clutch. Each sneaker fathered around 7% of the clutch. The average 37 number of females whose eggs were fertilised by nesting males was 6.76 (ranging 2-13), while 38 each sneaker on average fertilised the eggs of 1.74 (range 1-8) females. Using this sibship 39 reconstruction, we investigated some of the factors involved in the regulation of the dynamic 40 equilibrium of reproductive success between the two ARTs showed by C. chromis males. Our 41 results show that the sneakers' reproductive success was positively linked to egg clutch size; 42 the density of individuals in the nesting area negatively affected the size of egg clutches; the 43 rate of defence behaviours performed by nesting males negatively influenced the number of 44 females contributing to each nest.

Key words: *Chromis chromis*; microsatellites; mtDNA; parentage assignment; sneakers.

- 45
- 46
- 47
- 48
- 49
- 50

#### **INTRODUCTION**

52 Different modalities to access mates for reproduction, also called Alternative 53 Reproductive Tactics (ARTs, Oliveira et al., 2008), are an example of coexisting phenotypes 54 (Taborsky, 1994; Heinze & Keller, 2000), where conspecifics of the same sex in one population 55 invest different amounts of energy and exhibit remarkably different strategies to ensure 56 reproduction (Taborsky et al., 2008). Fish offer a great opportunity to investigate ARTs since 57 they show a huge diversity of reproductive modes (e.g., DeWoody & Avise, 2001, Avise et al., 58 2002). In particular, males, depending on their mating system, can maximise their fitness through scramble competition, resource defence (e.g., territory, nest, and/or females), 59 60 reproductive parasitism or even cooperation (Taborsky, 2001). Of these four strategies, 61 resource defence and reproductive parasitism are often coupled as ARTs: territorial males (also 62 called nesting males) conquer and defend a suitable territory and actively attract females, while 63 other males behave as "sneakers", by parasitically spawning in the nest of a territorial male, 64 without providing any territorial defence or paternal care (Taborsky, 1994; Coleman & Jones, 65 2011).

While comprehensive knowledge of these mating strategies is available from a 66 67 behavioural point of view, less is known about the actual relative reproductive success 68 occurring as a consequence of coexisting ARTs (Garant et al., 2001; Reichard et al., 2004; 69 Cogliati et al., 2013). Knowledge of the relative fitness among different tactics can help to 70 clarify if coexisting ARTs represent a plastic/conditional strategy (dependent mainly from 71 environmental conditions, resulting in unequal male fitness) or a genetic polymorphism 72 (maintained by negative frequency dependent selection, resulting in overall similar male 73 fitness) or, as recently proposed, a mixture of these two modalities, called a conditional 74 alternative strategy (Neff & Svensson, 2013; Cogliati et al., 2014). Fitness equilibrium between 75 ARTs can be maintained by a complex interaction of multiple variables, including individual 76 traits, population features and environmental characteristics. According to literature, most of 77 the species with male nest-defence tactics exhibit a certain level of cuckoldry (i.e., part of their 78 egg clutch is fertilised by other males; Coleman & Jones, 2011). Yet, the relative number of 79 eggs fertilised by males other than the nesting one is rather limited (Mackiewicz et al., 2005; 80 Rios-Cardenas & Webster, 2008; Alonzo & Heckman, 2010). Furthermore, the rate of multiple 81 maternity for these species is very high, indicating that polygyny is fairly common in these 82 species, but the average number of dams contributing to a single nest is low (three females on 83 average; Coleman & Jones, 2011).

84 Members of the family Pomacentridae are known to exhibit ARTs (Gronell, 1989; Karino & Nakazono, 1993; Tyler, 1995; Barnett & Pankhurst, 1996). The Mediterranean 85 86 damselfish, Chromis chromis (Linnaeus, 1758), is characterised by male nest-defence. This is 87 a small (average standard length 6 cm; Bracciali et al., 2014), sexually monomorphic species 88 commonly distributed in the Mediterranean Sea, extending to the Eastern part of the Atlantic 89 Ocean. It lives in shoals near rocky reefs or above seagrass meadows at depths between 3 and 90 30 m (Lythgoe & Lythgoe, 1971; Quignard & Pras, 1986). Throughout the reproductive season 91 (June-September), colonies go through several reproductive bouts. Some males (nesting males) 92 colonise nests and guard them until eggs hatch. They attract females to receive egg deposition 93 by vocalising and performing specific courtship-displays (Picciulin et al., 2002, 2010). 94 Parasitic spawning by sneaker males is commonly observed in the Mediterranean damselfish; 95 sneakers do not establish nests, infiltrating a guarded nest, while the nesting male receives egg 96 deposition by a female. On average, nesting males can receive three intrusions over a 10 min 97 observation period (Picciulin et al., 2004). However, the success rate of these "attacks" remains 98 unclear and molecular investigation is needed to unveil the real reproductive success of 99 sneakers. Additionally, parasitic spawning is known to be occasionally performed even by

nesting males (Picciulin *et al.*, 2004). *Chromis chromis* thus offers a model to study the relative
reproductive success attained by nesting males and sneakers.

102 In this study, a combination of bi-parentally and maternally inherited markers was used 103 to investigate reproductive patterns in C. chromis. In particular, the number of breeders 104 contributing to each nest was examined, with a special focus on the relative reproductive 105 success of nest-guarding males and sneakers in terms of percentage of egg clutch sired, and the 106 number of females contributing to each clutch. Additional factors, such as egg clutch size (often 107 linked to male success), density of the colony (which influences encounter rates between sexes 108 and male-male competition) and male aggressive behaviours (towards intruders) can also affect 109 reproductive outcomes. Thus, using sibship reconstruction, the following factors were also 110 investigated: a) the relationship between egg clutch size and the relative success of nesting 111 males and sneakers; b) the link between the density of individuals in the breeding colony and 112 egg clutch size; and c) the relationship between the frequency of nest-defence behaviours 113 performed by males and the number of females spawning in their nest.

114

#### MATERIALS AND METHODS

#### 115 STUDY AREA AND SAMPLE COLLECTION

116 Two damselfish colonies were selected 5-10 m from the coasts of Palermo and Zingaro, 117 Sicily, Italy (Fig. 1) in May 2011. Twenty-five spherical flowerpots (18 cm diameter; Knapp 118 & Kovach, 1991) were placed at 7-12 m depth to provide males with artificial nests 119 (minimising differences in nests' quality and size; Fig. 1). Overall, twelve artificial nests (five 120 from Palermo and seven from Zingaro) were successfully colonised by C. chromis. Colonized 121 nests were monitored with video cameras during June and August 2011. At the end of the 122 behavioural observations, artificial nests (which contained all the eggs attached to the pot 123 surface on a single layer) were collected. Given their fast swimming behaviour, it was not 124 possible to catch the nesting males. Once on the boat, the relative quantity of eggs present in each nest was estimated (given their small size, it was not possible to count all the eggs). All
egg clutches exhibited a diamond shape; minor and major axes were measured to calculate the
surface area of each egg clutch (cm<sup>2</sup>). All eggs were detached from the flowerpot using a
scalpel and immediately stored in 100% ethanol and subsequently at -20°C.

