

 Fish use different modalities to access mates for reproduction, often referred to as Alternative Reproductive Tactics (ARTs). ARTs are an example of coexisting phenotypes, which have to hold some degree of reproductive success to persist in a population. In the Mediterranean damselfish (*Chromis chromis*), territorial males colonise nests on rocky reefs, competing for females, while sneaker males attempt to parasitically spawn in those nests. Here we combine behavioural observations in the field with molecular analyses, using bi-parentally and maternally inherited markers, to investigate reproductive success patterns of the two observed male ARTs in terms of number of eggs sired and number of females contributing to each nest. Cuckoldry was observed in every nest sampled, with at least two and up to seven sneakers per nest; however, the nesting male always significantly fathered the large majority of the eggs (on average 49%) in each clutch. Each sneaker fathered around 7% of the clutch. The average number of females whose eggs were fertilised by nesting males was 6.76 (ranging 2-13), while each sneaker on average fertilised the eggs of 1.74 (range 1-8) females. Using this sibship reconstruction, we investigated some of the factors involved in the regulation of the dynamic equilibrium of reproductive success between the two ARTs showed by *C. chromis* males. Our results show that the sneakers' reproductive success was positively linked to egg clutch size; the density of individuals in the nesting area negatively affected the size of egg clutches; the rate of defence behaviours performed by nesting males negatively influenced the number of females contributing to each nest.

- 
- Key words: *Chromis chromis*; microsatellites; mtDNA; parentage assignment; sneakers.
- 
- 
- 
- 

#### **INTRODUCTION**

 Different modalities to access mates for reproduction, also called Alternative Reproductive Tactics (ARTs, Oliveira *et al.*, 2008), are an example of coexisting phenotypes (Taborsky, 1994; Heinze & Keller, 2000), where conspecifics of the same sex in one population invest different amounts of energy and exhibit remarkably different strategies to ensure reproduction (Taborsky *et al.*, 2008). Fish offer a great opportunity to investigate ARTs since they show a huge diversity of reproductive modes (e.g., DeWoody & Avise, 2001, Avise *et al.*, 2002). In particular, males, depending on their mating system, can maximise their fitness through scramble competition, resource defence (e.g., territory, nest, and/or females), reproductive parasitism or even cooperation (Taborsky, 2001). Of these four strategies, resource defence and reproductive parasitism are often coupled as ARTs: territorial males (also called nesting males) conquer and defend a suitable territory and actively attract females, while other males behave as "sneakers", by parasitically spawning in the nest of a territorial male, without providing any territorial defence or paternal care (Taborsky, 1994; Coleman & Jones, 2011).

 While comprehensive knowledge of these mating strategies is available from a behavioural point of view, less is known about the actual relative reproductive success occurring as a consequence of coexisting ARTs (Garant *et al.*, 2001; Reichard *et al.*, 2004; Cogliati *et al.*, 2013). Knowledge of the relative fitness among different tactics can help to clarify if coexisting ARTs represent a plastic/conditional strategy (dependent mainly from environmental conditions, resulting in unequal male fitness) or a genetic polymorphism (maintained by negative frequency dependent selection, resulting in overall similar male fitness) or, as recently proposed, a mixture of these two modalities, called a conditional alternative strategy (Neff & Svensson, 2013; Cogliati *et al.*, 2014). Fitness equilibrium between ARTs can be maintained by a complex interaction of multiple variables, including individual  traits, population features and environmental characteristics. According to literature, most of the species with male nest-defence tactics exhibit a certain level of cuckoldry (i.e., part of their egg clutch is fertilised by other males; Coleman & Jones, 2011). Yet, the relative number of eggs fertilised by males other than the nesting one is rather limited (Mackiewicz *et al.*, 2005; 80 Rios-Cardenas & Webster, 2008; Alonzo & Heckman, 2010). Furthermore, the rate of multiple 81 maternity for these species is very high, indicating that polygyny is fairly common in these species, but the average number of dams contributing to a single nest is low (three females on 83 average; Coleman & Jones, 2011).

84 Members of the family Pomacentridae are known to exhibit ARTs (Gronell, 1989; Karino & Nakazono, 1993; Tyler, 1995; Barnett & Pankhurst, 1996). The Mediterranean damselfish, *Chromis chromis* (Linnaeus, 1758), is characterised by male nest-defence. This is a small (average standard length 6 cm; Bracciali et al., 2014), sexually monomorphic species commonly distributed in the Mediterranean Sea, extending to the Eastern part of the Atlantic Ocean. It lives in shoals near rocky reefs or above seagrass meadows at depths between 3 and 30 m (Lythgoe & Lythgoe, 1971; Quignard & Pras, 1986). Throughout the reproductive season (June-September), colonies go through several reproductive bouts. Some males (nesting males) colonise nests and guard them until eggs hatch. They attract females to receive egg deposition by vocalising and performing specific courtship-displays (Picciulin *et al.*, 2002, 2010). Parasitic spawning by sneaker males is commonly observed in the Mediterranean damselfish; sneakers do not establish nests, infiltrating a guarded nest, while the nesting male receives egg deposition by a female. On average, nesting males can receive three intrusions over a 10 min observation period (Picciulin *et al.*, 2004). However, the success rate of these "attacks" remains unclear and molecular investigation is needed to unveil the real reproductive success of sneakers. Additionally, parasitic spawning is known to be occasionally performed even by  nesting males (Picciulin *et al.*, 2004). *Chromis chromis* thus offers a model to study the relative reproductive success attained by nesting males and sneakers.