129

## 130 DNA ISOLATION, PCR AMPLIFICATION, GENOTYPING AND SEQUENCING

131 Single eggs were separated under a stereomicroscope. DNA was isolated from a random 132 subsample of 48 eggs from each nest (total N = 576) using a modified salt extraction protocol 133 (Miller et al., 1988) and 376 eggs (30-48 per nest) were successfully amplified at seven 134 microsatellite loci. Primers from four species of the Pomacentridae family were employed: 135 2AL2 (Abudefduf luridus; Carvalho et al., 2000), Cm\_D006 (Chromis margaritifer; 136 Underwood, 2009), Da360, Da542, Da589, Da590 (Dascyllus aruanus; Fauvelot et al., 2009) 137 and SpTG53 (Stegastes partitus; Thiessen & Heath, 2007). Loci were amplified in two multiplex polymerase chain reactions (PCR). Each reaction was carried out in a total volume 138 139 of 12 µl, using 6 µl of QIAGEN® Multiplex PCR kit, 4.4 µl of DNA template and 1.6 µl of 140 primer mix. Fluorescently-labelled primers (FAM, VIC, NED and PET) were added with the 141 following concentrations: Cm\_D006 0.17 µM, 2AL2 0.17 µM, SpTG53 0.33 µM (multiplex 142 1); Da542 0.17 µM, Da589 0.17 µM, Da590 0.17 µM, Da360 0.08 µM (multiplex 2). 143 Amplification conditions were as follows: 95°C for 15 min; 37 cycles of 94°C for 45 s, 52°C 144 for 1 min, 72°C for 45 s and a final extension at 72°C for 45 min (multiplex 1); 95°C for 15 145 min; 37 cycles of 94°C for 45 s, 58°C for 1 min, 72°C for 45 s and a final extension at 72°C for 146 45min (multiplex 2). PCR reactions were performed using a Biometra T3000 thermocycler. 147 Allele sizes were determined on an ABI-3130xl Genetic Analyser (Applied Biosystems<sup>©</sup>) with 148 an internal size standard (600 LIZ, Applied Biosystems<sup>©</sup>). Genotypic data were acquired using GeneMapper 4.0 (Applied Biosystems©). Following standard practice, we re-amplified and rescored genotypes for 10% (30 eggs) to check for consistency of genotype calling.

151 Furthermore, amplification of 355 bp of the mitochondrial control region (CR) was 152 carried out on a subsample of eggs from each nest (total N = 222) using the primers CR-A and 153 CR-E (Lee et al., 1995, Domingues et al., 2005) in a 25 µl reaction volume, according to the 154 following protocol: NH<sub>4</sub> Buffer X1, dNTPs 800 µM (200 µM each), CR-A 0.3 µM, CR-E 0.3 155 µM, MgCl<sub>2</sub> 2.5 mM, Taq 2.5 U (BIOLINE), 1 µl template. Amplification conditions were as 156 follows: 94°C for 5 min; 35 cycles of 94°C for 45 s, 52°C for 45 s, and 72°C for 1 min. Products 157 were sequenced commercially (Beckman-Coulter Genomics). D-loop sequences were 158 submitted to GenBank under the accession numbers KX442797-443014.

159

# 160 POPULATION GENETIC ANALYSES

Expected unbiased (H<sub>e</sub>) and observed (H<sub>o</sub>) heterozygosities and average number of alleles (N<sub>A</sub>) per nest were calculated using the Microsatellite Toolkit add-in available for Microsoft Excel (Park, 2001). Allelic richness (A<sub>R</sub>), departure from Hardy-Weinberg equilibrium (by calculating F<sub>IS</sub> and testing significance through 1320 permutations) and linkage disequilibrium were estimated using FSTAT 2.9.3.2 (Goudet, 1995).

166 The effective number of breeders (N<sub>b</sub>) for each nest was initially investigated by 167 computing the effective population size  $(N_e)$  for each nest, using the gametic disequilibrium 168 method implemented in the software LDNe 1.31 (Waples & Do, 2008). Additionally, 169 probability of individual identity,  $P_{(ID)}$ , was calculated for all seven loci with GIMLET 170 (Valière, 2002);  $P_{(ID)}$  is defined as the chance that two individuals drawn at random from the 171 same population will share the same genotypic profile at multiple loci (Waits et al., 2001). 172 GIMLET allows to calculate both  $P_{(ID)sib}$  (the  $P_{(ID)}$  of a population where siblings are found 173 and included, Evett & Weir, 1998) and  $P_{(ID)unbiased}$  (the  $P_{(ID)}$  after sample size corrections;

174 Paetkau *et al.*, 1998); the observed  $P_{(ID)}$  lays between  $P_{(ID)sib}$  and  $P_{(ID)unbiased}$  and is estimated by 175 computing the proportion of all possible pairs of individuals that have identical genotypes.

All CR sequences were manipulated on ProSeq 3.0 (Filatov, 2002), and subsequently aligned with ClustalX 2.1 (Larkin *et al.*, 2007) using the default parameters, whilst resulted alignments were verified by eye. Summary statistics of haplotypes (*K*), number of polymorphic sites (*n*), haplotype diversity (*h*), nucleotide diversity ( $\pi$ ) and standard deviations (SD) (Nei, 1987), for the pooled dataset and per nest, were calculated with Arlequin 3.11 (Excoffier *et al.*, 2005). Finally, a median joining network was examined on NETWORK 4.6.1.0 (Bandelt *et al.*, 1999; <u>http://www.fluxus-engineering.com</u>).

183

# 184 RELATEDNESS ANALYSIS AND PARENTAGE ASSIGNMENT

Since genetic data from parents were not available, sibship and parentage of offspring were assigned in Colony 2.0 (Jones & Wang, 2009) using the built-in maximum-likelihood method for microsatellite data. Half- and full-sib pairs with a probability equal to 1.0 (100%) were selected and manually grouped under two inferred parents of unknown sex. Mitochondrial haplotype information was then used to determine the sex of each parent: offspring assigned to one parent could share the same haplotype (thus the parent was classified as female) or exhibit more than one haplotype (parent classified as male; Sefc *et al.*, 2008).

For those parent-offspring groups with no clear pattern (CR haplotypes were determined only for 59% of the eggs used to infer sibship), a manual cross-check across the whole data-set was performed: every offspring was shared by two parents, if one of them was clearly classified as either sex, the other had to belong to the opposite sex. The male with the highest number of offspring assigned within a nest was assumed to be the nesting male (Coleman & Jones, 2011). The number of offspring fertilised by each male in a nest was recorded and the relative proportion of eggs fathered was estimated. The average of the number of females whose eggs were fertilised by each male was calculated, weighted by the number ofoffspring per nest.