 In this study, a combination of bi-parentally and maternally inherited markers was used to investigate reproductive patterns in *C. chromis*. In particular, the number of breeders contributing to each nest was examined, with a special focus on the relative reproductive success of nest-guarding males and sneakers in terms of percentage of egg clutch sired, and the number of females contributing to each clutch. Additional factors, such as egg clutch size (often linked to male success), density of the colony (which influences encounter rates between sexes and male-male competition) and male aggressive behaviours (towards intruders) can also affect reproductive outcomes. Thus, using sibship reconstruction, the following factors were also investigated: a) the relationship between egg clutch size and the relative success of nesting males and sneakers; b) the link between the density of individuals in the breeding colony and egg clutch size; and c) the relationship between the frequency of nest-defence behaviours performed by males and the number of females spawning in their nest.

### **MATERIALS AND METHODS**

#### STUDY AREA AND SAMPLE COLLECTION

 Two damselfish colonies were selected 5-10 m from the coasts of Palermo and Zingaro, Sicily, Italy (Fig. 1) in May 2011. Twenty-five spherical flowerpots (18 cm diameter; Knapp & Kovach, 1991) were placed at 7-12 m depth to provide males with artificial nests (minimising differences in nests' quality and size; Fig. 1). Overall, twelve artificial nests (five from Palermo and seven from Zingaro) were successfully colonised by *C. chromis*. Colonized nests were monitored with video cameras during June and August 2011. At the end of the behavioural observations, artificial nests (which contained all the eggs attached to the pot surface on a single layer) were collected. Given their fast swimming behaviour, it was not possible to catch the nesting males. Once on the boat, the relative quantity of eggs present in  each nest was estimated (given their small size, it was not possible to count all the eggs). All egg clutches exhibited a diamond shape; minor and major axes were measured to calculate the 127 surface area of each egg clutch  $(cm<sup>2</sup>)$ . All eggs were detached from the flowerpot using a scalpel and immediately stored in 100% ethanol and subsequently at -20°C.

## DNA ISOLATION, PCR AMPLIFICATION, GENOTYPING AND SEQUENCING

 Single eggs were separated under a stereomicroscope. DNA was isolated from a random 132 subsample of 48 eggs from each nest (total  $N = 576$ ) using a modified salt extraction protocol (Miller *et al*., 1988) and 376 eggs (30-48 per nest) were successfully amplified at seven microsatellite loci. Primers from four species of the Pomacentridae family were employed: 2AL2 (*Abudefduf luridus*; Carvalho *et al*., 2000), Cm\_D006 (*Chromis margaritifer*; Underwood, 2009), Da360, Da542, Da589, Da590 (*Dascyllus aruanus*; Fauvelot *et al*., 2009) and SpTG53 (*Stegastes partitus*; Thiessen & Heath, 2007). Loci were amplified in two multiplex polymerase chain reactions (PCR). Each reaction was carried out in a total volume of 12 µl, using 6 µl of QIAGEN® Multiplex PCR kit, 4.4 µl of DNA template and 1.6 µl of 140 primer mix. Fluorescently-labelled primers (FAM, VIC, NED and PET) were added with the 141 following concentrations: Cm\_D006 0.17 µM, 2AL2 0.17 µM, SpTG53 0.33 µM (multiplex 1); Da542 0.17 µM, Da589 0.17 µM, Da590 0.17 µM, Da360 0.08 µM (multiplex 2). Amplification conditions were as follows: 95˚C for 15 min; 37 cycles of 94˚C for 45 s, 52˚C 144 for 1 min,  $72^{\circ}$ C for 45 s and a final extension at  $72^{\circ}$ C for 45 min (multiplex 1); 95<sup> $\circ$ </sup>C for 15 min; 37 cycles of 94˚C for 45 s, 58˚C for 1 min, 72˚C for 45 s and a final extension at 72˚C for 45min (multiplex 2). PCR reactions were performed using a Biometra T3000 thermocycler. Allele sizes were determined on an ABI-3130xl Genetic Analyser (Applied Biosystems©) with an internal size standard (600 LIZ, Applied Biosystems©). Genotypic data were acquired using  GeneMapper 4.0 (Applied Biosystems©). Following standard practice, we re-amplified and re-scored genotypes for 10% (30 eggs) to check for consistency of genotype calling.

 Furthermore, amplification of 355 bp of the mitochondrial control region (CR) was 152 carried out on a subsample of eggs from each nest (total  $N = 222$ ) using the primers CR-A and CR-E (Lee *et al*., 1995, Domingues *et al*., 2005) in a 25 µl reaction volume, according to the following protocol: NH<sup>4</sup> Buffer X1, dNTPs 800 µM (200 µM each), CR-A 0.3 µM, CR-E 0.3 µM, MgCl<sup>2</sup> 2.5 mM, Taq 2.5 U (BIOLINE), 1 µl template. Amplification conditions were as follows: 94˚C for 5 min; 35 cycles of 94˚C for 45 s, 52˚C for 45 s, and 72˚C for 1 min. Products were sequenced commercially (Beckman-Coulter Genomics). D-loop sequences were submitted to GenBank under the accession numbers KX442797-443014.

## POPULATION GENETIC ANALYSES

161 Expected unbiased  $(H_e)$  and observed  $(H_o)$  heterozygosities and average number of alleles (NA) per nest were calculated using the Microsatellite Toolkit add-in available for Microsoft Excel (Park, 2001). Allelic richness (AR), departure from Hardy-Weinberg 164 equilibrium (by calculating  $F_{IS}$  and testing significance through 1320 permutations) and linkage disequilibrium were estimated using FSTAT 2.9.3.2 (Goudet, 1995).

166 The effective number of breeders  $(N_b)$  for each nest was initially investigated by 167 computing the effective population size  $(N_e)$  for each nest, using the gametic disequilibrium method implemented in the software LDNe 1.31 (Waples & Do, 2008). Additionally, 169 probability of individual identity,  $P_{(ID)}$ , was calculated for all seven loci with GIMLET 170 (Valière, 2002);  $P_{(ID)}$  is defined as the chance that two individuals drawn at random from the same population will share the same genotypic profile at multiple loci (Waits *et al*., 2001). 172 GIMLET allows to calculate both  $P_{(ID)sib}$  (the  $P_{(ID)}$  of a population where siblings are found 173 and included, Evett & Weir, 1998) and  $P_{(ID)$ unbiased (the  $P_{(ID)}$  after sample size corrections; 174 Paetkau *et al.*, 1998); the observed  $P_{(ID)}$  lays between  $P_{(ID)sub}$  and  $P_{(ID)unbiased}$  and is estimated by computing the proportion of all possible pairs of individuals that have identical genotypes.

 All CR sequences were manipulated on ProSeq 3.0 (Filatov, 2002), and subsequently aligned with ClustalX 2.1 (Larkin *et al*., 2007) using the default parameters, whilst resulted alignments were verified by eye. Summary statistics of haplotypes (*K*), number of polymorphic sites (*n*), haplotype diversity (*h*), nucleotide diversity (*π*) and standard deviations (SD) (Nei, 1987), for the pooled dataset and per nest, were calculated with Arlequin 3.11 (Excoffier *et al*., 2005). Finally, a median joining network was examined on NETWORK 4.6.1.0 (Bandelt *et al*., 1999; [http://www.fluxus-engineering.com\)](http://www.fluxus-engineering.com/).

# RELATEDNESS ANALYSIS AND PARENTAGE ASSIGNMENT

 Since genetic data from parents were not available, sibship and parentage of offspring were assigned in Colony 2.0 (Jones & Wang, 2009) using the built-in maximum-likelihood method for microsatellite data. Half- and full-sib pairs with a probability equal to 1.0 (100%) were selected and manually grouped under two inferred parents of unknown sex. Mitochondrial haplotype information was then used to determine the sex of each parent: offspring assigned to one parent could share the same haplotype (thus the parent was classified as female) or exhibit more than one haplotype (parent classified as male; Sefc *et al*., 2008).

 For those parent-offspring groups with no clear pattern (CR haplotypes were determined only for 59% of the eggs used to infer sibship), a manual cross-check across the whole data-set was performed: every offspring was shared by two parents, if one of them was clearly classified as either sex, the other had to belong to the opposite sex. The male with the highest number of offspring assigned within a nest was assumed to be the nesting male (Coleman & Jones, 2011). The number of offspring fertilised by each male in a nest was recorded and the relative proportion of eggs fathered was estimated. The average of the number  of females whose eggs were fertilised by each male was calculated, weighted by the number of offspring per nest.

# BEHAVIOURAL OBSERVATIONS

 Clear parentage information was successfully obtained for nine out of the 12 nests (N 204 = 6 for Palermo,  $N = 3$  for Zingaro). For these nests, behavioural data had been obtained from video cameras installed by a scuba diver in front of each nest, at a distance of 80-120 cm. The central 75 min of each 90 min video were scored to determine the number of defence-related behaviours performed (thrusts: focal male moves toward the opponent with a rapid movement and turns immediately back upon reaching the adversary; chases: focal male does not turn back after the thrust but instead chases the adversary for several metres; Verginella *et al.,* 1999). The nine focal males' behaviour was followed for a total of approximately 11 h of observation using JWatcher 1.0 (Blumstein & Daniel, 2007).The number of defence-related behaviours per hour were quantified considering only the time spent by focal males in sight of the camera view (i.e. 213 [defence behaviours  $*$  (total time min) - time spent out of sight min)<sup>-1</sup>  $*$  60 min). Damselfish density (i.e., number of individuals per colony) varied across locations. At the end of randomly chosen sampling sessions, video files were recorded to estimate density expressed as number of individuals per breeding colony.

# DATA EXPLORATION AND STATISTICAL ANALYSES

 The clutch size in each nest can be assumed to be a proxy of the success of the nesting male (Carriço *et al*., 2014), but this can be hampered by high presence of sneakers (Reichard *et al*., 2004) and/or by high density of individuals in the colony (Mück *et al*., 2013). Thus, nesting males should increase the number of defence behaviours against sneakers to maximize

 their fertilization rate. This defence behaviour could become even more predominant as number of females visiting the nest increases (eggs can be deposited in a nest by a single or multiple females). Starting with these assumptions and using the available variables estimated for each nest (number of parents, number of sneakers, number of females, egg clutch size, proportion of eggs fathered by the nesting male and defence behaviours; Table I), a principal component analysis (PCA) was run. Although the dataset did not strictly meet all PCA assumptions (Budaev, 2010), the variables factor map generated was used to visualise and gather a better understanding of the complex relationships among the variables of this system. Such relationships were also tested by fitting generalised linear models (GLM) and linear models, to confirm their significance.

 The analyses performed were: a) the relationship between the relative reproductive success of nesting males and size of the egg clutch (GLM with a binomial distribution and a logit link function: a column-bind matrix was created with the cbind function linking the number of eggs fertilized by the nesting male with those fertilized by sneakers to consider the relative frequency of nesting male success using the actual number of eggs and not proportions) 238 ; b) the relationship between the density of individuals and the size of the clutch (GLM with a 239 negative-binomial distribution and log link function, due to overdispersion of data; O'Hara & Kotze, 2010); c) the relationship between the density of individuals and the reproductive success of the sneakers (number of eggs not fathered by the nesting male) using a linear model. Given that the main source of variability in the number of parents per nest was the number of females (see results below and Table I), a Pearson correlation was run between the number of females and the total number of parents per nest. A GLM (Poisson distribution and log link function) was fitted using the number of females per nest as the response variable and the number of defence-related behaviour per hour as the explanatory variable.

 All GLM were tested with and without the study area as a covariate to take into account 248 general differences between the two areas; the two models for each test were compared and the best one was chosen according the Akaike information criterion (AIC; Burnham, 2011). Data exploration and statistical analyses were preformed using R statistical software (R 2.13; R Development Core Team, 2011).