201

# 202 BEHAVIOURAL OBSERVATIONS

203 Clear parentage information was successfully obtained for nine out of the 12 nests (N 204 = 6 for Palermo, N = 3 for Zingaro). For these nests, behavioural data had been obtained from 205 video cameras installed by a scuba diver in front of each nest, at a distance of 80-120 cm. The 206 central 75 min of each 90 min video were scored to determine the number of defence-related 207 behaviours performed (thrusts: focal male moves toward the opponent with a rapid movement 208 and turns immediately back upon reaching the adversary; chases: focal male does not turn back 209 after the thrust but instead chases the adversary for several metres; Verginella et al., 1999). The 210 nine focal males' behaviour was followed for a total of approximately 11 h of observation using 211 JWatcher 1.0 (Blumstein & Daniel, 2007). The number of defence-related behaviours per hour 212 were quantified considering only the time spent by focal males in sight of the camera view (i.e. 213 [defence behaviours \* (total time min) - time spent out of sight min)<sup>-1</sup>] \* 60 min). Damselfish 214 density (i.e., number of individuals per colony) varied across locations. At the end of randomly 215 chosen sampling sessions, video files were recorded to estimate density expressed as number 216 of individuals per breeding colony.

217

## 218 DATA EXPLORATION AND STATISTICAL ANALYSES

The clutch size in each nest can be assumed to be a proxy of the success of the nesting male (Carriço *et al.*, 2014), but this can be hampered by high presence of sneakers (Reichard *et al.*, 2004) and/or by high density of individuals in the colony (Mück *et al.*, 2013). Thus, nesting males should increase the number of defence behaviours against sneakers to maximize 223 their fertilization rate. This defence behaviour could become even more predominant as number 224 of females visiting the nest increases (eggs can be deposited in a nest by a single or multiple 225 females). Starting with these assumptions and using the available variables estimated for each 226 nest (number of parents, number of sneakers, number of females, egg clutch size, proportion 227 of eggs fathered by the nesting male and defence behaviours; Table I), a principal component 228 analysis (PCA) was run. Although the dataset did not strictly meet all PCA assumptions 229 (Budaev, 2010), the variables factor map generated was used to visualise and gather a better 230 understanding of the complex relationships among the variables of this system. Such 231 relationships were also tested by fitting generalised linear models (GLM) and linear models, to 232 confirm their significance.

233 The analyses performed were: a) the relationship between the relative reproductive 234 success of nesting males and size of the egg clutch (GLM with a binomial distribution and a 235 logit link function: a column-bind matrix was created with the cbind function linking the 236 number of eggs fertilized by the nesting male with those fertilized by sneakers to consider the 237 relative frequency of nesting male success using the actual number of eggs and not proportions) 238 ; b) the relationship between the density of individuals and the size of the clutch (GLM with a 239 negative-binomial distribution and log link function, due to overdispersion of data; O'Hara & 240 Kotze, 2010); c) the relationship between the density of individuals and the reproductive 241 success of the sneakers (number of eggs not fathered by the nesting male) using a linear model. 242 Given that the main source of variability in the number of parents per nest was the 243 number of females (see results below and Table I), a Pearson correlation was run between the 244 number of females and the total number of parents per nest. A GLM (Poisson distribution and 245 log link function) was fitted using the number of females per nest as the response variable and the number of defence-related behaviour per hour as the explanatory variable. 246

All GLM were tested with and without the study area as a covariate to take into account general differences between the two areas; the two models for each test were compared and the best one was chosen according the Akaike information criterion (AIC; Burnham, 2011). Data exploration and statistical analyses were preformed using R statistical software (R 2.13; R Development Core Team, 2011).

252

253

#### RESULTS

254 Overall, 376 offspring were successfully amplified at all seven microsatellite loci (data 255 is available upon request). Microsatellite markers showed no evidence of linkagedisequilibrium. Ho, on average, was not significantly different from He (0.77 and 0.75 256 257 respectively). Average number of alleles per nest was 8.08, with nest E showing the lowest and 258 nest K showing the highest number of alleles and allelic richness respectively (Table II). The 259 average number of breeders per nest, estimated by N<sub>b</sub>, was 13.97, ranging from 2.3 (nest L) to 29.7 (nest K). Overall  $P_{\text{(ID)sibs}}$  and  $P_{\text{(ID)unbiased}}$  were respectively 4.130 x 10<sup>-4</sup> and 2.588 x 10<sup>-13</sup> 260 261 indicating that two individuals had less than 0.04% probability of sharing the same multilocus 262 genotypic profile (Table II).

In total, 218 mtDNA sequences were generated (Accession numbers: KX442797-443014), including 49 variable sites and 38 haplotypes. The CR haplotype diversity ranged from high values (0.931) to null (0.000), whilst values of nucleotide diversity ranged from 0.018 to 0.000 (Table II). The individual haplotype network reflected the high haplotype diversity across areas (Fig. 2).

268 Of the original 376 eggs, 360 (173 from Palermo and 187 from Zingaro) showed a 269 probability of 100% to be either full- or half-sib with at least another offspring and thus, they 270 were used to infer sibship within each damselfish colony. Moreover,  $P(_{\rm ID})$ sibs and 271  $P(_{\rm ID})$  unbiased indicated a negligible probability that two individuals could share the same 272 multilocus genotypic profile.

273 Overall, 201 offspring sequenced for mitochondrial CR (95 from Palermo and 106 from 274 Zingaro) were used to assign sex to the parents previously inferred by COLONY. It was possible 275 to extract clear information for nine of the twelve original nests. It was not possible to define a 276 clear pattern for the remaining three, because either the information provided by mtDNA was 277 not sufficient to discriminate between males and females (all offspring shared the same 278 haplotype, nests A and E), or provided unrealistic scenarios (both parents for each given 279 offspring showed more than one haplotype, e.g. nest B, in contrast with the assumption that 280 females transmit the same mitotype to all of their offspring). However, even in these instances, 281 we were able to gauge an idea of the number of parents contributing to each nest.

282 Cuckoldry was observed in every nest sampled. One male fathered most of the eggs in 283 each nest, on average 49% (range 27-75%) of the egg clutch; we assumed that male to be the 284 nesting one (Table I). The weighted average number of sneakers per nest was 6.48 (range 2-7); 285 on average, each sneaker fathered 7% of the egg clutch (Supplementary Table SI). The 286 weighted average number of females whose eggs were fertilised by nesting males was 6.76 287 (range 2-13), while each sneaker on average fertilised the eggs of 1.74 (range 1-8) females 288 (Supplementary Table SI). Female polygamy was also observed: 2 females (out of the 72 that 289 contributed to our sample) were found to have laid their eggs in two different nests, D and K, 290 during the same reproductive bout.

The first two principal components of the PCA explained more than 85% of the variance of the dataset (PC1: 58.18%; PC2: 27.32%). From the PCA variables factor plot, nesting male reproductive success appears to be negatively correlated with the size of the egg clutch (z = -3.309, p = 0.0009), which instead is linked to sneakers reproductive success (Fig. 3), as supported by the GLM analysis (z = 3.56, p = 0.0004). Moreover, the density of

individuals in the colony and the clutch sizes show a negative relationship (z = -4.445, p < 0.0001), whereas the density did not affect the sneakers' reproductive success (t = -1.696, p = 0.134). All analyses were repeated excluding nest L, characterized by the smallest egg clutch, the higher density and the lowest number of sneakers. Without this nest, the relationships explained by the factor map (PC1+ PC2 = 71%) were maintained but density and number of sneakers were no longer significant, while the results of all the other tests were the same.

302 In the factor map, the total number of parents per nest was associated with the number 303 of females and both showed some level of inverse relationship with the number of defence 304 behaviours performed by nesting males. Pearson correlation between the number of parents 305 and the number of females per nest was strongly significant (r = 0.96; p < 0.0001) confirming 306 that the variability in number of parents among nests was due to the variation in number of 307 females. The rate of defence behaviours showed to have a significant, negative effect on the 308 number of females contributing to each nest (z = -2.685, p = 0.007). No correlation was found 309 between the number of females and clutch size (r = 0.54; p = 0.13).

The AIC test suggested that adding the study area as a covariate improved only the model testing for the effect of the size of the egg clutch on sneakers reproductive success, hence we removed it from the other two models. In any case, there was no significant effect of the study area in all the models.

314

315

#### DISCUSSION

In both *C. chromis* colonies from Palermo and Zingaro, cuckoldry was found to be
pervasive in every single nest analysed. This is one of few studies (Munehara & Takenaka,
2000; Alonzo & Heckman, 2010) that report such trends in natural marine fish populations:
despite the very high variability in multiple paternities across species characterised by male

320 nest defence, Coleman & Jones (2011) reported an average of 35% of nests per population 321 being fertilized by multiple males, while in the current study 100% of the nests were cuckolded. 322 The nesting male was assumed to be the individual that fertilised the majority of eggs 323 within a nest in agreement with previous studies (Coleman & Jones, 2011). In species for which 324 parentage studies are available, the proportion of eggs sired by males other than the nesting 325 one was almost always below 30% (e.g., 12.4% for molly miller, Scartella cristata, 326 Mackiewicz et al., 2005; 15% for pumpkinseed sunfish, Lepomis gibbosus, Rios-Cardenas & 327 Webster, 2008; 28% in the ocellated wrasse, Symphodus ocellatus, Alonzo & Heckman, 2010). 328 However, C. chromis sneakers stand out from the "typical" reproductive success patterns 329 observed in species characterised by male nest defence. On average, 51% of the eggs were 330 sired by sneakers, with a record value of 73% observed in nest C (where eggs were fertilized 331 by seven different sneakers). Similar values (an average of 48% of eggs sired by sneakers) have 332 been found recently in the plainfin midshipman fish, Porichthys notatus (Cogliati et al., 2013). 333 In this species though, nest takeovers have been described, which lower the paternity estimates 334 for the original nest owner (when takeovers are taken into account, the actual sneaker 335 contribution to nest decrease to 37%). The high sneaker success in the two population of C. 336 *chromis* under study is not surprising, given the high number of sneakers parasitizing each 337 nest in the two colonies: with the exception of nest L, the number of sires contributing to each 338 nest ranged from six to seven (Table I).

Multiple maternity is commonly observed in species characterised by male-nest defence (Coleman & Jones, 2001 and references therein), and in this study the level of polygyny was particularly high: up to 15 dams per nest were found, double the highest number reported to date for the molly miller (Mackiewicz *et al.*, 2005). Nesting males are expected to be polygamous; once the "reproductive resource" (i.e., the nest) is secured, their fitness is mostly limited by the number of females they manage to mate with. Females, on the other hand, 345 are normally limited by the amount of eggs they can produce and are expected to exert strong 346 sexual selection by carefully choosing where to lay their eggs. Nests already containing eggs 347 may be favoured (Pruett-Jones, 1992; Brennan et al., 2008) as males are less likely to desert 348 full nests (Jennions & Polakow, 2001). In this study, two females were found to lay their eggs 349 in two different nests during the same reproductive bout. A similar scenario has been rarely 350 reported (Taborsky et al., 1987; Jones et al., 1998). This strategy might be employed by 351 females to minimize the risk of predation on their offspring or to select males with different 352 qualities (Alonzo & Warner, 2000).

353 The size of the egg clutch was positively correlated with the reproductive success of 354 sneakers. This means that, contrary to expectations (Carrico et al., 2014), the relative 355 reproductive success of the nesting male decreases when many eggs are present in his nest. 356 Indeed, a large clutch of eggs is very likely to be the result of multiple egg deposition events 357 by one or more females. Considering that the window of opportunity for a sneaker to achieve 358 parasitic fertilisation is during female spawning (as eggs are fertilised straight away; Picciulin 359 et al., 2004), more egg deposition events will result in higher chances to sneak. Thus, a larger 360 clutch size possibly results in higher reproductive success for both types of males but lower 361 relative reproductive success for the cuckolded nesting males.

362 Colonial nesting with the associated high density of individuals per breeding colony 363 may favour parasitic spawning (Reichard *et al.*, 2004) and high levels of cuckoldry. Relatively 364 low reproductive success by nesting males have already been observed in the freshwater fish 365 *Variabilichromis morii* (Sefc *et al.*, 2008). Literature suggests that density of individuals plays 366 a major role in parentage patterns due to high encounter rates among conspecifics (Kokko & 367 Rankin 2006) making it easier for nesting males to attract females. Conversely, high numbers 368 of individuals are often associated with high numbers of sneakers, augmenting the chances to 369 be cuckolded (Soucy & Travis, 2003). In C. chromis though, clutch size seems to be negatively 370 correlated with the density of individuals in the colonies. Nesting males switch from courtship 371 to parental care when the trade-off between trying to receive more egg deposition and avoiding 372 to be cuckolded turns in favour of the latter (Kanoh, 2000). The threshold of this trade-off is 373 not fixed, and it is likely to shift in response to demographic and environmental variability. 374 Under high densities, it is possible that males perceive a higher risk of cuckoldry and shift more 375 quickly to parental care. A similar situation has been reported in S. ocellatus, where nesting 376 males surrounded by many sneakers can give up temporarily courtship activities by preventing 377 any female to spawn in their nest to avoid competition (Alonzo & Warner, 1999). To do so 378 effectively, males need to be able to recognise sneakers and distinguish them from females. In 379 most species a certain dimorphism between the sexes exists (e.g., in colouration and/or size) 380 and nesting males might be distinguishable from sneakers (Gross & Charnov, 1980; Taborsky 381 et al., 1987). Chromis chromis appears to be morphologically monomorphic, making 382 individual behaviour (including acoustic behaviour) the most reliable information in 383 distinguishing males from females. Sneakers do not show significant differences in terms of 384 size when compared to nesting males (Picciulin et al., 2004). They have however, been 385 reported to exhibit submissive behaviours, typical of females, when attempting to intrude in 386 the nests of guarding males (Verginella et al., 1999). This behavioural adaptation, combined 387 with the lack of evident dimorphism between males exhibiting different ARTs, may explain 388 the high levels of cuckoldry (especially when densities are not high) and the relatively low 389 reproductive success of the nesting males observed. Higher density of individuals might inform 390 nesting males about the risk of cuckoldry.