### **RESULTS**

 Overall, 376 offspring were successfully amplified at all seven microsatellite loci (data is available upon request). Microsatellite markers showed no evidence of linkage-256 disequilibrium. H<sub>o</sub>, on average, was not significantly different from H<sub>e</sub>  $(0.77 \text{ and } 0.75 \text{ m})$  respectively). Average number of alleles per nest was 8.08, with nest E showing the lowest and nest K showing the highest number of alleles and allelic richness respectively (Table II). The 259 average number of breeders per nest, estimated by  $N_b$ , was 13.97, ranging from 2.3 (nest L) to 260 29.7 (nest K). Overall  $P_{(\text{ID})\text{sibs}}$  and  $P_{(\text{ID})\text{unbiased}}$  were respectively 4.130 x 10<sup>-4</sup> and 2.588 x 10<sup>-13</sup> indicating that two individuals had less than 0.04% probability of sharing the same multilocus genotypic profile (Table II).

 In total, 218 mtDNA sequences were generated (Accession numbers: KX442797- 443014), including 49 variable sites and 38 haplotypes. The CR haplotype diversity ranged from high values (0.931) to null (0.000), whilst values of nucleotide diversity ranged from 0.018 to 0.000 (Table II). The individual haplotype network reflected the high haplotype diversity across areas (Fig. 2).

 Of the original 376 eggs, 360 (173 from Palermo and 187 from Zingaro) showed a probability of 100% to be either full- or half-sib with at least another offspring and thus, they 270 were used to infer sibship within each damselfish colony. Moreover,  $P_{(D)}$ sibs and

271 *P*( $\text{ID}$ )unbiased indicated a negligible probability that two individuals could share the same multilocus genotypic profile.

 Overall, 201 offspring sequenced for mitochondrial CR (95 from Palermo and 106 from Zingaro) were used to assign sex to the parents previously inferred by COLONY. It was possible to extract clear information for nine of the twelve original nests. It was not possible to define a clear pattern for the remaining three, because either the information provided by mtDNA was not sufficient to discriminate between males and females (all offspring shared the same haplotype, nests A and E), or provided unrealistic scenarios (both parents for each given offspring showed more than one haplotype, e.g. nest B, in contrast with the assumption that females transmit the same mitotype to all of their offspring). However, even in these instances, we were able to gauge an idea of the number of parents contributing to each nest.

 Cuckoldry was observed in every nest sampled. One male fathered most of the eggs in each nest, on average 49% (range 27-75%) of the egg clutch; we assumed that male to be the nesting one (Table I). The weighted average number of sneakers per nest was 6.48 (range 2-7); on average, each sneaker fathered 7% of the egg clutch (Supplementary Table SI). The weighted average number of females whose eggs were fertilised by nesting males was 6.76 (range 2-13), while each sneaker on average fertilised the eggs of 1.74 (range 1-8) females (Supplementary Table SI). Female polygamy was also observed: 2 females (out of the 72 that 289 contributed to our sample) were found to have laid their eggs in two different nests, D and K, during the same reproductive bout.

 The first two principal components of the PCA explained more than 85% of the variance of the dataset (PC1: 58.18%; PC2: 27.32%). From the PCA variables factor plot, nesting male reproductive success appears to be negatively correlated with the size of the egg 294 clutch  $(z = -3.309, p = 0.0009)$ , which instead is linked to sneakers reproductive success (Fig. 295 3), as supported by the GLM analysis ( $z = 3.56$ ,  $p = 0.0004$ ). Moreover, the density of

296 individuals in the colony and the clutch sizes show a negative relationship ( $z = -4.445$ ,  $p <$ 297 0.0001), whereas the density did not affect the sneakers' reproductive success (t = -1.696, p = 0.134). All analyses were repeated excluding nest L, characterized by the smallest egg clutch, the higher density and the lowest number of sneakers. Without this nest, the relationships 300 explained by the factor map  $(PC1+ PC2 = 71%)$  were maintained but density and number of sneakers were no longer significant, while the results of all the other tests were the same.

 In the factor map, the total number of parents per nest was associated with the number of females and both showed some level of inverse relationship with the number of defence behaviours performed by nesting males. Pearson correlation between the number of parents 305 and the number of females per nest was strongly significant ( $r = 0.96$ ;  $p < 0.0001$ ) confirming that the variability in number of parents among nests was due to the variation in number of females. The rate of defence behaviours showed to have a significant, negative effect on the 308 number of females contributing to each nest ( $z = -2.685$ ,  $p = 0.007$ ). No correlation was found 309 between the number of females and clutch size  $(r = 0.54; p = 0.13)$ .

 The AIC test suggested that adding the study area as a covariate improved only the model testing for the effect of the size of the egg clutch on sneakers reproductive success, hence we removed it from the other two models. In any case, there was no significant effect of the study area in all the models.

#### **DISCUSSION**

 In both *C. chromis* colonies from Palermo and Zingaro, cuckoldry was found to be pervasive in every single nest analysed. This is one of few studies (Munehara & Takenaka, 2000; Alonzo & Heckman, 2010) that report such trends in natural marine fish populations: despite the very high variability in multiple paternities across species characterised by male  nest defence, Coleman & Jones (2011) reported an average of 35% of nests per population being fertilized by multiple males, while in the current study 100% of the nests were cuckolded. The nesting male was assumed to be the individual that fertilised the majority of eggs 323 within a nest in agreement with previous studies (Coleman & Jones, 2011). In species for which parentage studies are available, the proportion of eggs sired by males other than the nesting one was almost always below 30% (e.g., 12.4% for molly miller, *Scartella cristata*, Mackiewicz *et al*., 2005; 15% for pumpkinseed sunfish, *Lepomis gibbosus*, Rios-Cardenas & Webster, 2008; 28% in the ocellated wrasse, *Symphodus ocellatus*, Alonzo & Heckman, 2010). However, *C. chromis* sneakers stand out from the "typical" reproductive success patterns observed in species characterised by male nest defence. On average, 51% of the eggs were sired by sneakers, with a record value of 73% observed in nest C (where eggs were fertilized by seven different sneakers).Similar values (an average of 48% of eggs sired by sneakers) have been found recently in the plainfin midshipman fish, *Porichthys notatus* (Cogliati et al., 2013). In this species though, nest takeovers have been described, which lower the paternity estimates for the original nest owner (when takeovers are taken into account, the actual sneaker contribution to nest decrease to 37%). The high sneaker success in the two population of *C. chromis* under study is not surprising, given the high number of sneakers parasitizing each nest in the two colonies: with the exception of nest L, the number of sires contributing to each nest ranged from six to seven (Table I).