Females must carefully pick their mates to maximise their fitness (Steinwender *et al.*, 2012). Defence related behaviours were found to negatively affect the number of females laying eggs in the nests. Extremely dominant individuals may not always be the best choice (Qvarnström & Forsgren, 1998): an excessive amount of energy or time spent in aggressive 395 interactions might cause the nesting male to neglect other important activities related to 396 parental care, such as egg fanning (Verginella et al., 1999). Moreover, visually conspicuous 397 behaviours, including defence related ones, might increase the chance to be spotted by 398 predators (Daly, 1978; Crowley et al., 1991; Dill et al., 1999). For a potential dam an extremely aggressive male might not be the best carer for her eggs and likely more exposed to predators. 399 400 Alternatively, the negative relationship found between the rate of defence behaviours and the 401 number of dams, could be determined by nesting males decision: when the perceived risk of 402 cuckoldry is high (i.e., high density of individuals), nesting males switch early to parental care. 403 This is achieved by actively chasing away any further female approaching the nest (Alonzo & 404 Warner, 1999).

405 Overall, this study provides new information on the mating system and, more 406 specifically, the reproductive patterns of the nest-guarding C. chromis. Our findings shed new 407 light on the role and consequences of ARTs in this nesting species: 1) cuckoldry and 408 promiscuity were found to be widespread; 2) the number of males and females contributing to 409 the offspring of each nest are the highest reported in literature (Coleman & Jones, 2011); 3) the 410 reproductive success of nesting males is among the lowest reported for territorial fish (average 411 49%, lower than 52% recorded by Cogliati et al., 2013 in the plainfin midshipman fish, where 412 nest takeovers occur; see also reviews by Avise et al., 2002; Coleman & Jones, 2011). The 413 complex interactions between factors determining the relative success of ARTs require a 414 multidisciplinary approach ranging from molecular analyses to behavioural observations and 415 from focal individuals to populations. Knowledge about these interactions becomes extremely 416 important when predicting fitness patterns in a changing environment that is increasingly 417 affected by human impacts.

418

420	We would like to thank: Jon Yearsley for statistical advice, Natalia Niceta, Jen Coughlan and
421	Siobhán Bradley, Kelly Hickey, Emma Lawlor, Meabh Nic Mhathúna, Claire Morton and
422	Martina O'Brien for their help in the field, Stephen Woodward for his help in the lab. We are
423	grateful to two anonymous reviewers for their constructive comments on a previous version of
424	this manuscript. This study was supported by the Irish Research Council (IRC) under the
425	Embark Initiative (RS/2010/2106). Ethical approval was obtained by UCD, University College
426	Dublin (AREC-P-10-33).
427	
428	Supporting Information
429	Supporting Information may be found in the online version of this paper:
430	Table SI Relative proportion of eggs fathered by each male contributing to each nest, and
431	number of female mates (in brackets); NM: nesting male; SNK: sneaker. Subscripts on the Nest
432	category define sampling location: Z from Zingaro and P from Palermo.
432 433	category define sampling location: Z from Zingaro and P from Palermo.
432 433 434	category define sampling location: Z from Zingaro and P from Palermo. References
432 433 434 435	category define sampling location: Z from Zingaro and P from Palermo. <b>References</b> Alonzo, S. H. & Heckman, K. L. (2010). The unexpected but understandable dynamics of
432 433 434 435 436	category define sampling location: Z from Zingaro and P from Palermo. <b>References</b> Alonzo, S. H. & Heckman, K. L. (2010). The unexpected but understandable dynamics of mating, paternity, and paternal care in the ocellated wrasse. <i>Proceedings of the Royal</i>
432 433 434 435 436 437	category define sampling location: Z from Zingaro and P from Palermo. <b>References</b> Alonzo, S. H. & Heckman, K. L. (2010). The unexpected but understandable dynamics of mating, paternity, and paternal care in the ocellated wrasse. <i>Proceedings of the Royal</i> <i>Society of London B</i> , <b>277</b> , 115-122.
432 433 434 435 436 437 438	category define sampling location: Z from Zingaro and P from Palermo. <b>References</b> Alonzo, S. H. & Heckman, K. L. (2010). The unexpected but understandable dynamics of mating, paternity, and paternal care in the ocellated wrasse. <i>Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B</i> , <b>277</b> , 115-122. Alonzo, S. H. &Warner, R. R. (2000). Dynamic games and field experiments examining intra-
432 433 434 435 436 437 438 439	<ul> <li>category define sampling location: Z from Zingaro and P from Palermo.</li> <li>References</li> <li>Alonzo, S. H. &amp; Heckman, K. L. (2010). The unexpected but understandable dynamics of mating, paternity, and paternal care in the ocellated wrasse. <i>Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B</i>, 277, 115-122.</li> <li>Alonzo, S. H. &amp;Warner, R. R. (2000). Dynamic games and field experiments examining intraand intersexual conflict: explaining counterintuitive mating behavior in a Mediterranean</li> </ul>
432 433 434 435 436 437 438 439 440	<ul> <li>category define sampling location: Z from Zingaro and P from Palermo.</li> <li>References</li> <li>Alonzo, S. H. &amp; Heckman, K. L. (2010). The unexpected but understandable dynamics of mating, paternity, and paternal care in the ocellated wrasse. <i>Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B</i>, 277, 115-122.</li> <li>Alonzo, S. H. &amp;Warner, R. R. (2000). Dynamic games and field experiments examining intraand intersexual conflict: explaining counterintuitive mating behavior in a Mediterranean wrasse, <i>Symphodus ocellatus. Behavioral Ecology</i>, 11, 56-70.</li> </ul>
432 433 434 435 436 437 438 439 440 441	<ul> <li>category define sampling location: Z from Zingaro and P from Palermo.</li> <li><b>References</b></li> <li>Alonzo, S. H. &amp; Heckman, K. L. (2010). The unexpected but understandable dynamics of mating, paternity, and paternal care in the ocellated wrasse. <i>Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B</i>, 277, 115-122.</li> <li>Alonzo, S. H. &amp; Warner, R. R. (2000). Dynamic games and field experiments examining intraand intersexual conflict: explaining counterintuitive mating behavior in a Mediterranean wrasse, <i>Symphodus ocellatus. Behavioral Ecology</i>, 11, 56-70.</li> <li>Alonzo, S. H. &amp; Warner, R. R. (1999). A trade-off generated by sexual conflict: Mediterranean</li> </ul>
432 433 434 435 436 437 438 439 440 441 442	<ul> <li>category define sampling location: Z from Zingaro and P from Palermo.</li> <li><b>References</b></li> <li>Alonzo, S. H. &amp; Heckman, K. L. (2010). The unexpected but understandable dynamics of mating, paternity, and paternal care in the ocellated wrasse. <i>Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B</i>, 277, 115-122.</li> <li>Alonzo, S. H. &amp;Warner, R. R. (2000). Dynamic games and field experiments examining intraand intersexual conflict: explaining counterintuitive mating behavior in a Mediterranean wrasse, <i>Symphodus ocellatus. Behavioral Ecology</i>, 11, 56-70.</li> <li>Alonzo, S. H. &amp; Warner, R. R. (1999). A trade-off generated by sexual conflict: Mediterranean wrasse males refuse present mates to increase future success. <i>Behavioral Ecology</i>, 10, 105-</li> </ul>

- 444 Avise, J. C., Jones, A. G., Walker, D., DeWoody, J. A., Dakin, B., Fiumera, A., Fletcher, D.,
- 445 Mackiewicz, M., Pearse, D., Porter, B. & Wilkins, S. D. (2002). Genetic mating systems
- and reproductive natural histories of fishes: lesson for ecology and evolution. *Annual Review of Genetics*, 36, 19-45.
- Bandelt, H. J., Forster, P. & Röhl, A. (1999). Median joining networks for inferring
  intraspecific phylogenies. *Molecular Biology and Evolution*, 16, 37-48.
- Barnett, C. W. & Pankhurst, N. W. (1996). Effect of density on the reproductive behaviour of
  the territorial male demoiselle *Chromis dispilus* (Pisces: Pomacentridae). *Environmental Biology of Fishes*, 46, 343-349.
- Blumstein, D. T. & Daniel, J. C. (2007). Quantifying Behavior the JWatcher Way. Sinauer
  Associates, Massachusetts, USA.
- Bracciali, C., Piovano, S., Sara, G. & Giacoma C. (2014). Seasonal changes in size, sex-ratio
  and body condition of the damselfish *Chromis chromis* in the central Mediterranean Sea.
- 457 *Journal of the Marine Biological Association of the United Kingdom*, **94**, 1053–1061.
- 458 Brennan, B. J., Flaxman, S. M. & Alonzo, S. H. (2008). Female alternative reproductive
- 459 behaviors: the effect of female group size on mate assessment and copying. *Journal of*460 *Theoretical Biology*, 253, 561-569.
- Budaev, S. V. (2010). Using principal components and factor analysis in animal behaviour
  research: caveats and guidelines. *Ethology*, **116**, 472-480.
- Burnham, K. P., Anderson, D. R. & Huyvaert, K. P. (2011). AIC model selection and
  multimodel inference in behavioral ecology: some background, observations, and
  comparisons. *Behavioral Ecology and Sociobiology*, 65, 23-35.
- 466 Carriço, R., Amorim, M. C. P. & Fonseca, P. J. (2014). Reproductive success in the Lusitanian
  467 toadfish Halobatrachus didactylus: Influence of male and nest sizes. *Journal of*468 *Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology*, 456, 65–69.

- 469 Carvalho, M. C., Streiff, R., Guillemaud, T., Afonso, P., Santos, R. S. & Cancela, M. L. (2000).
- 470 Isolation and characterization of polymorphic microsatellite markers in *Abudefduf luridus*471 (Pisces: Pomacentridae). *Molecular Ecology*, 9, 993-1011.
- 472 Cogliati, K. M., Neff, B. D. & Balshine, S. (2013). High degree of paternity loss in a species
  473 with alternative reproductive tactics. *Behavioral Ecology and Sociobiology*, 67, 399-408.
- 474 Cogliati, K.M., Balshine, S. & Neff, B.D. (2014). Competition and cuckoldry: estimating
- 475 fitness of alternative reproductive tactics in plainfin midshipman. *Behaviour*, 151, 1209-476 1227.
- 477 Coleman, S. W. & Jones, A. G. (2011). Patterns of multiple paternity and maternity in fishes.
  478 *Biological Journal of the Linnean Society*, 103, 735-760.
- 479 Crowley, P. H., Travers, S. E., Linton, M. C., Cohn, S. L., Sih, A. & Sargent, R. C. (1991).
- 480 Mate density, predation risk, and the seasonal sequence of mate choices: a dynamic game.
  481 *The American Naturalist*, **137**, 567-596.
- 482 Daly, M. (1978). The cost of mating. *The American Naturalist*, **112**, 771-774.
- 483 DeWoody, J. A. & Avise, J. C. (2001). Genetic perspective on the natural history of fish mating
  484 systems. *The American Genetic Association*, **92**, 167-172.
- 485 Dill, L. M., Hedrick, A. V. & Fraser, A. (1999). Male mating strategies under predation risk:
  486 do females call the shots? *Behavioral Ecology*, 10, 452-461.
- 487 Domingues, V. S., Bucciarelli, G., Almada, V. & Bernardi, G. (2005). Historical colonization
- 488 and demography of the Mediterranean damselfish, *Chromis chromis. Molecular Ecology*,
  489 14, 4051-4063.
- 490 Evett, I. & Weir, B. (1998). Interpreting DNA Evidence: Statistical Genetics for Forensic
- 491 *Scientists* Sinauer, Sunderland.

- 492 Excoffier, L., Laval, G. & Schneider, S. (2005). Arlequin (version 3.0): an integrated software
  493 package for population genetics data analysis. *Evolutionary Bioinformatics Online*, 1, 47494 50.
- 495 Excoffier, L., Smouse, P. E. & Quattro, J. M. (1992). Analysis of Molecular Variance Inferred
- 496 From Metric Distances Among DNA Haplotypes: Application to Human Mitochondrial
  497 DNA Restriction Data. *Genetics*, 131, 476-491.
- Fauvelot, C., Smith-Keune, C., Jerry, R., Buston, P. M. & Planes, S. (2009). Isolation and
  characterization of 16 microsatellite loci in the humbug damselfish, *Dascyllus aruanus*

500 (family Pomacentridae). *Molecular Ecology Resources*, **9**, 651-653.

- Filatov, D. A. (2002). Proseq: a software for preparation and evolutionary analysis of DNA
  sequence data sets. *Molecular Ecology Notes*, 2, 621-624.
- Garant, D., Dodson, J. J. & Bernatchez. L. (2001). A genetic evaluation of mating system and determinants
  of individual reproductive success in Atlantic salmon (*Salmo salar* L.). *Journal of Heredity*, 92, 137–
  145.
- 506 Goudet, J. (1995). FSTAT (Version 1.2): a computer program to calculate F-statistics. *Journal*507 *of Heredity*, 86, 485-486.
- 508 Gronell, A. M. (1989). Visiting behaviour by females of the sexually dichromatic damselfish,
- 509 *Chrysiptera cyanea* (Teleostei: Pomacentridae): a probable method of assessing male
  510 quality. *Ethology*, **81**, 89-122.
- 511 Gross, M. R. & Charnov, E. L. (1980). Alternative male life histories in bluegill sunfish.
  512 Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences USA 77, 6937-6940.
- Heinze, J. and Keller, L. (2000). Alternative reproductive strategies: a queen perspective in
  ants. *Trends in Ecology and Evolution*, 15, 508-512.
- 515 Jennions, M. D. & Polakow, D. A. (2001). The effect of partial brood loss on male desertion
- 516 in a cichlid fish: an experimental test. *Behavioral Ecology*, **12**, 84-92.