 Multiple maternity is commonly observed in species characterised by male-nest defence (Coleman & Jones, 2001 and references therein), and in this study the level of polygyny was particularly high: up to 15 dams per nest were found, double the highest number reported to date for the molly miller (Mackiewicz *et al*., 2005). Nesting males are expected to be polygamous; once the "reproductive resource" (i.e., the nest) is secured, their fitness is mostly limited by the number of females they manage to mate with. Females, on the other hand,  are normally limited by the amount of eggs they can produce and are expected to exert strong sexual selection by carefully choosing where to lay their eggs. Nests already containing eggs may be favoured (Pruett-Jones, 1992; Brennan *et al*., 2008) as males are less likely to desert 348 full nests (Jennions & Polakow, 2001). In this study, two females were found to lay their eggs in two different nests during the same reproductive bout. A similar scenario has been rarely reported (Taborsky *et al*., 1987; Jones *et al.*, 1998). This strategy might be employed by females to minimize the risk of predation on their offspring or to select males with different qualities (Alonzo & Warner, 2000).

 The size of the egg clutch was positively correlated with the reproductive success of sneakers. This means that, contrary to expectations (Carriço *et al*., 2014), the relative reproductive success of the nesting male decreases when many eggs are present in his nest. Indeed, a large clutch of eggs is very likely to be the result of multiple egg deposition events by one or more females. Considering that the window of opportunity for a sneaker to achieve parasitic fertilisation is during female spawning (as eggs are fertilised straight away; Picciulin *et al*., 2004), more egg deposition events will result in higher chances to sneak. Thus, a larger clutch size possibly results in higher reproductive success for both types of males but lower relative reproductive success for the cuckolded nesting males.

 Colonial nesting with the associated high density of individuals per breeding colony may favour parasitic spawning (Reichard *et al*., 2004) and high levels of cuckoldry. Relatively low reproductive success by nesting males have already been observed in the freshwater fish *Variabilichromis morii* (Sefc *et al*., 2008). Literature suggests that density of individuals plays 366 a major role in parentage patterns due to high encounter rates among conspecifics (Kokko  $\&$  Rankin 2006) making it easier for nesting males to attract females. Conversely, high numbers of individuals are often associated with high numbers of sneakers, augmenting the chances to be cuckolded (Soucy & Travis, 2003). In *C. chromis* though, clutch size seems to be negatively  correlated with the density of individuals in the colonies. Nesting males switch from courtship 371 to parental care when the trade-off between trying to receive more egg deposition and avoiding to be cuckolded turns in favour of the latter (Kanoh, 2000). The threshold of this trade-off is not fixed, and it is likely to shift in response to demographic and environmental variability. Under high densities, it is possible that males perceive a higher risk of cuckoldry and shift more quickly to parental care. A similar situation has been reported in *S. ocellatus*, where nesting males surrounded by many sneakers can give up temporarily courtship activities by preventing any female to spawn in their nest to avoid competition (Alonzo & Warner, 1999). To do so effectively, males need to be able to recognise sneakers and distinguish them from females. In most species a certain dimorphism between the sexes exists (e.g., in colouration and/or size) and nesting males might be distinguishable from sneakers (Gross & Charnov, 1980; Taborsky *et al*., 1987). *Chromis chromis* appears to be morphologically monomorphic, making individual behaviour (including acoustic behaviour) the most reliable information in distinguishing males from females. Sneakers do not show significant differences in terms of size when compared to nesting males (Picciulin *et al*., 2004). They have however, been reported to exhibit submissive behaviours, typical of females, when attempting to intrude in the nests of guarding males (Verginella *et al*., 1999). This behavioural adaptation, combined with the lack of evident dimorphism between males exhibiting different ARTs, may explain the high levels of cuckoldry (especially when densities are not high) and the relatively low reproductive success of the nesting males observed. Higher density of individuals might inform nesting males about the risk of cuckoldry.

 Females must carefully pick their mates to maximise their fitness (Steinwender *et al*., 2012). Defence related behaviours were found to negatively affect the number of females laying eggs in the nests. Extremely dominant individuals may not always be the best choice (Qvarnström & Forsgren, 1998): an excessive amount of energy or time spent in aggressive  interactions might cause the nesting male to neglect other important activities related to parental care, such as egg fanning (Verginella *et al*., 1999). Moreover, visually conspicuous behaviours, including defence related ones, might increase the chance to be spotted by predators (Daly, 1978; Crowley *et al*., 1991; Dill *et al*., 1999). For a potential dam an extremely aggressive male might not be the best carer for her eggs and likely more exposed to predators. Alternatively, the negative relationship found between the rate of defence behaviours and the number of dams, could be determined by nesting males decision: when the perceived risk of cuckoldry is high (i.e., high density of individuals), nesting males switch early to parental care. 403 This is achieved by actively chasing away any further female approaching the nest (Alonzo  $\&$ Warner, 1999).