- Jones, A. G., Östlund-Nilsson, S. & Avise, J. C. (1998). A microsatellite assessment of sneaked
  fertilizations and egg thievery in the fifteenspine stickleback. *Evolution*, 52, 848-858.
- Jones, O. & Wang, J. (2009). COLONY: a program for parentage and sibship inference from
  multilocus genotype data. *Molecular Ecology Resources*, 10, 551-555.
- 521 Kanoh, Y. (2000). Reproductive success associated with territoriality, sneaking, and grouping
- in male rose bitterlings, *Rhodeus ocellatus* (Pisces: Cyprinidae). *Environmental Biology*of Fishes, 57, 143-154.
- 524 Knapp, R. A. & Kovach, J. T. (1991). Courtship as an honest indicator of male parental quality
  525 in the bicolor damselfish, *Stegastes partitus. Behavioral Ecology*, 2, 295–300.
- 526 Karino, K. & Nakazono, A. (1993). Reproductive behavior of the territorial herbivore *Stegastes*
- *nigricans* (Pisces: Pomacentridae) in relation to colony formation. *Journal of* Ethology, **11**, 99-110.
- Kokko, H. & Rankin, D. J. (2006). Lonely hearts or sex in the city? Density-dependent effects
  in mating systems. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B*, 361, 319-334.
- 531 Larkin, M. A., Blackshields, G., Brown, N. P., Chenna, R., McGettigan, P. A., McWilliam, H.,
- 532 Valentin, F., Wallace, I. M., Wilm, A., Lopez, R., Thompson, J. D., Gibson, T. J. &
- 533 Higgins, D. G. (2007). Clustal W and Clustal X version 2.0. *Bioinformatics*, 23, 2947534 2948.
- Lee, W. J., Conroy, J., Howell, W. H. & Kocher, T. D. (1995). Structure and evolution of
  teleost mitochondrial control regions. *Journal of Molecular Evolution*, 41, 54-66.
- 537 Lythgoe, J. & Lythgoe, G. (1971). Fishes of the sea: the coastal waters of the British Isles,
  538 northern Europe and the Mediterranean. London, Blanford: 1-320.
- 539 Mackiewicz, M., Porter, B. A., Dakin, E. E. & Avise, J. C. (2005). Cuckoldry rates in the Molly
- 540 Miller (*Scartella cristata*, Blenniidae), a hole-nesting marine fish with alternative
- 541 reproductive tactics. *Marine Biology*, **148**, 213-221.

- 542 Miller, S. A., Dykes, D. D. & Polesky, H. F. (1988). A simple salting out procedure for
  543 extracting DNA from human nucleated cells. *Nucleic Acids Research*, 16, 1215.
- Mück, I., Wacker, S., Myhre, L. C. & Amundsen, T. (2013). Nest distribution affects behaviour
  and mating success in a marine fish. *Behavioral Ecology and Sociobiology*, 67, 609–619.
- 546 Munehara, H. & Takenaka, O. (2000). Microsatellite markers and multiple paternity in a
  547 parental care fish, *Hexagrammos otakii*. *Journal of Ethology*, **18**, 101-104.
- 548 Nei, M. (1987). Molecular evolutionary genetics. Columbia University Press, New York.
- 549 Neff, B. D. & Svensson, E. I. (2013). Polyandry and alternative mating tactics. *Philosophical*550 *Transactions of the Royal Society B* 368: 20120045.
- 551 O'Hara, R. B. & Kotze, D. J. (2010). Do not log-tranform count data. *Methods in Ecology and*552 *Evolution*, 1, 118-122.
- 553 Oliveira R. F., Taborsky M. & Brockmann H. J. (2008). Alternative reproductive tactics: an
  554 integrative approach. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- 555 Paetkau, D., Waits, L. P., Clarkson, P. L., Craighead, L., Vyse, E., Ward, R. & Strobeck, C.
- 556 (1998). Variation in genetic diversity across the range of North American brown bears.
- 557 *Conservation Biology*, **12**, 418-429.
- 558 Park, S. D. E. (2001). Trypanotolerance in West African Cattle and the Population Genetic
  559 Effects of Selection. *Ph.D. thesis*, University of Dublin.
- 560 Picciulin, M., Costantini, M., Hawkins, A. D. & Ferrero, E. A. (2002). Sound emissions of the
- 561 Mediterranean damselfish *Chromis chromis* (Pomacentridae). *Bioacoustics: The*562 *International Journal of Animal Sound and its Recording*, 12, 236-238.
- 563 Picciulin, M., Verginella, L., Spoto, M. & Ferrero, E. A. (2004). Colonial nesting and the
  564 importance of the brood size in male parasitic reproduction of the Mediterranean
  565 damselfish *Chromis chromis* (Pisces: Pomacentridae). *Environmental Biology of Fishes*,
- **566 70**, 23-30.

- 567 Picciulin, M., Sebastianutto, L., Codarin, A., Farina, A. & Ferrero, E. A. (2010). In situ
- behavioural responses to boat noise exposure of *Gobius cruentatus* (Gmelin, 1789; fam.
- 569 Gobiidae) and *Chromis chromis* (Linnaeus, 1758; fam. Pomacentridae) living in a Marine
- 570 Protected Area. *Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology*, **386**, 125-132.
- 571 Pruett-Jones, S. (1992). Independent versus nonindependent mate choice: do females copy each
  572 other? *The American Naturalist*, **140**, 1000-1009.
- Quignard, J. P. & Pras, A. (1986). Pomacentridae. In: *Fishes of the North-eastern Atlantic and Mediterranean*, Whitehead, P.J.P., Bauchot, M.L., Hureau, J.C., Nielsen, J. and Tottonese,
- 575 E. (Editors), UNESCO, UK.
- 576 Qvarnström, A. & Forsgren, E. (1998). Should females prefer dominant males? *Trends in*577 *Ecology and Evolution*, 13, 498-501.
- 578 Reichard, M., Smith, C. & Jordan, W. C. (2004). Genetic evidence reveals density-dependent
  579 mediated success of alternative mating behaviours in European bitterling (*Rhodeus*580 *sericeus*). *Molecular Ecology*, 13, 1569-1578.
- 581 Rios-Cardenas, O. & Webster, M.S. (2008). A molecular genetic examination of the mating
  582 system of pumpkinseed sunfish reveals high pay-offs for specialized sneakers. *Molecular*583 *Ecology*, 17, 2310–2320.
- Sefc, K. M., Mattersdorfer, K., Sturmbauer, C. & Koblmüller, S. (2008). High frequency of
  multiple paternity in broods of a socially monogamous cichlid fish with biparental nest
  defence. *Molecular Ecology*, 17, 2531-2543.
- Soucy, S. & Travis, J. (2003). Multiple paternity and population genetic structure in natural
  populations of the poeciliid fish, *Heterandria formosa. Journal of Evolutionary Biology*,
  16, 1328-1336.
- 590 Steinwender, B., Koblmüller, S. & Sefc, K.M. (2012). Concordant female mate preferences in
- the cichlid fish *Tropheus moorii*. *Hydrobiologia*, **682**, 121-130.

- 592 Taborsky, M., Hudde, B. & Wirtz, P. (1987). Reproductive behaviour and ecology of
- 593 *Symphodus (Crenilabrus) ocellatus*, a European wrasse with four types of male behaviour.

594 *Behaviour*, **102**: 82-117.