 Overall, this study provides new information on the mating system and, more specifically, the reproductive patterns of the nest-guarding *C. chromis*. Our findings shed new light on the role and consequences of ARTs in this nesting species: 1) cuckoldry and promiscuity were found to be widespread; 2) the number of males and females contributing to 409 the offspring of each nest are the highest reported in literature (Coleman & Jones, 2011); 3) the reproductive success of nesting males is among the lowest reported for territorial fish (average 49%, lower than 52% recorded by Cogliati et al., 2013 in the plainfin midshipman fish, where nest takeovers occur; see also reviews by Avise et al., 2002; Coleman & Jones, 2011). The complex interactions between factors determining the relative success of ARTs require a multidisciplinary approach ranging from molecular analyses to behavioural observations and 415 from focal individuals to populations. Knowledge about these interactions becomes extremely important when predicting fitness patterns in a changing environment that is increasingly affected by human impacts.



- Avise, J. C., Jones, A. G., Walker, D., DeWoody, J. A., Dakin, B., Fiumera, A., Fletcher, D.,
- Mackiewicz, M., Pearse, D., Porter, B. & Wilkins, S. D. (2002). Genetic mating systems
- and reproductive natural histories of fishes: lesson for ecology and evolution. *Annual Review of Genetics*, **36**, 19-45.
- Bandelt, H. J., Forster, P. & Röhl, A. (1999). Median joining networks for inferring intraspecific phylogenies. *Molecular Biology and Evolution*, **16**, 37-48.
- Barnett, C. W. & Pankhurst, N. W. (1996). Effect of density on the reproductive behaviour of the territorial male demoiselle *Chromis dispilus* (Pisces: Pomacentridae). *Environmental Biology of Fishes*, **46**, 343-349.
- Blumstein, D. T. & Daniel, J. C. (2007). Quantifying Behavior the JWatcher Way. [Sinauer](http://www.sinauer.com/)  [Associates,](http://www.sinauer.com/) Massachusetts, USA.
- Bracciali, C., Piovano, S., Sara, G. & Giacoma C. (2014). Seasonal changes in size, sex-ratio and body condition of the damselfish *Chromis chromis* in the central Mediterranean Sea.
- *Journal of the Marine Biological Association of the United Kingdom*, **94**, 1053–1061.
- Brennan, B. J., Flaxman, S. M. & Alonzo, S. H. (2008). Female alternative reproductive
- behaviors: the effect of female group size on mate assessment and copying. *Journal of Theoretical Biology*, **253**, 561-569.
- Budaev, S. V. (2010). Using principal components and factor analysis in animal behaviour research: caveats and guidelines. *Ethology*, **116**, 472-480.
- Burnham, K. P., Anderson, D. R. & Huyvaert, K. P. (2011). AIC model selection and multimodel inference in behavioral ecology: some background, observations, and comparisons. *Behavioral Ecology and Sociobiology*, **65**, 23-35.
- Carriço, R., Amorim, M. C. P. & Fonseca, P. J. (2014). Reproductive success in the Lusitanian toadfish Halobatrachus didactylus: Influence of male and nest sizes. *Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology*, **456**, 65–69.
- Carvalho, M. C., Streiff, R., Guillemaud, T., Afonso, P., Santos, R. S. & Cancela, M. L. (2000).
- Isolation and characterization of polymorphic microsatellite markers in *Abudefduf luridus* (Pisces: Pomacentridae). *Molecular Ecology*, **9**, 993-1011.
- Cogliati, K. M., Neff, B. D. & Balshine, S. (2013). High degree of paternity loss in a species with alternative reproductive tactics. *Behavioral Ecology and Sociobiology*, **67**, 399-408.
- Cogliati, K.M., Balshine, S. & Neff, B.D. (2014). Competition and cuckoldry: estimating
- fitness of alternative reproductive tactics in plainfin midshipman. *Behaviour*, **151**, 1209- 1227.
- Coleman, S. W. & Jones, A. G. (2011). Patterns of multiple paternity and maternity in fishes. *Biological Journal of the Linnean Society*, **103**, 735-760.
- Crowley, P. H., Travers, S. E., Linton, M. C., Cohn, S. L., Sih, A. & Sargent, R. C. (1991).
- Mate density, predation risk, and the seasonal sequence of mate choices: a dynamic game. *The American Naturalist*, **137**, 567-596.
- Daly, M. (1978). The cost of mating. *The American Naturalist*, **112**, 771-774.
- DeWoody, J. A. & Avise, J. C. (2001). Genetic perspective on the natural history of fish mating systems. *The American Genetic Association*, **92**, 167-172.
- Dill, L. M., Hedrick, A. V. & Fraser, A. (1999). Male mating strategies under predation risk: do females call the shots? *Behavioral Ecology*, **10**, 452-461.
- Domingues, V. S., Bucciarelli, G., Almada, V. & Bernardi, G. (2005). Historical colonization
- and demography of the Mediterranean damselfish, *Chromis chromis*. *Molecular Ecology*, **14**, 4051-4063.
- Evett, I. & Weir, B. (1998). *Interpreting DNA Evidence: Statistical Genetics for Forensic*
- *Scientists* Sinauer, Sunderland.
- Excoffier, L., Laval, G. & Schneider, S. (2005). Arlequin (version 3.0): an integrated software package for population genetics data analysis. *Evolutionary Bioinformatics Online*, **1**, 47- 50.
- Excoffier, L., Smouse, P. E. & Quattro, J. M. (1992). Analysis of Molecular Variance Inferred
- From Metric Distances Among DNA Haplotypes: Application to Human Mitochondrial DNA Restriction Data. *Genetics*, **131**, 476-491.
- Fauvelot, C., Smith-Keune, C., Jerry, R., Buston, P. M. & Planes, S. (2009). Isolation and characterization of 16 microsatellite loci in the humbug damselfish, *Dascyllus aruanus*
- (family Pomacentridae). *Molecular Ecology Resources*, **9**, 651-653.
- Filatov, D. A. (2002). Proseq: a software for preparation and evolutionary analysis of DNA sequence data sets. *Molecular Ecology Notes*, **2**, 621-624.
- Garant, D., Dodson, J. J. & Bernatchez. L. (2001). A genetic evaluation of mating system and determinants of individual reproductive success in Atlantic salmon (*Salmo salar* L.). *Journal of Heredity*, **92**, 137– 145.
- Goudet, J. (1995). FSTAT (Version 1.2): a computer program to calculate F-statistics. *Journal of Heredity*, **86**, 485-486.
- Gronell, A. M. (1989). Visiting behaviour by females of the sexually dichromatic damselfish,
- *Chrysiptera cyanea* (Teleostei: Pomacentridae): a probable method of assessing male quality. *Ethology*, **81**, 89-122.
- *Gross, M. R. & Charnov, E. L. (*1980)*. Alternative male life histories in bluegill sunfish. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences USA* 77*,* 6937*-6940.*
- Heinze, J. and Keller, L. (2000). Alternative reproductive strategies: a queen perspective in ants. *Trends in Ecology and Evolution*, **15**, 508-512.
- Jennions, M. D. & Polakow, D. A. (2001). The effect of partial brood loss on male desertion
- in a cichlid fish: an experimental test. *Behavioral Ecology*, **12**, 84-92.
- Jones, A. G., Östlund-Nilsson, S. & Avise, J. C. (1998). A microsatellite assessment of sneaked fertilizations and egg thievery in the fifteenspine stickleback. *Evolution*, **52**, 848-858.
- Jones, O. & Wang, J. (2009). COLONY: a program for parentage and sibship inference from multilocus genotype data. *Molecular Ecology Resources*, **10**, 551-555.
- Kanoh, Y. (2000). Reproductive success associated with territoriality, sneaking, and grouping in male rose bitterlings, *Rhodeus ocellatus* (Pisces: Cyprinidae). *Environmental Biology of Fishes*, **57**, 143-154.
- Knapp, R. A. & Kovach, J. T. (1991). Courtship as an honest indicator of male parental quality in the bicolor damselfish, *Stegastes partitus*. *Behavioral Ecology*, 2, 295–300.
- Karino, K. & Nakazono, A. (1993). Reproductive behavior of the territorial herbivore *Stegastes*
- *nigricans* (Pisces: Pomacentridae) in relation to colony formation. *Journal of* Ethology, **11**, 99-110.
- Kokko, H. & Rankin, D. J. (2006). Lonely hearts or sex in the city? Density-dependent effects in mating systems. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B*, **361**, 319-334.
- Larkin, M. A., Blackshields, G., Brown, N. P., Chenna, R., McGettigan, P. A., McWilliam, H.,
- Valentin, F., Wallace, I. M., Wilm, A., Lopez, R., Thompson, J. D., Gibson, T. J. &
- Higgins, D. G. (2007). Clustal W and Clustal X version 2.0. *Bioinformatics*, **23**, 2947- 2948.
- Lee, W. J., Conroy, J., Howell, W. H. & Kocher, T. D. (1995). Structure and evolution of teleost mitochondrial control regions. *Journal of Molecular Evolution*, **41**, 54-66.
- Lythgoe, J. & Lythgoe, G. (1971). Fishes of the sea: the coastal waters of the British Isles, northern Europe and the Mediterranean. London, Blanford: 1-320.
- Mackiewicz, M., Porter, B. A., Dakin, E. E. & Avise, J. C. (2005). Cuckoldry rates in the Molly
- Miller (*Scartella cristata*, Blenniidae), a hole-nesting marine fish with alternative
- reproductive tactics. *Marine Biology*, **148**, 213-221.
- Miller, S. A., Dykes, D. D. & Polesky, H. F. (1988). A simple salting out procedure for extracting DNA from human nucleated cells. *Nucleic Acids Research*, **16**, 1215.
- Mück, I., Wacker, S., Myhre, L. C. & Amundsen, T. (2013). Nest distribution affects behaviour
- and mating success in a marine fish. *Behavioral Ecology and Sociobiology*, 67, 609–619.
- Munehara, H. & Takenaka, O. (2000). Microsatellite markers and multiple paternity in a parental care fish, *Hexagrammos otakii*. *Journal of Ethology*, **18**, 101-104.
- Nei, M. (1987). Molecular evolutionary genetics. Columbia University Press, New York.
- Neff, B. D. & Svensson, E. I. (2013). Polyandry and alternative mating tactics. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B* **368**: 20120045.
- O'Hara, R. B. & Kotze, D. J. (2010). Do not log-tranform count data. *Methods in Ecology and Evolution*, **1**, 118-122.
- Oliveira R. F., Taborsky M. & Brockmann H. J. (2008). Alternative reproductive tactics: an integrative approach. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Paetkau, D., Waits, L. P., Clarkson, P. L., Craighead, L., Vyse, E., Ward, R. & Strobeck, C.
- (1998). Variation in genetic diversity across the range of North American brown bears.
- *Conservation Biology*, **12**, 418-429.
- Park, S. D. E. (2001). Trypanotolerance in West African Cattle and the Population Genetic Effects of Selection. *Ph.D. thesis*, University of Dublin.
- Picciulin, M., Costantini, M., Hawkins, A. D. & Ferrero, E. A. (2002). Sound emissions of the
- Mediterranean damselfish *Chromis chromis* (Pomacentridae). *Bioacoustics: The International Journal of Animal Sound and its Recording*, **12**, 236-238.
- Picciulin, M., Verginella, L., Spoto, M. & Ferrero, E. A. (2004). Colonial nesting and the importance of the brood size in male parasitic reproduction of the Mediterranean damselfish *Chromis chromis* (Pisces: Pomacentridae). *Environmental Biology of Fishes*,
- **70**, 23-30.
- Picciulin, M., Sebastianutto, L., Codarin, A., Farina, A. & Ferrero, E. A. (2010). In situ
- behavioural responses to boat noise exposure of *Gobius cruentatus* (Gmelin, 1789; fam.
- Gobiidae) and *Chromis chromis* (Linnaeus, 1758; fam. Pomacentridae) living in a Marine
- Protected Area. *Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology*, **386**, 125-132.
- Pruett-Jones, S. (1992). Independent versus nonindependent mate choice: do females copy each other? *The American Naturalist*, **140**, 1000-1009.
- Quignard, J. P. & Pras, A. (1986). Pomacentridae. In: *Fishes of the North-eastern Atlantic and Mediterranean*, Whitehead, P.J.P., Bauchot, M.L., Hureau, J.C., Nielsen, J. and Tottonese,
- E. (Editors), UNESCO, UK.
- Qvarnström, A. & Forsgren, E. (1998). Should females prefer dominant males? *Trends in Ecology and Evolution*, **13**, 498-501.
- Reichard, M., Smith, C. & Jordan, W. C. (2004). Genetic evidence reveals density-dependent mediated success of alternative mating behaviours in European bitterling (*Rhodeus sericeus*). *Molecular Ecology*, **13**, 1569-1578.
- Rios-Cardenas, O. & Webster, M.S. (2008). A molecular genetic examination of the mating
- system of pumpkinseed sunfish reveals high pay-offs for specialized sneakers. *Molecular Ecology*, 17, 2310–2320.
- Sefc, K. M., Mattersdorfer, K., Sturmbauer, C. & Koblmüller, S. (2008). High frequency of multiple paternity in broods of a socially monogamous cichlid fish with biparental nest defence. *Molecular Ecology*, **17**, 2531-2543.
- Soucy, S. & Travis, J. (2003). Multiple paternity and population genetic structure in natural populations of the poeciliid fish, *Heterandria formosa*. *Journal of Evolutionary Biology*, **16**, 1328-1336.
- Steinwender, B., Koblmüller, S. & Sefc, K.M. (2012). Concordant female mate preferences in
- the cichlid fish *Tropheus moorii*. *Hydrobiologia*, **682**, 121-130.
- Taborsky, M., Hudde, B. & Wirtz, P. (1987). Reproductive behaviour and ecology of
- *Symphodus (Crenilabrus) ocellatus*, a European wrasse with four types of male behaviour.