- Taborsky, M. (1994). Sneakers, satellites and helpers: parasitic and cooperative behaviour in
  fish reproduction. *Andvances in the Study of Behaviour*, 23, 1-100.
- 597 Taborsky, M. (2001). The evolution of bourgeois, parasitic, and cooperative reproductive
  598 behaviors in fishes. *Journal of Heredity*, 92, 100–110.
- 599 Taborsky, M., Oliveira, R. & Brockmann, H. J. (2008). The evolution of alternative
- 600 reproductive tactics: concepts and questions. In R. F. Oliveira, M. Taborsky, & H. J.
- 601 Brockmann (Eds.), Alternative reproductive tactics (pp. 1e22). Cambridge, U.K.:
- 602 Cambridge University Press.
- Thiessen, R. J. & Heath, D. D. (2007). Characterization of one trinucleotide and six
  dinucleotide microsatellite markers in bicolor damselfish, *Stegastes partitus*, a common
  coral reef fish. *Conservation Genetics*, 8, 983-985.
- Tyler, W.A. (1995). The adaptive significance of colonial nesting in a coral-reef fish. *Animal Behaviour*, 49, 949-966.
- 608 Underwood, J. N. (2009). Characterisation of ten polymorphic microsatellite loci in a coral reef
- fish (*Chromis margaritifer*). *Conservation Genetics Resources*, **1**, 491-493.
- 610 Valière, N. (2002). GIMLET: a computer program for analysing genetic individual
  611 identification data. *Molecular Ecology Notes*, 2, 377-379.
- 612 Verginella, L., Spoto, M., Ciriaco, S. & Ferrero, E.A. (1999). Ethogram of the reproductive
- 613 territorial male of the Mediterranean damselfish *Chromis chromis* L. (Pisces:
- 614 Pomacentridae). *Bollettino della Societa' Adriatica di Scienze*, LXXVIII, 437-454.

- 615 Waits, L. P., Luikart, G. & Taberlet, P. (2001). Estimating the probability of identity among
- 616 genotypes in natural populations: cautions and guidelines. *Molecular Ecology*, 10, 249617 256.
- 618 Waples, R. S. & Do, C. (2008). LDNE: a program for estimating effective population size from
- 619 data on linkage disequilibrium. *Molecular Ecology Resources*, **8**, 753-756.

Table I. Variables used to define relationships in alternative reproductive tactics and mating success of *Chromis chromis*. Variables include: number of offspring analysed (N), number of parents (N<sub>P</sub>), number of sneakers (N<sub>SNK</sub>), number of males (N<sub>M</sub>), number of females (N<sub>F</sub>), proportion of offspring sired by the nesting male (NM<sub>off</sub>), area of the egg clutch expressed in cm<sup>2</sup>, number of defence behaviour per hour and average density of individuals at the time of sampling. Subscripts on the Nest category define sampling location; Z from Zingaro and P from Palermo.

Nest	Ν	Np	Nsnk	Nм	NF	NMoff	Clutch Size	Defence	Density
Cz	26	19	7	8	11	0.27	299	31	36.33
$D_P$	36	23	7	8	15	0.47	204	7	28.58
$F_P$	32	12	6	7	5	0.38	208	43	13.33
Gz	31	15	7	8	7	0.35	153	19	69.33
$H_Z$	37	18	6	7	11	0.68	117	0	76.05
$I_P$	42	13	7	8	5	0.67	171	22	9.33
$\mathbf{J}_{\mathbf{Z}}$	29	13	7	8	5	0.41	180	22	36.33
$K_P$	34	21	6	7	14	0.44	242	7	28.58
$L_Z$	8	5	2	3	2	0.75	75	23	175.67

Table II. Summary statistics from microsatellites and mtDNA analyses for each nest: sample size for microsatellite (N, mtDNA in brackets), unbiased expected heterozygosity (H<sub>e</sub>), observed heterozygosity (H<sub>o</sub>), average number of alleles (N<sub>A</sub>), allelic richness (A<sub>R</sub>), deviation from Hardy-Weinberg equilibrium (F<sub>IS</sub>, starred if significant), number of breeders (N<sub>b</sub>, 95% C.I. in brackets), number of haplotypes (*n*), haplotype diversity (h), nucleotide diversity ( $\pi$ ). Subscripts on the Nest category define sampling location: Z from Zingaro and P from Palermo.

Microsatellites								Mitochondrial			
Nest	Ν	He	Ho	NA	AR	FIS	Nb	n	h	π	
Az	44(20)	0.7026	0.7208	8.57	5.40	-0.026	10.4 (7.8 - 13.5)	1	0	0	
$B_Z$	14(14)	0.7993	0.7551	7.57	6.88	0.057	17.6 (9.6 - 44.5)	5	0.659	0.00822	
$C_Z$	27(20)	0.7687	0.6349	7.57	5.94	0.177*	15 (10.3 – 22.9)	3	0.689	0.01047	
$D_P$	40(20)	0.7633	0.7607	11.14	6.77	0.003	19.6 (15.4 – 25.3)	6	0.721	0.01284	
E <sub>P</sub>	29(20)	0.7043	0.7980	4.86	4.15	-0.136*	28.7 (13.8 - 110.6)	1	0	0	
$F_P$	33(20)	0.7278	0.7403	5.86	5.11	-0.017	7.2 (3.9 – 10.7)	3	0.611	0.00961	
Gz	32(16)	0.7744	0.7321	8.14	6.13	0.055	3.7 (3.1 – 5.3)	2	0.5	0.00423	
$H_{\rm Z}$	38(20)	0.7690	0.8421	9.57	6.54	-0.097*	11.1 (8.6 – 14.1)	5	0.768	0.00722	
$I_P$	43(20)	0.7612	0.9003	7.43	5.44	-0.185*	7.6 (5.1 – 10.3)	3	0.563	0.01631	
$J_Z$	29(19)	0.7131	0.7931	7.43	5.35	-0.114*	14.8 (9.8 – 23.6)	1	0	0	
K <sub>P</sub>	37(20)	0.7593	0.7799	13.43	7.66	-0.027	29.7 (22.6 - 40.7)	11	0.874	0.01924	
Lz	10(9)	0.7398	0.8286	5.43	5.43	-0.127*	2.3 (1.6 – 4.8)	2	0.556	0.01095	

- FIG. 1. Sampling localities (red circles) for *Chromis chromis* along the Sicilian coast. In the inset, a focal male is guarding an artificial nest
- 639 FIG. 2. Median-joining network of mtDNA haplotypes of Chromis chromis. The size of each circle corresponds to the relative haplotype
- 640 frequencies and black circles represent hypothetical intermediate haplotypes. Single mutational steps are assumed between haplotypes unless
- 641 specified. Nests D, E, F, I, K are from Zingaro; nests A, B, C, G, H, J, L are from Palermo.
- 642
- 643 FIG. 3. PCA variables factor map. Variables showed are: number of parents (N<sub>P</sub>), number of sneakers (N<sub>SNK</sub>), number of females (N<sub>F</sub>), proportion
- 644 of offspring sired by the nesting male (NM<sub>off</sub>), area of the egg clutch expressed in cm<sup>2</sup>, number of defence behaviour per hour and average density
- 645 of individuals at the time of sampling.