*Behaviour*, **102**: 82-117.

- Taborsky, M. (1994). Sneakers, satellites and helpers: parasitic and cooperative behaviour in fish reproduction. *Andvances in the Study of Behaviour*, **23**, 1-100.
- Taborsky, M. (2001). The evolution of bourgeois, parasitic, and cooperative reproductive behaviors in fishes. *Journal of Heredity*, **92**, 100–110.
- Taborsky, M., Oliveira, R. & Brockmann, H. J. (2008). The evolution of alternative
- reproductive tactics: concepts and questions. In R. F. Oliveira, M. Taborsky, & H. J.
- Brockmann (Eds.), *Alternative reproductive tactics* (pp. 1e22). Cambridge, U.K.:
- Cambridge University Press.
- Thiessen, R. J. & Heath, D. D. (2007). Characterization of one trinucleotide and six dinucleotide microsatellite markers in bicolor damselfish, *Stegastes partitus*, a common coral reef fish. *Conservation Genetics*, **8**, 983-985.
- Tyler, W.A. (1995). The adaptive significance of colonial nesting in a coral-reef fish. *Animal Behaviour*, **49**, 949-966.
- Underwood, J. N. (2009). Characterisation of ten polymorphic microsatellite loci in a coral reef fish (*Chromis margaritifer*). *Conservation Genetics Resources*, **1**, 491-493.
- Valière, N. (2002). GIMLET: a computer program for analysing genetic individual identification data. *Molecular Ecology Notes*, **2**, 377-379.
- Verginella, L., Spoto, M., Ciriaco, S. & Ferrero, E.A. (1999). Ethogram of the reproductive
- territorial male of the Mediterranean damselfish *Chromis chromis* L. (Pisces:
- Pomacentridae). *Bollettino della Societa' Adriatica di Scienze*, LXXVIII, 437-454.
- Waits, L. P., Luikart, G. & Taberlet, P. (2001). Estimating the probability of identity among
- genotypes in natural populations: cautions and guidelines. *Molecular Ecology*, **10**, 249- 256.
- Waples, R. S. & Do, C. (2008). LDNE: a program for estimating effective population size from
- data on linkage disequilibrium. *Molecular Ecology Resources*, **8**, 753-756.

620 Table I. Variables used to define relationships in alternative reproductive tactics and mating success of *Chromis chromis*. Variables include: 621 number of offspring analysed (N), number of parents (N<sub>P</sub>), number of sneakers (N<sub>SNK</sub>), number of males (N<sub>M</sub>), number of females (N<sub>F</sub>), proportion 622 of offspring sired by the nesting male (NM<sub>off</sub>), area of the egg clutch expressed in cm<sup>2</sup>, number of defence behaviour per hour and average density 623 of individuals at the time of sampling. Subscripts on the Nest category define sampling location; Z from Zingaro and P from Palermo.



625

626

627

628





- FIG. 1. Sampling localities (red circles) for *Chromis chromis* along the Sicilian coast. In the inset, a focal male is guarding an artificial nest
- FIG. 2. Median-joining network of mtDNA haplotypes of *Chromis chromis*. The size of each circle corresponds to the relative haplotype
- frequencies and black circles represent hypothetical intermediate haplotypes. Single mutational steps are assumed between haplotypes unless
- specified. Nests D, E, F, I, K are from Zingaro; nests A, B, C, G, H, J, L are from Palermo.
- 
- 643 FIG. 3. PCA variables factor map. Variables showed are: number of parents (N<sub>P</sub>), number of sneakers (N<sub>SNK</sub>), number of females (N<sub>F</sub>), proportion
- 644 of offspring sired by the nesting male (NM<sub>off</sub>), area of the egg clutch expressed in cm<sup>2</sup>, number of defence behaviour per hour and average density
- of individuals at the time of sampling.







